

THE UNIVERSITY of EDINBURGH

Edinburgh Research Explorer

The ‘talk o’ the toon’?

An examination of the Heart of Midlothian and Hibernian football rivalry in Edinburgh, Scotland

Citation for published version:
Kelly, J & Bairner, A 2018, 'The ‘talk o’ the toon’? An examination of the Heart of Midlothian and Hibernian football rivalry in Edinburgh, Scotland', *Soccer and Society*, vol. 19, no. 5-6, pp. 657-672. https://doi.org/10.1080/14660970.2017.1399610

Digital Object Identifier (DOI):
10.1080/14660970.2017.1399610

Link:
Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer

Document Version:
Peer reviewed version

Published In:
Soccer and Society

Publisher Rights Statement:
This is an Accepted Manuscript of an article published by Taylor & Francis in Soccer & Society on 10 November 2017, available online: http://wwww.tandfonline.com/10.1080/14660970.2017.1399610.

General rights
Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy
The University of Edinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact openaccess@ed.ac.uk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



Download date: 06. Nov. 2026

The 'talk o' the toon'? an examination of the Heart of Midlothian and Hibernian football rivalry in Edinburgh, Scotland.

John Kelly (Moray House School of Education, University of Edinburgh)

Alan Bairner (School of Sport, Exercise and Health Sciences, Loughborough University, UK)

It has been customary to think of the rivalry between Heart of Midlothian FC (Hearts) and Hibernian FC (Hibs) in Scotland's capital city as a less well-known and diluted imitation of the rivalry between Glasgow's so-called Old Firm of Celtic and Rangers with both rivalries being located within the context of sectarian identity politics. In fact, as argued in this article, the early history of the two Edinburgh clubs reveals a considerably closer association with sectarianism than is to be found in the initial years of the Old Firm. In support of this claim, evidence is drawn here from Hibs' exclusively Catholic origins and from Hearts' militaristic connections at the time of the First World War. On the other hand, as we further demonstrate, the contemporary rivalry between Hearts and Hibs owes less to religious and ethnic division than to spatial factors, or at the very least to the imagining of place, and to perceptions centred on the comparable images of the two clubs, both on and off the field of play, not least in relation to social class. With specific reference to place, while Hearts supporters are eager to celebrate their club as 'the talk o' the toon (town)', one is increasingly obliged to consider which Edinburgh imaginary is implied in their famous old song and also what Hibs supporters' celebration of the city's district of Leith tell us about the current rivalry. Furthermore, while the Hearts-Hibs rivalry has entered a post-sectarian phase, sectarian elements do remain a feature of both clubs although these tend to manifest themselves when they are in opposition to one or other of Glasgow's Old Firm clubs for specific political and ethnic reasons.

Keywords: Edinburgh; place; class; sectarianism

Introduction: the origins of the clubs

Heart of Midlothian

Heart of Midlothian Football Club (Hearts) and its rivals Hibernian Football Club (Hibs) are two of the largest and most prestigious football clubs in Scotland. Based in the Scottish capital of Edinburgh, the two clubs arguably have the largest support bases in Scotland outside of the Glasgow giants Rangers and Celtic.[1] Both clubs were formed within a short time of one another.

Hearts were formed in the autumn of 1873 with the club's first game occurring on December 27th 1873.[2] The official website suggests that Heart of Midlothian took its name from a local dance hall named after Walter Scott's 1818 novel and frequented by the club's founders. Hearts joined the Scottish league in 1875 and quickly established itself as a major club, winning its first trophy in 1878 against its eventual rivals Hibs in the final of the Edinburgh FA Cup. The club ended up at its present home in the west of the city in 1886 after a couple of previous moves and named the stadium Tynecastle in honour of the area in which the ground is located.[3]

In addition to having strong links to the city of Edinburgh and its suburban location of Tynecastle (and neighbouring Gorgie), Hearts have historic connections to the 16th Royal Scots British Army battalion, which became known as 'McCrae's Battalion' in honour of their commanding officer Sir George McCrae.[4] McCrae's – the sports battalion as it became known - already had an existing football heritage, being formed out of the remnants of the 3rd Edinburgh Rifle Volunteers (3rd ERV) whose football team became the first Edinburgh club in 1874. John Hope, a Protestant who campaigned in favour of temperance and anti-Catholicism, led the instantly successful 3rd ERV club whose membership was confined to 'good standing' members of the corps.[5] Finn further suggests good standing was a

euphemism for Protestants 'defined by dual commitment to No-Popery and abstention'.[6] On November 25th 1914, during the initial stages of the First World War, when joining up for active service was still voluntary, after a certain amount of pleading from the Hearts board of directors to 'remove the slur on the professional game',[7] eleven Hearts players enlisted in McCrae's Battalion. Indeed, the newspapers of the time carried the following appeal which perhaps allows one to imagine the hegemonic pressures of the day:

> 'I say to the young men in this ancient capital and free country: *You are Strong; Be Willing*! … If only you will come forward in sufficient numbers you can stop the war. All cannot go, but if your home ties permit, and you shirk your obvious duty, you may escape a hero's death, but you will go through your life feeling mean'.[8]

McCrae's Battalion suffered heavy casualties resulting in seven Hearts players dying from war wounds and becoming immortalised in the consciousness of Hearts and its supporters. Hearts maintain the historical connection between the club and McCrae's, having erected a war memorial to the "Heart of Midlothian fallen" in the city centre (with supporters' contributions). More recently, the club unveiled a memorial garden to remember the players and fans who died in the war.[9]

Hibernian

Hibs originated in 1875 when members of the Catholic Young Men's Society (CYMS), under the chairmanship of Irish-born Canon Hannan,[10] formed a club for the immigrant Irish-Catholic community that had become a significant section of Edinburgh's population. Upon arriving in Edinburgh, the Irish-Catholics settled mainly in the slums of the Cowgate area of the Old Town, and gradually developed their own 'Little Ireland' becoming, as Lugton[11] suggests, 'Hibernicis ipsis Hiberniores,[12] more Irish than the Irish'. Little Ireland and the Edinburgh Port of Leith (to the north east of the city) rapidly became associated with the Irish

migrants. By the mid-nineteenth century 30% of the Old Town population was Irish-born, with 25,000 in Little Ireland alone.[13] Hibs' formation was unequivocally connected to Irish nationalism and Catholicism and they became the first prominent "Irish club" in Scotland. The club's original secretary drew up the rules of the new club in a document carrying the Harp and motto 'Erin-go-bragh' (Irish Gaelic for Ireland forever).[14] Hibernian was chosen as the club name in honour of the 'Ancient Order of the Hibernians' which had been absorbed into the CYMS. Initially its players had to be practising Catholics.[15] An example of the club's connections to Irish nationalism right into the 20th century included organising a charitable match during the Irish War of Independence (1919-1921) to raise funds for Catholics in Belfast.[16]

Lingering sectarian identities

A significant feature of a high number of interviews conducted with fans of the two Edinburgh clubs[17] (particularly the unstructured ones) was the determination shown by Hibs and Hearts supporters to emphasise that they are not sectarian. This was often evident in the respondents' body language and facial responses when they appeared uncomfortable, suspicious and even defensive when first introducing (or being introduced to) questions relating to religion and Irish issues. This is possibly connected to the current anti-sectarian drive in Scotland that has gathered momentum in the last ten years, with three summits, the Offensive Behaviour at Football Bill which was implemented in 2012, and numerous high-profile debates and discussions around sectarianism. Being sectarian in Scotland continues to be viewed in media and political discourse as deviant and to evoke controversy when discussed in football environments.[18] This has regularly resulted in a marked determination by respondents to explicitly oppose sectarianism. For example, according to one interviewee, speaking we can only assume without a trace of irony:

> 'Both Hearts and Hibs hate sectarianism. We see that as a Glasgow problem. At Hearts, I've not seen anything more provocative than a union jack. You get the occasional badges with the red hand of Ulster but to me that's more of a personal thing than a football thing. We want to avoid all that' (Andy 19, years).

In similar vein, the antipathy shown towards the Old Firm is such that some Hearts and Hibs fans even display an intra-city camaraderie preferring their major city rival to beat either of the Old Firm clubs when their rival plays one of the big Glasgow teams.

While sections of the support attached to Hearts and Hibs indulge in 'managing a front' according to audience segregation[19] - becoming more or less British-Protestant (Hearts) or Irish-Catholic (Hibs) depending upon the opposition - it appears that, for both clubs, a Scottish identity is emerging as the primary national identification among their respective supporters. This is not to deny that within the 'spaces of sport'[20] occupied by Hibs and Hearts in their respective locations of east and west Edinburgh, there are pockets of British Protestant-unionist supporters among the Hearts following or that, for some Hibs fans, forms of Irishness or Catholicism remain significant. However, the apparent overriding concern for supporters of both clubs seems to be to distance themselves from the "sectarian Old Firm" while reinforcing a Scottish identity.

Given the origins of the two clubs, however, it is hardly surprising that their rivalry has long constituted sectarian elements and it is perhaps inevitable that there continues to be a lingering perception of the Hearts and Hibs rivalry as an east-coast, "Edinburgh Old Firm" with sectarian identities colliding. In the last decade or two, small sections of Hearts supporters have continued to demonstrate their associations to British unionism by wearing scarves and t-shirts decorated with Ulster Loyalist images and Union flags to matches,[21] singing the racist "Famine Song"[22] and aligning themselves with the British National Party.[23] There has also been a small number of high profile incidents in recent years when Scottish

clubs with Irish-Catholic heritage (Celtic and Hibernian) play Hearts.[24] In April 2005, at Hampden Park, the Scotland national stadium, a minute's silence for the death of Pope John Paul II was disrupted by Hearts supporters to such an extent that it was cut short by more than a half.[25] This was followed by a mixed reaction among Hearts supporters' spokespeople, with some refusing to condemn the supporters' actions.[26] These incidents led to media attention from around the world and bolstered the perception at least of Hearts supporters exhibiting sectarianism.[27] The Hearts supporters are also known for singing "the Gorgie Boys" with the lyrics 'we're up to our knees in Fenian blood'. Although without adequate investigation, it is unwise to ascribe definite motives for these acts, it is reasonable to consider the possibility that they are linked to sectarianism, particularly issues surrounding unionist, loyalist, Protestant and British identity markers.

With regards to Hibs, the extent to which this club represents Catholic Irish-Scots in modern Scotland is unclear. While it is true that the club has officially sought to move beyond its Catholic and Irish heritage – a practice that gained momentum in the 1950s and 1960s during the chairmanship of Hibs' first non-Catholic shareholder and chairman freemason Harry Swan,[28] who considered changing the club name and colours and removed the Irish Harp logo from the entrance at Easter Road (during building works), the club's modern home. [29] – there have been claims by some that some supporters of Hibs (as well as Hearts) still use sectarian songs and symbols in order to construct an imagined identity.[30] Despite lingering sectarian elements to the rivalry, however, the Edinburgh derby has additional key features that may not be so well known beyond the confines of Edinburgh and/or Scotland and it is to these that we now turn.

Style, class and place

Having arrived in Edinburgh in the late 1960s, one of the authors began to watch Hibs intermittently. After telling his landlord about a recent visit to Hibs' Easter Road stadium, he was asked, 'Why aren't you watching Edina's[31] Darlings instead'? His education in the rivalry between Hibs and Hearts entered a new phase.

Having seen in the previous section of the article how the image of the two clubs in relation to the politics of identity has evolved over the years**,** an additional set of less well-known factors further serve to differentiate them. This section of our discussion addresses the playing styles and general image of the two football clubs, the influence of social class and, in particular, the significance of place. With reference to each of these considerations, we are dealing as much with the imagined as with the real.

Style

The first of these factors consists of the playing styles and general image of the two clubs. Hearts have tended to be regarded by the Scottish football public as "dour" (an old Scottish word meaning "severe, stern, or gloomy") but relatively efficient, perhaps reflecting their historic connections with Presbyterianism, Scotland's unique contribution to the Reformation. Hibs, on the other hand, are seen, not least by their own fans, as far more committed to the aesthetics of the beautiful game than to simply winning- Cavaliers in contrast to Hearts as Roundheads. The accumulated "evidence" for the latter argument includes the names of the Famous Five - a post Second World War Hibs forward line consisting of Gordon Smith, Bobby Johnstone, Lawrie Reilly, Eddie Turnbull and Willie Ormond, all of them capped by Scotland with 89 caps between them.[32] They were followed in the early1970s by another much praised set of forwards consisting of Alec Edwards, Jimmy O'Rourke, Alan Gordon,

Alec Cropley and Arthur Duncan, not to mention two other players, Peter Cormack and Peter Marinello, who had only recently left the club to play in England.

Hearts most celebrated player, on the other hand, is arguably the barrel-chested wing half, Dave Mackay, who played for the club in the 1950s when it won all three Scottish domestic trophies with Mackay captaining the team to League Championship success in 1957-8. He subsequently played for Tottenham Hotspur's double-winning side of 1960-1 but is perhaps best remembered by older Scottish football fans for grabbing Leeds United's Scottish captain, Billy Bremner, by the shirt and almost lifting him off his feet in an altercation during a match at White Hart Lane in 1966. Mackay was a hard man and that for many summed up the playing style of Hearts. The reality is, however, that Hearts too had their aesthetically pleasing players, amongst them the same Gordon Smith who played in Hibs' Famous Five frontline. Having represented Hibs when they won the Scottish League in 1948, 1951 and 1952, Smith moved to Hearts in 1959 and helped his new club win the league in his first season. He subsequently played for Dundee's championship-winning side of 1962, thereby achieving the remarkable record of winning Scottish League championship medals with three different clubs without having played for either Celtic or Rangers. In addition to Smith, Hearts also had its "Terrible Trio" – Alfie Conn, Willie Bauld and Jimmy Wardhaugh – who were prolific goal scorers in the same 1950s team as Dave Mackay.

Another criterion used by some to judge the style of the two clubs is that of celebrity supporters. Once again conventional wisdom tells us that Hibs are cooler than Hearts and here the evidence is rather more compelling. Amongst their famous fans, Hibs can call upon novelist Irvine Welsh, actor Dougray Scott, tennis player Andy Murray, Shirley Manson, lead singer with Goodbye Mr. Mackenzie and, more famously, Garbage, former professional footballer and broadcaster Pat Nevin, and brothers Charlie and Craig Reid, the Proclaimers, more about whom in due course. Furthermore, as Aidan Smith,[33] a Hibs supporter who spent

a year following Hearts, recalls, ‘many of my dad’s friends and associates were bohemian types, painters, poets, musicians, and most were Hibs fans’. Hearts, on the other hand, have former Scottish First Minister, Alex Salmond, cyclist Chris Hoy and snooker player, Stephen Hendry, solid citizens one and all but arguably lacking the élan of their Hibs counterparts. And then there was the late Ronnie Corbett who, despite a highly successful career in British television comedy manifested most, if not all, of the traits and aspirations of the Edinburgh bourgeoisie – OBE, CBE, cricket fan, golfer and unionist.

Social Class

According to Hearts historian, David Speed, while Hearts fans willingly accept their role as part of the established elite, their rivals see this as a negative. Lloyd Quinnan told Speed that, for him:

> ‘The real difference is that Hearts are the team of the rich …That's what I have grown up with, crystallized for us by the fact that the posh boys from George Watson's [a leading Edinburgh private school] wore maroon and white school scarves, so they didn't have to buy another one when they went to Tynecastle on a Saturday’.[34]

Speed accepts that the board of Hearts has always consisted of those who were very close to organisations such as the Chamber of Commerce and the City Council, which up until the mid-1980s was always Conservative (and Unionist). Looking back over the history of the Hearts board of directors compared with that of Hibs, Hearts was very much, until the 1980s, the domain of successful businessmen, lawyers and people who were brought in from major companies including banks. During the 1950s and 1960s, the Honorary President of Hearts was the Earl of Roseberry. Meanwhile those who traditionally ran Hibs were more likely to be small businessmen, including bookmakers and owners of building firms.

According to Aidan Smith,[35] Hibs 'are the team of the outsider and the hopeless dreamer, the incurable romantic'. Fellow Hibs supporters give their impressions of Hearts fans:

> I think of most Hearts fans as being drapers (Martin)
>
> Hearts fans all live in bungalows in Corstorphine and Davidson's Mains [both perceived to be middle-class suburbs of Edinburgh]; they have funny wee Jambo[36] moustaches and they really are a bunch of bloody boring bastards (Simon)
>
> Quite a lot of them will be old-school, working-class Tories [Conservatives] (David)[37]

None of these supporter accounts are accompanied by any evidence of course. Once again we are in the world of mythmaking and the imaginary or, perhaps what Davis refers to as 'hegemonic fandom' consisting of 'petty or cultivated hostilities'[38] towards football rivals. The references to Corstorphine and Davidson's Mains, predominantly middle-class suburbs in the west of the city, are telling as is the absence of any reference to Saughton, Broomhouse or Wester Hailes which are far from being middle-class residential areas in west Edinburgh but are also home to many Hearts supporters.

A major contributor to the social construction of the contemporary image of the Hibs supporter is Irvine Welsh, most of whose leading characters, particularly in his best known novel *Trainspotting*, follow the team. According to Hemingway,[39] 'one notable achievement of *Trainspotting* is that it makes legible a deep and contextually "thick" version of the city … as a document of "reality"'. But is Welsh's version of Edinburgh and, more specifically, one particular district of the city, any more real than countless others?

Place

"Space and place", according to Tuan,[40] 'are basic components of the lived world; we take them for granted'. That said, space is only natural in part for, as Lefebvre[41] observes, 'social space contains a great diversity of objects, both natural and social, including the networks and pathways which facilitate the exchange of material things and information.' Furthermore, 'vis-à-vis lived experience, space is neither a mere "frame", after the fashion of the frame of a painting, nor a form or container of a virtually neutral kind, designed simply to receive whatever is poured into it'.[42]

It is in this sense, for example, that 'the city is a place, a center of meaning, par excellence'[43] – a symbol in itself and also the location of numerous highly visible symbols. Not surprisingly, therefore, social spaces such as cities are hugely important in the construction and reproduction of memories and identities. In addition, within those social spaces, sporting sites *and* sights perform an important role in identity formation and consolidation not least as repositories of collective memories.[44] The analysis of social space, Lefebvre[45] argues,

> 'involves levels, layers and sedimentations of perception, representation, and spatial practice which presuppose one another, which proffer themselves to one another, and which are superimposed upon one another'.

As Bale and Vertinsky observe, 'the significance of space and place as central dimensions of sport is well recognized by scholars who have addressed questions of sport from philosophical, sociological, geographical and historical perspectives.'[46] More specifically, sports grounds, and the districts of cities in which they are located, are always emotive places, in large part because of the ebb and flow of sporting events themselves. However, there may also be evidence of emotional responses to particular landscapes.

Whilst competing (perhaps opposing) national identities remain part of the fabric of the

Edinburgh clubs' sense of self (particularly in relation to others), a local geographical habitus emerges in the conceptualisation of the two clubs as expressed by most fans with the importance of Edinburgh (Hearts) and Leith (Hibs) being identified as significant. One Hearts fans explained that the rivalry with Hibs was based largely on coming from 'different sides of Edinburgh, with the outskirts and west of Edinburgh tending to be populated by Hearts fans while Hibs fans largely reside in the east of the city.'[47] Another Hearts fan added, 'Hearts are as big a part of the city as the castle. When I was growing up it always seemed to me that Hearts were Edinburgh's team. Even the colours of the buses were maroon.'[48] In the 1950s and early 1960s, the music at Tynecastle was provided by the City of Edinburgh Band whereas Hibs relied on gramophone records provided by Bandparts, a local shop, on Leith Walk, which leads from Leith itself to the east end of Edinburgh city centre.

Just as Hearts fans view Edinburgh as central to their sense of club identity, a number of Hibs fans also view their modern identity and rivalry with Hearts in geographical, rather than religious or ethnic, terms. Representing a common position, one Hibs fan noted:

> 'Leith is seen as having a separate identity from Edinburgh … and people from Leith regard themselves as sort … of separate, as totally separate from Edinburgh. "Leithers" is what everybody's called. So Hibs play in Leith now and I think it is important that if ye' ever move the club from this area of Edinburgh, I think the club would die pretty rapidly'.[49]

Another Hibs fan summed up the duality of Leith and Edinburgh observing:

> 'It's another part of the Hibs dual identity … is that they are seen as this big Leith club and they are in many ways. Yet they come from the Cowgate and their traditional support was always from the Southside of Edinburgh which was where the Irish immigrant population lived'.[50]

However, although cursory analysis of some fans' comments suggest spatially focused identities, on closer inspection the geographical habitus occasionally incorporates ethno-religious dimensions which intersect the geographical identities expressed

in relation to the two clubs. For example, one Hearts fan stressed:

> 'For me it [Hearts] was the club that identified with Edinburgh whereas Hibs were in Leith … oh they're from Leith … so as far as I'm concerned Hearts is Edinburgh's club. Hibs came later. I dunno, maybe it's the Irish connection with Hibs and the roots they came fae' [from] and everything else. I mean Hearts were formed in Edinburgh, Edinburgh people and it's a bit of that I think'.[51]

The obvious implication here is that Hearts and its supporters are seen by this fan as the established group while Hibs and its supporters are seen as outsiders as a result of 'coming from Leith', 'having an Irish connection', and 'not being formed in Edinburgh' for Edinburgh people.

According to David Speed:

> 'There is a big family tradition at Tynecastle. Hearts supporters regard it as "Edinburgh's club", "Edina's darlings". I notice that Hibs have put Edinburgh on their badge because they struggle for identity, as far as I am concerned, as an Edinburgh club. We consider ourselves to be the city's club. When they put Edinburgh on their badge, I thought, 'well, that's a wee bit petty.' I'll come right to the point here, we consider ourselves the superior club and it's supported by the fact that we have won more honours'.

In fact Hearts even went on an unbeaten run of 22 derby matches beginning in the late 1980s. 'So we do consider ourselves to be a wee bit special', continues Speed. 'We do see the Hearts as a cut above the rest. I can imagine every Hibs fan cringing at me saying that, but that's how we feel. We are Edinburgh's club and the number one club in the city'.[52]

Hearts have always been happy to identify symbolically with Edinburgh, for example by having an image of the Scott Monument and, in the background, Calton Hill, both prominent Edinburgh landmarks, on the cover of the club's official match programme during the 1960s. On the other hand, symbolism of this type has tended to be a contentious issue for Hibs supporters. The match programme for a game played on 23rd December 1961 featured an image of Edinburgh Castle and the words 'A Merry Christmas'. More significantly, however,

the club's badge has changed frequently over the years, reflecting an ongoing debate about the club's identity. This debate has centred on whether its Irish heritage should be proudly displayed or made inconspicuous for fear of accusations of sectarianism. The Irish harp was first removed in the 1950s and then re-introduced to the club badge when it was last re-designed in 2000. The following year, Scottish Football Museum director Ged O'Brien said that the current design shows that Hibs 'are comfortable with all the strands of their tradition – it has Leith, Edinburgh and Ireland in it'.[53] The result is the harp for Ireland, the castle for Edinburgh and a sailing ship for Leith. However, it is Leith that appears to have overtaken the other two in terms of Hibernian's contemporary identity.

The songs most closely associated with the two clubs highlight the significance of place in relation to their respective identities and shared rivalry. Originally written and performed by the late Scottish comedian and actor Hector Nicol, who also recorded a tribute to Hibs, 'Hearts, Hearts, Glorious Hearts' is emphatically dedicated to an Edinburgh football club referring as it does to the club's home ground and neighbourhood, to "Auld Reekie", the historic nickname for the city, and to the team being "the talk of the toon", namely Edinburgh.

> 'Hearts, Hearts, Glorious Hearts, It's down at Tynecastle they bide [stay]
> The talk o'the toon are the boys in maroon and auld reekie supports them with pride'.

In recent years, however, as songs referring to Ireland have become less prominent among Hibs supporters, the latter fans have adopted the Proclaimers' paean to Leith which makes no direct reference to football in general or to Hibs in particular and concludes:

> 'While the Chief, puts sunshine on Leith
> I'll thank Him for His work
> And your birth and my birth'.

In these ways, the two clubs are imagined by their fans - one an Edinburgh club, the other a Leith club. As with perceptions of style and social class, however, the accuracy of these representations is open to scrutiny.

Hearts first moved to Tynecastle, just west of Edinburgh city centre, in 1881. In 1886, with the city continuing to expand, tenements replaced the old ground and Hearts moved across Gorgie Road to the present site which was leased from Edinburgh Corporation. Implicit in the name "Edina's Darlings" is the proposition that the club's support comes from throughout the city. However, the parliamentary constituencies that account for the majority of Hearts support are Edinburgh West, Edinburgh South West and Edinburgh South.

Hibs draw a considerable amount of their support from two other Edinburgh constituencies – Edinburgh North and Leith and Edinburgh East. As implied by the name, the latter covers an eastern portion of the city of Edinburgh, although it extends well into the city centre. The constituency is predominantly urban and is almost certainly home to as many Hibs fans as its neighbour. Yet it is Leith that is most commonly associated today with the football club.

Historically part of Midlothian, Leith is sited on the coast of the Firth of Forth and lies within the council area of the City of Edinburgh. The medieval settlements of Leith had grown into a burgh by 1833. Continued growth meant that Leith and Edinburgh formed a contiguous urban area and Leith was merged with Edinburgh in 1920 despite a plebiscite in which the people of Leith voted 26,810 to 4,340 against the merger. The parliamentary constituency which includes the name of Leith is Edinburgh North and Leith, created in 1997, which largely a replaced the former Edinburgh Leith constituency.

This constituency is also urban and covers several northern communities of the city, as well as most of the former burgh of Leith. It has the highest proportion of residents living in tenements and flats of any parliamentary constituency in the United Kingdom, but also has a high relative proportion of university graduates. It includes a mix of leafy, expensive residential areas in the South and West of the constituency and densely populated areas nearer Leith with more young professionals and students, as well as older residents whose families have lived there during several previous generations. It also includes the famous Edinburgh landmark Calton Hill, the shops and offices on the northern side of Princes Street, Bute House, the official residence of the First Minister of Scotland, the Royal Botanical Gardens, and the private schools of Fettes College, the Edinburgh Academy, The Mary Erskine School and Stewart's Melville College. The image of an exclusively working-class community, as portrayed in much of Irvine Welsh's work, is not borne out by the facts.

So why does Leith figure so prominently in the Hibs imaginary? Easter Road, the home of Hibernian Football Club, is the name of a major thoroughfare. Until the creation of Leith Walk in the middle of the 17th century, it was one of the two main routes from Leith to Edinburgh. Historic personages who have ridden up Easter Road have included Mary, Queen of Scots (1561) and Oliver Cromwell (from Leith Links in 1650). Hibs first moved to the Easter Road area in 1880 to a ground known as Hibernian Park. This location had the advantage of being equidistant between their two main sources of support, the Irish immigrant communities in the Port of Leith and the Old Town of Edinburgh. When the club suffered financial difficulties in the early 1890s, the lease on Hibernian Park expired and developers started building what would become Bothwell Street. The club was reformed in 1892 and a lease on a piece of land called Drum Park was secured. The site had restricted access from Easter Road, a pronounced slope and was in close proximity to Bank Park, the home of another Scottish League club, Leith Athletic. The first match at Easter Road was

played on February 4th 1893, a friendly against Clyde. The long-term future of Easter Road was only secured in 1922, when the club agreed a 25-year lease on the ground. A record attendance of 65,860 was set by an Edinburgh derby against Hearts played on January 2nd 1950.

Today most of the area comprises tenement housing built for the artisan and working classes in the second half of the 19th century. New housing has also appeared since the 1970s in several locations on and just off Easter Road. Whilst there can be no doubt about Easter Road's connections with Leith, there has to be a question mark about whether it can be described as being part of Leith or not. If the answer is no, then do Hibs belong to Leith in any meaningful sense?

The Proclaimers and Irvine Welsh have been influential in this respect and commentators on Welsh's work have been more than willing to perpetuate a binary distinction between Edinburgh and Leith with the latter being presented as having been colonized by the former,[54] thereby transforming Leithers into 'the wretched of the earth'.[55] There is no doubt that 'Welsh's characters have an influential role in the portrayal of the city'.[56] The danger is, however, that a false binary emerges through the construction of two distinct places. Edinburgh is more complex than that.

The Welsh approach might seem like an elaboration on one of the most celebrated attempts to conceptualise the importance of dualism in Scottish political and cultural life - Gregory Smith's idea of 'the Caledonian antisyzygy'. According to Smith:[57]

> 'perhaps in the very combination of opposites – what either of the two St Thomases, of Norwich and Cromarty, might have been willing to call 'the Caledonian antisyzygy' – we have a reflection of the contrasts which the Scot shows at every turn, in his (sic) political and ecclesiastical history, in his polemical restlessness, in his adaptability, which is another way of saying that he has made allowance for new conditions, in his

> practical judgement, which is his admission that two sides of the matter have been considered'.

Amongst many others, novelist Ian Rankin[58] has argued that the Edinburgh literati have consistently portrayed Edinburgh as 'a schizophrenic city, the place of Jekyll and Hyde'. The point about Stevenson's Jekyll and Hyde, however, is that they are one and the same man just as Leith, the ultra-bourgeois New Town and the tourist attractions of the Old Town are one and the same city. Poor families live only a stone's throw from the Scottish Parliament and the Palace of Holyrood House while the gentrification of Leith has resulted in spiralling property prices. For the supporters of Hearts and Hibs, the binary has its uses, especially for the latter. But its value in allowing us to read the city is limited.

In fact, it is Leith Athletic Football Club that carries the ancient burgh's name. Today the club is a member of the East of Scotland Football League. First team matches are played at Meadowbank 3G, an artificial pitch which is part of the Meadowbank Stadium complex. The present club considers itself to be a continuation of the original Leith Athletic F.C., which was founded in 1887and played in the Scottish Football League during four different spells between 1897 and 1953. It went out of business in 1955. The name was revived at local youth level in 1996 and, in 2008, Leith Athletic returned to senior football when they amalgamated with Edinburgh Athletic subsequently taking the latter's place in the East of Scotland League.

It is likely that supporting Hibs as opposed to Hearts, does bring with it a somewhat more bohemian image. However, the Hearts support is less middle-class than some might imagine just as support for Hibs is less proletarian than popular mythmaking, and Irvine Welsh, might suggest. The most interesting factor in the contemporary differentiation of the two clubs is, therefore, the relationship with place. Hearts supporters come from various parts of Edinburgh and beyond. So too do Hibs supporters. The clubs' imagined communities,

however, are Edinburgh (Hearts) and Leith (Hibs) even though a full understanding of the clubs' rivalry demands a more nuanced approach.

21st century rivals

While there remain very occasional signifiers of sectarianism visible in the rivalry between both clubs in the twenty first century, the central elements of the rivalry are almost absent of sectarian intent. Two important points are worth noting that contextualize the current status of the rivalry. First, it could be argued that the Edinburgh derby is more intense in this post-sectarian period than it ever was. This, we argue, is largely due to the ill-feeling that the failed takeover bid in 1991 continues to evoke. This involved Hearts attempting to take Hibs over while presenting it as a merger. The event planted the seeds of discontent among the Hibs supporters to such an extent that it remains one of the most divisive elements in the history of the rivalry.[59] Second, while it is fair to assert the Hearts-Hibs rivalry has entered a post-sectarian phase, sectarian elements do remain albeit most visibly in the context of the Edinburgh clubs' respective rivalries with one or other half of the Glasgow Old Firm clubs, Celtic and Rangers, rather than with each other, revealing a sectarian fault line running through both Edinburgh clubs. We conclude this section with a short discussion of the 2016 Scottish Cup Final between Hibs and Rangers and the post-match pitch invasion and supporter violence, followed by an explanation of the Hearts and Celtic rivalry in relation to an increase in British military-inspired remembrance activities. Each brief discussion reveals subtle and dormant sectarian-related fault lines that continue to exist; but significantly, they exist only in relation to a rivalry with one of the Glasgow clubs rather than with one another.

In 2016, Hibs won its first Scottish Cup since 1902, marking one of the club's most significant wins in its entire history. The final whistle resulted in a pitch invasion by Hibs

supporters who ran towards the Rangers end of the stadium to celebrate. Rangers supporters then also entered the field and a number of hand to hand fights broke out among rival supporters. It may be argued that this was merely an explosion of pent up relief that a success starved club's supporters felt after such a monumental wait to win the country's most prestigious cup competition (and an opposition support's response). But it would be naïve to overlook the sectarian identities attached to the clubs involved – for example, there was explicit waving of Irish tricolours by Hibs supporters near the Rangers supporters on the field of play.

Meanwhile, one of the most explosive football fixtures in British football in recent years has been the Hearts-Celtic fixture which has witnessed Celtic manager Neil Lennon being attacked and assaulted by a Hearts supporter[60] and increasingly vociferous political singing from the Celtic supporters in support of Irish nationalism. There has also been growing tension around banners and songs relating to British colonialism in Ireland and the Earl Haig poppy,[61] exposing the sensitivities some Hearts and Celtic supporters continue to have in relation to the British army and the British establishment's construction of service to country, loyalty, sacrifice, and remembrance. It is clear that this rivalry was inflamed in the aftermath of some Celtic supporters unfurling a banner rejecting this establishment version of remembrance in 2010.[62] One of the authors attended the first Hearts v Celtic fixture after this particular display and, in an atmosphere that was amongst the most poisonous he has ever witnessed, the Hearts supporters displayed numerous British military related flags resulting in both sets of supporters claiming offense and insult.

Thus, although there is evidence of a strong geographical identification for the two Edinburgh football clubs at both a city and more localised level,[63] equally significant factors emerge in

relation to their club identity and the notion of "the other" which inform our understanding of the nuances surrounding sporting identification in Scotland. The main two interlinked factors to transpire from a study of Hearts and Hibs in terms of "club identity" arguably involve, first, the supporters' expression of an identity which is situational and highly dependent upon the opposition and its perceived identity and, second, a common disdain for the Old Firm. As a consequence, some Hibs supporters exaggerate their Irishness against the unionist "others" of Rangers and Hearts, and exaggerate their Scottishness against the Irish-Catholic "other" Celtic, while some Hearts supporters exaggerate their Scottishness against Rangers and their Britishness against Celtic.

Conclusion

The early history of the two Edinburgh clubs reveals a closer association with sectarianism than is to be found in the initial years of the Old Firm. There have been clear "sectarian" elements associated with Hibs and clear British and unionist signifiers visible in relation to Hearts. Yet much of the intra-Edinburgh rivalry between Hibs and Hearts transcends sectarianism, revealing more nuanced points of difference. Style and sense of place have underpinned the rivalry for much of the latter part of the 20th century revealing subtle class-based distinctions between supporters of both clubs, who each claim and seek a club-specific sense of authenticity among their respective supporters and the wider Edinburgh and Leith public. While this rivalry has largely entered a post-sectarian epoch, there remain sporadic signifiers of sectarianism; but these tend to emerge or be pronounced in relation to their respective rivalries with their "sectarian" opposites from Glasgow's Old Firm duo of Celtic and Rangers.

Disclosure statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the authors.

Notes

[1] Aberdeen FC may lay claim to this honour in more recent times. However, over the course of the whole history of Scottish football, both the Edinburgh clubs merit this description.
[2] Mackie, *The Hearts*; Alexander, *McCrae's Battalion.*
[3] ibid
[4] Alexander, *McCrae's Battalion.*
[5] Finn, "Faith, Hope and Bigotry".
[6] Finn, "Faith, Hope and Bigotry", 98.
[7] Alexander, *McCrae's Battalion,* 74.
[8] cited in Alexander, *McCrae's Battalion,* 76 (original emphasis).
[9] http://heartsmemorialgarden.co.uk (accessed October 1, 2016).
[10] Finn, "Faith, Hope and Bigotry*"*; Lugton, *The Making of Hibernian*.
[11] Lugton, *The Making of Hibernian*.
[12] Ibid, 18. It is often written elsewhere as 'Hiberniores Hibernis ipsis'.
[13] Burrowes, *Irish.*
[14] Mackay, *The Hibees.*
[15] Lugton, *The Making of Hibernian vol 1*.
[16] Lugton, *The Making of Hibernian, vol 3,* 64.
[17] These include interviews conducted for Kelly, "Flower of Scotland?" dissertation and more recent ones conducted between 2008 to the present day.
[18] Flint and Kelly, *Bigotry, Football and Scotland.*
[19] Goffman, *The Presentation of Self.*
[20] Bourdieu, *Distinction.*
[21] Kelly, fieldwork.
[22] Ibid. The so-called Famine Song is a song sung by some Rangers and Hearts supporters asking Scots of Irish descent 'the famine's over, why don't you go home?' It has been branded criminal and racist in a Scottish court. But some of those who defend it claim it is banter, mocking rival football supporters as "plastic paddies".
[23] Jardine, "Fans Banned", www.soccernet.co.uk, January 4, 2002.
[24] In October, 2006, 17 rival supporters were arrested for disturbances following a Hibs v Hearts derby. Additionally, on November 4th 2006, in the immediate aftermath of a Celtic v Hearts fixture, the official Hearts website referred to Celtic's support as "gypsies". The person responsible – Iain Gibson, a Conservative party press officer – later apologised.
[25] Stow, "Hearts Fans' Leaders Refuse to Slam Jeers", Evening News, April 11, 2005.
[26] Ibid.
[27] Inness, "Football Bigots", The Scotsman April 14, 2005.
[28] Harry Swan is a pivotal figure in Hibs' history and elicits contrasting opinions about his intentions. Lugton, *The Making of Hibernian 3,* 184 informs readers that Swan was accommodating and friendly towards Catholic clergy, even appointing one to be the "Players' Counsellor". He was also the Scottish Football Association acting president in 1952 when the SFA ordered Celtic to remove the Irish tricolour flag from their ground in what became known as the "flag affair".
[29] This was confirmed during personal communication with Hibs historian Tom Wright. With regard to the proposed name and colours change, Wright concedes although "there is no tangible evidence", he highlights a taped interview in his possession involving Docherty and Thompson, co-writers of A Hundred Years of Hibs, in which it is "categorically" stated that discussions definitely took place probably around the 1940s, with red and white being the preferred colours of the new strip. Also see MacKay, *The Hibbes*, 120.
[30] See Kowalski, "Cry for us Argentina"; Hognestad, "The Jambo Experience".
[31] Edina is a poetic name for Scotland's capital city.
[32] In those days, there were fewer international fixtures to secure a cap than there is today, making the total caps even more impressive.
[33] Smith, *Heartfelt,* 17.
[34] http://www.hmfckickback.co.uk (accessed November 24, 2008).
[35] Smith, *Heartfelt*, 18.
[36] Jambo is a nickname used (by Hearts supporters and others) to describe Hearts supporters
[37] Ibid.

[38] Davis, "Hegemic Fandom", 115.

[39] Hemingway, "Contested Cultural Spaces, 330.
[40] Tuan, *Space and Place,* 3.
[41] Lefebvre, *The Production of Space,* 77.
[42] Ibid, 93-94
[43] Tuan, *Space and Place*, 173.
[44] Bale and Vertinsky, "Introduction".
[45] Lefebvre, *The Producton of Space,* 226.
[46] Bale and Vertinsky, "Introduction", 1.
[47] Quoted in Kelly, "Flowers of Scotland?".
[48] Ibid.
[49] Ibid.
[50] Ibid.
[51] Ibid.
[52] http://www.hmfckickback.co.uk (accessed November 24, 2008).

[53] Hanna, "Whose grass-roots are greener?" *The Scotsman*, May 20, 2001.

[54] Farred, "Wankerdom; Jeffers, "Rhizome National Identity"; Macleod, "Life Among the Leith Plebs".
[55] Fanon, *The Wretched of the Earth*.
[56] McKeown, "The Image of the City in Urban Literature", 113.
[57] Smith, *Scottish Literature.*
[58] Rankin, *Knots and Crosses*, 193.
[59] The significance of this event is such that the current media room at Hibs' stadium is decorated with press cuttings of the club's actions opposing the takeover and of its immediate aftermath.
[60] John Wilson was found guilty of breach of the peace rather than assault but footage clearly shows that he attacked Neil Lennon.
[61] Many Celtic fans interpret the Earl Haig poppy to represent British military personnel and their actions rather than as a mere symbol of sorrowful remembrance of victims of conflict. Many Hearts fans interpret this position as unpatriotic and unsympathetic to values they hold dear, not least as a result of the history of Hearts in World War One. As we write this, there is currently a dispute going on between the FA and the SFA with FIFA over the right to display an Earl Haig poppy on football shirts, with FIFA (correctly in our opinion) interpreting such an act to be political.
[62] see Kelly, "The Paradox of Militaristic Remembrance" for a discussion of this.
[63] see Kelly, "Flowers of Scotland?" and Kelly, "Is Football Bigotry Confined to the West of Scotland?".

Bibliography

Alexander, J. *McCrae's Battalion. The Story of the Sixteenth Royal Scots*. Edinburgh: Mainstream, 2003.

Bale, J. and Vertinsky, P. "Introduction." In *Sites of Sport. Space, Place, Experience,* edited by P. Vertinsky and J. Bale, 1-7. London: Routledge, 2004.

Bourdieu, P. *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*. Translated by Richard Nice, London: Routledge, 1984.

Burrowes, J. *Irish: The Remarkable Saga of a Nation and a City*. Edinburgh: Mainstream, 2004.

Davis, P. “Hegemonic Fandom and the Red Herring of Sectarianism.” In *Bigotry, Football and Scotland*, edited by J. Flint and J. Kelly, 115-129. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University, 2013.

Fanon, F. *The Wretched of the Earth*. Harmondsworth, Middlesex: Penguin Books, 1967.

Farred, G. “Wankerdom: Trainspotting As a Rejection of the Postcolonial?” *The South Atlantic Quarterly* 103, no 1 (2004): 215-226.

Finn, G. “Faith, Hope and Bigotry. Case Studies of Anti-Catholic Prejudice in Scottish Soccer and Society.” In *Scottish Sport in the Making of the Nation. Ninety Minute Patriots*? edited by G. Jarvie and G. Walker, 91-112. Leicester: Leicester University Press, 1994.

Flint, J and J. Kelly, eds. *Bigotry, Football and Scotland,* Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2013.

Goffman, E. *The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life*. New York: Overlook Press, 1959.

Gregory Smith, C. *Scottish Literature*. London: Macmillan, 1919.

Hemingway, J. “Contested Cultural Spaces: Exploring Illicit Drug-using Through Trainspotting.” *International Research in Geographical and Environmental Education* 15, no 4 (2006): 324-335.

Hognestad, H.K. “The Jambo Experience: An Anthropological Study of Hearts Fans.” In *Entering the Field: New Perspectives on World Football*, edited by G. Armstrong, G. and R. Giulianotti, 193-210. Oxford: Berg, 1997.

Jeffers, J. M. “Rhizome National Identity: ‘Scatlin’s Psychic Defense’ in *Trainspotting.” JNT: Journal of Narrative Theory* 35, no 1 (2005): 88-111.

Kelly, J. “The Paradox of Militaristic Remembrance in British Sport and Popular Culture.” In *Global Sport and Militarism,* edited by M. Butterworth, Routledge, Forthcoming.

Kelly, J. “Is Football Bigotry Confined to the West of Scotland? The Heart of Midlothian and Hibernian Rivalry.” In *Bigotry, Football and Scotland,* edited by J. Flint and J. Kelly, 34-49. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2013.

Kelly, J. “Flowers of Scotland? A Sociological Analysis of National Identities, Rugby Union and Association Football in Scotland.” PhD diss., Loughborough University, 2007a

Kelly, J. “Hibernian Football Club: The Forgotten Irish?” *Sport in Society* 10, no. 3 (2007b): 514-536.

Kowalski, R. ‘‘‘Cry for us Argentina’. Sport and National Identity in Late Twentieth Century Scotland.” In *Sport and National Identity in the Post-War World,* edited by A. Smith and D. Porter**,** 69-87. London: Routledge, 2004.

Lefebvre, H. *The Production of Space*. Malden, MA: Blackwell, 1991.

Lugton, A. *The Making of Hibernian.* Vol. 1 of *The Making of Hibernian.* Edinburgh: John Donald, 1999.

Lugton, A. *The Making of Hibernian.* Vol. 3 of *The Making of Hibernian.* Edinburgh: John Donald, 1998

Macleod, L. "Life Among the Leith Plebs: Of Arseholes, Wankers, and Tourists in Irvine Welsh's Trainspotting." *Studies in the Literary Imagination* 41, no. 1 (2008): 89-106.

Mackay, J. *The Hibees: The Story of Hibernian Football Club*. Edinburgh: Mainstream, 1986

Mackie, A. *The Hearts: The Story of Heart of Midlothian F.C*. London: Stanley Paul and Co, 1959.

McKeown, D. P. "The Image of the City in Urban Literature: A Comparative Study between James Joyce's Dubliners, Hanif Kureishi's The Buddha of Suburbia and Irvine Welsh's Glue." M.A. diss., McMaster University, Ontario, 2004.

Rankin, I. *Knots and Crosses*. London: Orion, 1998.

Smith,, G.G. *Scottish Literature: Character and Influence.* London: Macmillan, 1919

Smith, A. *Heartfelt. Supping Bovril from the Devil's Cup*. Edinburgh: Birlinn, 2006.

Tuan, Y.-F. *Space and Place. The Perspective of Experience*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1977.