L’orizzonte della memoria

Citation for published version:
Paredes Maldonado, MIGUEL 2023, 'L’orizzonte della memoria: Duration, change and extended time in the Ecumenical Cemetery of Caltagirone', UOU scientific journal, no. 06, pp. 1-17.
https://doi.org/10.14198/UOU.2023.6.09

Digital Object Identifier (DOI):
10.14198/UOU.2023.6.09

Link:
Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer

Document Version:
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Published in:
UOU scientific journal

General rights
Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy
The University of Edinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact openaccess@ed.ac.uk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.
L’orizzonte della Memoria

Duration, Change and Extended Time in the Ecumenical Cemetery of Caltagirone

Como parte de una línea de investigación basada en la práctica arquitectónica especulativa del autor, la presente contribución emplea un reciente proyecto de concurso de intervención en un cementerio histórico situado en Catania (Italia) como medio para identificar y explorar las dimensiones temporales de la arquitectura. El texto sitúa estas dimensiones en relación a una serie de corrientes filosóficas contemporáneas, focalizadas en la experimentación con nociones de “tiempo” que trasciendan la relación del mismo con la experiencia humana.

Para ello, el presente trabajo pretende enmarcar la intervención (y su proceso de proyecto) en términos de una temporalidad fluida, transformadora y extendida, planteando metodologías que permitan exceder el ciclo de vida "visible" de la propuesta arquitectónica. Apoyándose en material visual extraído de la propuesta de concurso original, el texto articula las diferentes decisiones de proyecto en relación a posiciones teóricas específicas, desarrollando definiciones de "temporalidad arquitectónica" en términos programáticos, materiales e instrumentales. Este triple enfoque da lugar a una exploración exhaustiva de las dimensiones interrelacionadas (y potencialmente entrelazadas) de la "temporalidad," formulándolas a través de tres principios activos y estructurantes del proyecto arquitectónico: La extensión programática del tiempo asociada al propio carácter espiritual de la necrópolis, la constante evolución —dentro y fuera de las secuencias temporales humanas— del proceso proyectual, y el entendimiento de la materia más allá del momento efímero en que los componentes materiales se manifiestan como un objeto arquitectónico.

This contribution uses a recent competition project for a materially lightweight intervention in a historically significant cemetery in Catania, Italy—developed as part of the author’s research-led design practice—to articulate and explore the interrelated temporal dimensions of architecture. In so doing, it maps these dimensions against a series of contemporary philosophical positions, which interrogate the notion of “time” beyond its relation to human experience.

To this end, this contribution seeks to frame the intervention (and its originating design approach) in terms of its fluid, transformative, extended temporality, demonstrating how it may exceed its “visible” life cycle as an architectural proposal. Developing as a discussion that articulates design decisions in relation to their associated theoretical frameworks, the text proceeds to flesh out “architectural temporality” in programmatic, material, and instrumental terms. This threefold approach aims to offer a comprehensive exploration of the interrelated (and potentially intertwined) dimensions of “temporality,” with a view to positing them as three active principles for structuring design: The programmatic extension of time embedded in the spiritual character of the necropolis, the constantly evolving nature of the design process—both within and outside the human temporal sequence—and the consideration of materiality beyond the ephemeral moment when material components become an architectural object.
INTRODUCTION

Human memory is a marvellous but fallacious instrument. The memories which lie within us are not carved in stone; not only do they tend to become erased as the years go by, but often they change, or even vanish, by incorporating extraneous features.¹

Primo Levi
The Drowned and the Saved (1988)

Extracted from his lucid account of the violent intertwining of life and death he confronted during his internment in a German concentration camp during WWII, Primo Levi’s quote foregrounds the transformative effect on memory, altering and expanding it beyond actual lived experience. The quote is of particular interest to us inasmuch as it seems to challenge some prevailing contemporary interpretations of time in relation to architecture. A prominent example of such interpretations is Juhani Pallasmaa’s phenomenological account of the architectural object as a container of time and space and as a device to bring our minds back to an emotionally charged past.² Pallasmaa’s position strongly resonates with the views put forward by Peter Zumthor, another prominent phenomenologist. In his short essay entitled “A way of looking at things” Zumthor describes architectural masonry as a mnemonic device, capable of bringing sensual memories from the past into our experience of the present.³

Pallasmaa’s and Zumthor’s takes on the relationship between architecture and time have clear implications in relation to human experience and the built environment—though it exerts its influence through gradual transformation rather than systematic consolidation. Following Levi, and in considering an alternative discourse that extends beyond the strictures of human memory and experience, we might contemplate an extended “temporal” architecture that encompasses an expanded range of transformations afforded by the passage of time.

To this end, this essay leverages a speculative design scenario—an entry to an architectural competition developed in 2021— as a platform to investigate and unpack the interrelated dimensions of temporality in the built environment. In so doing, it seeks to address the following questions: How can a small architectural intervention foreground and articulate several temporal cycles at once? How can these cycles be meaningfully interwoven to become a conduit for time-driven design decisions? How are these intertwined dimensions of temporality ultimately manifested—both materially and immaterially?

At the core of its argument, this essay posits temporality as a threefold dimensional system: One which encompasses the full life cycle of material components (before, during and after their presence in an architectural assembly); the programmatic and spatial embodiment of this assembly into longer temporal landscapes, and the time-inflected instrumental qualities foregrounded through specific design processes.

1. A TEMPORALLY INFLECTED DESIGN SCENARIO

Titled “L’orizzonte della memoria,” as a direct reference to Levi’s written accounts of the limitations of human memory and reflecting the aspiration to encompass expanded temporal cycles through architecture, the work serving as a conduit for the ideas presented in this essay is an architectural design competition proposal for a lightweight, low-impact, low-carbon extension to the Ecumenical Cemetery in Caltagirone (Catania, Italy) (Fig. 1).

This cemetery is a historical, monumental “city within the city,” originally conceived and designed by architect Giambattista Nicastro in 1886. It is situated on the outskirts of Caltagirone, a town and municipality within the broader Metropolitan City of Catania in central Sicily. Its specific location combines peri-urban and rural characteristics. On the one hand, the cemetery site is directly connected to and surrounded by a network of roads and rail infrastructures that link Caltagirone with its wider regional context. Several light industries operate along these infrastructures in the immediate vicinity to the south of the site, while remaining visually separate from the architectural ensemble projected by Nicastro. To the north, east, and west of the site, a vast landscape of agricultural and forestry land extends into the far-reaching horizon. Large swathes of arable land are interspersed with areas of mature Mediterranean forests and shrublands, as well as small farming settlements.

The initial impression is that of a deceivingly pastoral landscape which, upon closer scrutiny, quickly reveals itself as a highly humanised environment that has been inhabited since prehistoric times (Fig. 2).

Gradually built in multiple stages and over a long period of time throughout the second half of the 19th century, the Ecumenical Cemetery was eventually left unfinished, and has remained so until the present day.⁴ Nicastro conceived and designed the necropolis in a characteristic neo-Gothic Sicilian style, and built them using several types of local stone—ranging from white Ragusa stone to volcanic stone from the Etna region and terracotta from Calatino. Richly decorated with ceramic ornaments, the structures convey a strong polychrome impression that reinforces Nicastro’s aspirations to monumentality. The architectural ensemble is organised as a bi-axial composition, with a main northwest-southeast axis that runs through the site and is linked to the cemetery entrance gate and to the access road that traverses the adjoining neighbourhood.

The central element of this bi-axial composition is shaped as a large Byzantine cross made of 170 arched stone porticoes (Fig. 3). These outline the ends of each of the arms of the cross as octagonal squares, which are themselves enclosed by the succession of arches in continuity with the arms. An exception to this enclosure is the tip of the northwest-southeast axis, which opens into a large void. This space was originally intended to be occupied by a chapel and, although several projects were drawn up for it over the 19th and 20th centuries, none of them were ever realised.

This remaining void in Nicastro’s structure became the focus of an international competition, jointly organised in 2021 by the Chamber of Architects of Bologna and the Chamber of Architects of Catania. The competition called for a built intervention that topped off Nicastro’s axial structure and provided formal closure to the porticoed construction while simultaneously articulating a broader connection to the surrounding areas of the cemetery.

Fig. 1 – Perspective of the design intervention through the existing porticoed structure. Analogue-digital collage.

Fig. 2 – Extended site plan of the human and natural landscapes surrounding the Monumental Cemetery of Caltagirone. Drawn to scale 1:5000. Brown ink on velum.

Fig. 3 – View of axial porticoed structures within the necropolis landscape. Monumental Cemetery of Caltagirone. Source: Wikimedia Commons (CC).
1.1. Programmatic Temporalities [duration]

As an architectural programme, the central theme of the necropolis is the establishment of a built threshold between human life and death. It opens up a permeable boundary between two states, but also a place where the transition between such states can be spatially experienced and inhabited. On the one hand, this functional theme is inherently charged with symbolic content—even when we try to spell it out in strictly factual terms. On the other hand, a more expansive consideration of its architectural manifestation can help repute it beyond the strictures of symbolic interpretations.

Thus, we could argue that the necropolis programme activates two fundamental expressions of the interplay of life and death through architectural means: the persistence and transformation of memory, and the notion of temporal continuity. As accounts of change and transformation, both can be framed conceptually through the work of philosopher Henri Bergson. For Bergson, memory and perception are two fundamentally different mechanisms—discussed in his own terms, he notes that they are different in “kind” as opposed to simply different in “degree.” Whilst memory is fully relegated to the past and therefore not readily accessible, perception is the realm of “actual sensations” and therefore accessible, perception is the realm of “actual sensations” and therefore inherently charged with symbolic content—even when we try to spell it out in strictly factual terms. Within this framework, time is simply our fragmentary perception of this continuous unfolding of the present.

Tapping into this theoretical space, the competition proposal aimed to present material and spiritual permanence—and the mechanisms that might activate—as continuous processes of heterogeneous transformation, encompassing both human and non-human entities and inserted into a much broader framework of uninterrupted temporal— and substantial—change.

In keeping with this aspiration, the design made use of tectonic and material languages that contributed to conceptually frame it as an intervention in the landscape rather than as a built object. That is, the intent of the design is not to produce a building, but rather a unitary intervention that links the stone arcades with the broader spatial and material organisation of the site. This strategy allowed the design to retain the spatial footprint allocated by the competition rules, while simultaneously embedding it into the elongated temporal cycle of the necropolis. An obvious precedent for this expansive landscape strategy can be found in the Igualada Cemetery designed by Enric Miralles and Carme Pinós, which has been widely characterised as an “architecture of time.”

In his own brief account of the Igualada Cemetery, Miralles describes the lighter tectonic components of the intervention as devices to “blur the edges” of other, more permanent material, solid cuts in the terrain. Furthermore, he notes how the place itself is something to be occupied with “small individual actions.” The themes of the dissolution of human-made actions and the extended duration of the site beyond the moment in which the project has been constructed already appear as key themes here. As Miralles poetically noted “to use this place is to make it disappear”.

The competition project aimed to incorporate similar mechanisms for instrumental and formal “blurring” that would challenge the prescriptive processional organisation imposed by the existing architecture. Thus, without resorting to formal or material replicas of the stone arcades designed by Giambattista Nicastro, the proposal continued and consolidated the curvilinear circulation routes that characterised the original design while simultaneously introducing opportunities for a broader range of “small individual actions” akin to those insinuated by Miralles and Pinós in their drive to make a place “disappear.” The sheltered walkways covered by the arcades were extended and connected to the northern sectors of the cemetery by means of two lightweight raised platforms (Fig. 4). These allowed visitors to gaze over the central open space left unfinished by Nicastro and provided an access to it via the adjoining stairs. However, the role of the connective platforms was not just to reach the central space as a culmination of the arcades, but also to foreground a further flow of circulation that continued “beyond” them, leaving the stone architecture behind to enter the large arborescent landscape that extends to the north-west of Nicastro’s work.

This connective gesture dissolved the prescriptive processional character of the arcades and the focal, axial space they led to, offering instead a continuous circulatory connection that invited perambulatory movements and drew users into the wider site of the cemetery and its adjoining territories. In this manner, both Giambattista Nicastro’s tectonic, perambulatory organisation and the proposed intervention were intended to appear as short, yet unfinished “moments” within a fluid, continuous transformation. From a conceptual standpoint, the goal was to manifest the programme of the necropolis in a temporal, multiplex, overlapping cycle of time—rather than as a “hard” threshold between the past and the present. Critically, such means of manifesting the programme provided a narrative where the cycles of human and non-human time appeared as overlapping—yet equally important—realities (Fig. 5).
1.2. Material Temporalities [change beyond human experience]

The temporally inflected material strategy for the competition proposal intends to challenge conventionally established relationships between matter and design. This is achieved by testing how the lens of an extended temporal framework may destabilise the prevalent notion that the former is subservient to the latter. This prevalent notion stems directly from the western, Aristotelian philosophical framework of hylomorphism: The idea that matter exists as an infinitely malleable, pliable substance, lacking in properties other than the potential to be shaped by human hands. In other words, hylomorphism suggests that “form” is something to be imposed on “matter” at once.

In a book that critically challenges this position, Simone Ferracina puts forward two key concepts that challenge the act of “design” as a singular, pivotal moment in the existence of a piece of architecture (and by extension, in the existence of any human-manipulated object). For Ferracina, these two vectors are potentiality and change. Potentiality encompasses the possible affordances and relationships into which objects may have entered in the past, and the ones they may enter in the future. Change encompasses the potential of an object for transformation and alteration over time—be it by reassembly, weathering, disassembly, decay, adaptation, reuse, recycling or any other occurrence (human or non-human). These occurrences will not necessarily turn a given object into a different one, but rather make that object progress into a different version of itself.

Both potentiality and change are inherently temporal. That is, they emerge over time and are also detached from human temporal cycles. The process whereby an object turns into a different version of itself may exceed human time or, on the contrary, take place in such short spans that they are not easily apprehensible through human cognition. At the core of both ideas is an understanding that, in any design workflow, objects exist and operate within a broader relational framework, yet always still maintain a certain degree of autonomy. Ferracina refers to this autonomy as a quality of “withdrawal” in the relation between an object’s reality and its sensual qualities—a reference which itself draws from philosopher Graham Harman’s own ontological framework, known as Object-Oriented Ontology. In a succinct explanation of what he means by objectual withdrawal, Harman describes how the objects that are in front of us are only partially present in our minds. That is, human observation constitutes only a small aspect of the real. Objects only offer a partial manifestation of themselves to the human sensual domain and develop complex sets of relationships independently from it.

This extra-human dimension of objects is aligned with both realist and materialist philosophical traditions. Whilst realism posits the idea that objects in the world exist outside (and independently of) human cognition, materialism considers that all entities are, to some extent, historically constructed. That is, they do not exist as unmovable singular “things” but rather as assembled entities that develop (and evolve) over time.

The conceptual framework summarised above—combining an awareness of continuous transformation through change and potential with an understanding of the ability of matter to “exceed” domain of human sensation over time—drives the approach to material organisation in the competition proposal. A key design decision emerging from this position is the use of glulam as the material of choice for all structural elements. Also referred to as glued laminated timber, glulam is a structural, engineered wood product made up of layers of sawn timber bonded together with adhesives. In this manner, the main organisational rhythm of the project was provided by glulam pillars, extended vertically to form large, laminated timber pergolas, which in turn were partially covered with a diagonal mesh of tensioned steel wire (Fig. 6). The structure responded to the spatial rhythm and the span of the arched naves of the arcades, but also to the arboreal elements that determine the broader circulatory rhythm of the necropolis: Its changing geometry sought a gradual accord between the monumental, monumental sequence of Nicastro’s architecture and the “ligneous” rhythm of the trees and the vegetation that articulate the cemetery.

Moreover, the choice of glued laminated timber—unconventional in this geographical context—also reflected the intention to build lightly and with consideration to the broader temporal impact of human construction. From a propositional angle, this translated into a desire to leave as few permanent traces as possible in the event of a future decommissioning of the structure. This, in turn, extended to a consideration of how materials are initially sourced, but also how they are disassembled and eventually disposed of. With this in mind, and considering their entire life cycle through a Life Cycle Assessment protocol (LCA), it was determined that using glulam elements would yield the overall lowest ecological footprint before, during and after their use in the project. Key factors in this assessment included the carbon emission mitigating potentials of cradle-to-grave recycling strategies associated with glulam, and the ability of timber to sequester carbon over long periods of time (which extend well beyond its use as a construction material).

An important goal of the design proposal emerged from the way in which the architecture of the stone arcades could be regarded as a material index of the broader regional landscape in which they are embedded.

Fig. 6 – Structural axonometric of proposed intervention. Ink on velum.
As noted in previous sections, the arcades were constructed using a remarkable range of different stone types, brought from different parts of Catania and Sicily. The glulam structural geometry added a ligneous layer to this material index, which also encompassed the human remains lodged into the niches and the transient, fleeting human traces of visitors. Like a solar clock, the serialised rhythms of the structural ribs projected ever-changing layers of shadow onto the open ground space of the lower level, emphasising its use as an area of quiet reflection on the perpetual rhythms of the natural world. In keeping with the stated aspiration to address matter “beyond” human time and the human mind, this overarching material strategy framed the intervention as an action that extended beyond the “visible” life cycle of the architectural proposal. In Western cultures, cemeteries provide a metaphorical device that helps describe the cycle of human life within a broader temporal sequence, suggesting that our existence surpasses the point of physical death in one way or another. In line with this, the intervention sought to attune this broader framework of existence to the non-human components of the project. Its extended material substrate and the temporality of the natural landscape it is embedded into.

1.3. Instrumental Temporalities [unfinished processes]

The third temporal dimension tackled in the competition proposal for the necropolis of Caltagirone pertains to the methodological approach to the design process itself. As was the case with the other two dimensions presented in this essay, the idea of temporality as a form of continuous transformation was explored as a productive condition that could be embedded into the core of the design workflow. As anticipated in earlier paragraphs, this resonates with the aspiration of contemporary practices that deliberately seek to both extend and blur their design processes. In so doing, they attempt to destabilise the idea of design as a particular “moment,” opting instead for presenting it as a continuous transformative endeavour that does not make a distinction between “work-in-progress” and “final results.” Critically, such destabilisation also extends this transformative production beyond the agency of the human designer and its inscription into human time.

Once again, the work of Enric Miralles and Carme Pinós provides abundant cues to better understand this approach. In a short essay prefacing a series of works under construction, Miralles notes that “construction” is certainly not the final state of the process, but rather “another of the unconnected instants that are always demanding a new response”. Working within the conceptual and disciplinary tradition of Miralles and Pinós, the practice of Eva Prats and Ricardo Flores has provided the most comprehensive contemporary account of how this aspiration can be mobilised through a design methodology that is grounded on an intentional, restricted use of representational methods and techniques. As Juan José Lahuerta notes, Flores and Prats’ work “takes its time and lingers in an unarmed experience” and both hand and tool operate in a continuous process “with the work.” In order to establish these working conditions, Flores and Prats put great emphasis on harnessing the instrumental implications of their chosen means of architectural representation—namely hand-based drawing and model making.

Although on the surface it might be perceived as a purely visual or stylistic decision—seeking to establish the practice as an “artisinal” alternative to the heavily prevalent aesthetics of digital production in architecture—the intent of Flores and Prats cannot be reduced to a simple preference for “drawing using analogue instruments.” On the contrary, Flores and Prats articulate their method through the notion of “thinking by hand”: a form of material engagement with the project that is intellectually multi-layered, deliberately extended and, most importantly, formulated as an endeavour that is not marked by either beginnings or ends. The iterative approach afforded by the instrumental conditions of hand-based drawing is also clearly prominent throughout Carme Pinós’ long-spanning solo practice career. In a recent interview, Pinós elaborated on the “tentative”, yet also resolute nature of her pencil drawings. For Pinós, these drawings are the key locus of design organisation, and can be returned to whenever key decision-making moves are required.

In keeping with the pursuit of a temporally-driven modality of engagement with design as a process, work on the Caltagirone competition proposal sought to tap into the instrumental development methods explored—among others—by Miralles, Pinós, Flores and Prats. In so doing, all key documents of the project were drawn entirely by hand, using pencil and ink on large-format velum sheets.

Again, rather than a stylistic choice to set the work against sophisticated means of digital production, hand drawing served as a deliberate method to defer the identification of an “end result” indefinitely, ultimately discarding the possibility of “completion” altogether. Working in this manner, drawings are never a finalised blueprint that guides—and marks the beginning of—a separate stage of material assembly and construction. On the contrary, they become a series of continuous, overlapping “constructions” that extend over a potentially infinite period of time (Fig. 7).

At an instrumental level, some of these “constructions” are enabled by the physical overlaying of large velum sheets, whereby parts and fragments emerge to conform a fluctuating whole with potential for rearrangement and recombination. This configuration also leads to

Fig. 7 – Photographic overlay of the development of the proposed architectural plan, elevation and cross sections. Ink on velum and digital collage.
the collapsing of different drawing projections—plans, projections and elevations—into one single drawing sheet. This intertwining of projections—both geometrical and spatial—is, in turn, expanded through the deliberate use of a single line weight throughout the drafting process. In so doing, an additional form of fluid continuity is established by blurring the hierarchical distinctions between background and foreground, section and projection, object and landscape.

A key aspect of this instrumental methodology, the manual commitment of lines and curves to paper means that slight design variations gradually emerge as the drawing develops, giving rise to a certain degree of inconsistency across different projections (Fig. 8). Rather than a liability, these deliberate inconsistencies challenge the fiction that the finished intervention will be an exact, scaled-down model of the actual proposal. Thus, the three-dimensional architecture, when mapped across different projections—plans, projections and elevations—will form a plane of relational consistency that will be imposed on the extended material reality of the cemetery in Igualada (Fig. 9). Miralles referred to when describing the cemetery in Igualada (Fig. 9).

In presenting this body of design work in relation to the textual counterpart of its intellectual framework, this essay is an attempt to explicitly map the different dimensions of architectural temporality unpacked by the visual materials against a relevant, contemporary philosophical discourses.

Besides the well-known connections between their respective theoretical lineages, these strands of discourse are linked by their shared interest in situating time and memory within a chain of continuous transformation. Critically, they posit this domain as being connected (but not dependent on) human agency and perception. Thus, the three temporal dimensions of architecture presented here can be effectively regarded as three intertwined manifestations of time as a continuous sequence of perpetual, heterogeneous transformation.

Ultimately, this essay endeavours to explore the question of architectural temporality in the broadest possible sense, but also to deploy it as a cohesive intellectual discourse, which can be mobilised as a series of design decisions—material, programmatic and instrumental alike—.

**BIBLIOGRAPHY**


**CONCLUSION**

Working within a functional programme that is inherently charged with symbolic content, the proposed intervention aimed to challenge established assumptions about how architecture may relate to the passing of time—in terms of its embodied material culture, its originating processes, and its spatial and aesthetic organisation.

In presenting this body of design work in relation to the textual counterpart of its intellectual framework, this essay is an attempt to explicitly map the different dimensions of architectural temporality unpacked by the visual materials against a relevant, contemporary philosophical discourses.

Besides the well-known connections between their respective theoretical lineages, these strands of discourse are linked by their shared interest in situating time and memory within a chain of continuous transformation. Critically, they posit this domain as being connected (but not dependent on) human agency and perception. Thus, the three temporal dimensions of architecture presented here can be effectively regarded as three intertwined manifestations of time as a continuous sequence of perpetual, heterogeneous transformation.

Ultimately, this essay endeavours to explore the question of architectural temporality in the broadest possible sense, but also to deploy it as a cohesive intellectual discourse, which can be mobilised as a series of design decisions—material, programmatic and instrumental alike—.

**NOTES**

3. Pallasmaa, 55.

27. Ferracina, 192-98.