Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice: possibilities and limitations

Citation for published version:
https://doi.org/10.1063/5.0048516

Digital Object Identifier (DOI):
10.1063/5.0048516

Link:
Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer

Document Version:
Peer reviewed version

Published In:
The Journal of Chemical Physics

General rights
Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy
The University of Edinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact openaccess@ed.ac.uk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.
Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice: possibilities and limitations

L. J. Conway,1 K. Brown,1 J. S. Loveday,1 and A. Hermann1, a)

SUPA, School of Physics and Astronomy and Centre for Science at Extreme Conditions,
The University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh EH9 3FD, United Kingdom

(Dated: 4 May 2021)

Ammonium fluoride, NH$_4$F, is often seen as an analogue to ice, with several of its solid phases closely resembling known ice phases. While its ionic and hydrogen-ordered nature puts topological constraints on the ice-like network structures it can form, it is not clear what consequences these constraints have for NH$_4$F compound formation and evolution. Here, we explore computationally the reach and eventual limits of the ice analogy for ammonium fluoride. By combining data mining of known and hypothetical ice networks with crystal structure prediction and density functional calculations we explore the high-pressure phase diagram of NH$_4$F and host-guest compounds of its hydrides. Pure NH$_4$F departs from ice-like behaviour above 80 GPa with the emergence of close-packed ionic structures. The predicted stability of NH$_4$F hydrides shows that NH$_4$F can act as host to small guest species, albeit in a topologically severely constraint configuration space. Finally, we explore the binary NH$_3$–HF chemical space, where we find candidate structures for several unsolved polyfluoride phases, among them the chemical analogue to H$_2$O$_2$ dihydrate.

a)Electronic mail: a.hermann@ed.ac.uk
Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

I. INTRODUCTION

Water has an extremely rich phase diagram. In its solid phases, every water molecule donates and accepts two hydrogen bonds in a local tetrahedral coordination environment. Globally, no rules other than the Bernal-Fowler ice rules exist, which govern the water molecules’ orientations (or hydrogen distributions) to minimise defects, thus resulting in at least 18 known crystalline ice phases,\(^1\)–\(^3\) plus a large number of predicted phases at high\(^4\),\(^5\) or negative pressures.\(^6\) In these ice phases, the hydrogen network can be ordered or – typical at elevated temperatures – disordered. Around 60 GPa the hydrogen bonds begin to symmetrize, such that eventually all nearest neighbour O–H–O bonds are linear and symmetric and ice forms an atomic network structure.\(^7\)–\(^10\) This is not the only possible response to compression: others include auto-ionization (as seen in ammonia, NH\(_3\))\(^11\),\(^12\) or decomposition into the elements (as seen in methane, CH\(_4\)).\(^13\)–\(^15\) The flexibility of the hydrogen bond network on display in the structural variety of water is also at the root of many of its anomalous properties, and the reason water can form complex host networks for various small molecular guest species.\(^16\),\(^17\) The formation and properties of these gas hydrates have wide-ranged implications, from industrial gas exploration and carbon sequestration to planetary sciences.\(^18\),\(^19\)

Condensed ammonium fluoride, NH\(_4\)F, can be thought of as an ice analogue as it shares many properties with ice – the local tetrahedral coordination, due to the shape of the NH\(_4^+\) molecular cation, and formation of fully hydrogen-bonded networks. At ambient pressure, its heavy atom lattice is isostructural to the oxygen lattice of ice Ih. It can form solid solutions with ice up to about 20 mol-% concentration, and also forms a monohydrate, NH\(_4\)F·H\(_2\)O.\(^20\)–\(^22\) However, NH\(_4\)F also differs from ice in important ways. Firstly, it is an ionic structure, (NH\(_4^+\))·F\(^-\). The resulting electrostatics mean the fluorine/nitrogen distribution on the sites of any tetrahedral network is expected to be ordered; any disorder would lead to nearest neighbour F–F or NH\(_4^+\)–NH\(_4^+\) units with a prohibitively large energy cost from Coulomb repulsion, and the presence of Bjerrum-like defects\(^23\) in the resulting hydrogen bond network. Note that any network that has odd-membered rings of hydrogen bonds will inevitably have such defects, as alternate assignments of sites on an odd-membered ring to F and NH\(_4^+\) is not possible. As a consequence, NH\(_4\)F can only form ice polymorphs that have exclusively even-membered rings of hydrogen bonds. Secondly, the hydrogen network is ordered, as all hydrogens are covalently bound to the nitrogen. NH\(_4\)F can therefore not show the same type of thermally induced order/disorder transitions as ice. Thirdly, because of
Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

the asymmetry between fluorine and nitrogen, there is no reason why symmetric hydrogen bonds of the type F–H–N should form at high pressure. It is presently unknown how (or if at all) NH₄F loses its molecular character under compression; its phase diagram has not been studied beyond 30 GPa. Finally, while small amounts of NH₄F doping into ice can modify water clathrate cage structures, manipulate hydrogen ordering transitions and even influence the high-pressure phase diagram, it is not known if pure NH₄F or NH₄F-rich solutions can form host-guest compounds similar to gas hydrates.

Here, we present a computational study around the overarching question how far the ice analogy of NH₄F holds, and how it breaks down in various situations. Specifically, we look to probe this analogy in three different directions. Firstly, by exploring the high-pressure phase diagram of NH₄F, far beyond the symmetrization pressure of the hydrogen bonds in ice; to this end, we construct hypothetical NH₄F phases based on the ice phase diagram, in conjunction with crystal structure searches up to 300 GPa. Secondly, we investigate the capability of NH₄F to act as a host structure similar to water in gas hydrates; specifically, we study the formation and stability of ammonium fluoride hydrides, NH₄F–H₂. Finally, in recognition of the binary nature of (NH₃)(HF), we explore the full phase diagram of binary compounds (NH₃)(HF)n, using crystal structure prediction methods; which is analogous to surveying the H₂O–H₂O₂ phase diagram in the ice-related chemical space. We show that NH₄F departs qualitatively from ice-like behaviour above 80 GPa; that host-guest compounds with relevant inclusion compounds can form, but phase diagrams are driven by topological constraints on host networks; and that ammonium polyfluorides have rich phase diagrams around the formation of the FHF molecule and (HF)n clusters, and include the previously unknown analogue to the dihydrate of H₂O₂.

II. COMPUTATIONAL METHODOLOGY

We performed density functional theory (DFT) calculations using the CASTEP code. Electronic exchange-correlation effects were described with the Perdew-Burke-Ernzerhof (PBE) functional and ultra-soft pseudo-potentials as generated ‘on-the-fly’ by CASTEP. Geometry optimisations were performed with plane wave cut-offs of 1000 eV and Monkhorst-Pack Brillouin zone sampling grids with k-point spacings of no more than $2\pi \times 0.04 \text{ Å}^{-1}$. In Figures S1 and S2 in the Supplementary Material (SM) we present NH₄F phase stabilities from a many-body dispersion (AMD) scheme and using the BLYP and RSCAN exchange-correlation functionals.
Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

We generate new high-pressure candidate structures for NH₄F by manually building analogues of known ice phases and other ammonium halides and by structure searches based on the particle swarm optimization method using the CALYPSO code. Typical parameters for this candidate structure generation and screening were plane wave cut-offs of 350 eV and k-point spacings of no more than $2\pi \times 0.07 \ \text{Å}^{-1}$.

Optimized water ice structures based on zeolite networks were obtained from the Materials Cloud archive. NH₄F candidates were selected by calculating ring statistics on each of the structures, keeping only structures with exclusively even-membered rings of hydrogen-bonded molecules. Some structures had geometries with poorly defined tetrahedral networks - despite their parent SiO₂ structure tetrahedral network. For example, some structures possessed OH···O bonds with small O–H–O angles, or OH groups without a mutual neighbour. We discounted these structures as a further pre-selection criterion. The ice IV structure in the dataset is erroneous, so a correct structure was added manually.

Crystal structure searches were carried out at 30, 100 and 300 GPa generating over 2,500 NH₄F structures each consisting of between 2 and 4 formula units. Generating larger unit cells randomly becomes computationally prohibitive. However, a significant number of ice analogues with larger unit cells were considered via the dataset by Engel et al.

For NH₄F–H₂ host-guest compounds at low pressures, where dispersion effects become significant, we use the Tkatchenko-Scheffler (TS) semi-empirical dispersion interaction correction. This method gives transition pressures in the H₂O–H₂ system consistent with similar levels of theory.

For the binary (NH₃)(HF)ₙ system we perform CALYPSO searches for n = 1 to 7 generating over 6,500 structures. To determine stable compounds, we compare enthalpy values, $H = U + PV$ where $U$ is the internal energy per molecule and $P$ and $V$ are the pressure and molecular volume, respectively. To compare with a decomposition into the pure molecular phases, we also perform calculations on the known NH₃ and HF crystal structures.

Within the binary systems, the compounds that form the convex hull of the relative formation enthalpies,

$$\Delta H(x) = H(A_xB_{1-x}) - xH(A) - (1-x)H(B),$$  \hspace{1cm} (1)

are thermodynamically stable against decomposition. Here A=(H₂, HF) and B=NH₄F.

Phonons were calculated for all relevant structures at 2 GPa, 10 GPa and 100 GPa. These were performed using CASTEP with norm-conserving pseudopotentials and density functional pertur-
Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

Gibbs free energies and zero point energies, \( G = H - TS_{\text{vib}} + E_{ZPE} \), were calculated using the harmonic approximation on the phonon densities of states. These q-point grids were sufficient to give well converged Gibbs free energies. The stability of compounds in the binary systems are calculated as above.

Topological charge density analyses were performed using the QUANTUMESPRESSO package\(^41\) using projector augmented wave (PAW) pseudopotentials. The geometries were re-optimised for these pseudopotentials and the charge densities calculated with a plane wave cut off energy of 1500 eV on a dense charge density grid with a cut off of 18000 eV. All-electron charge densities were then analysed with the CRITIC2 code\(^42\) to perform Bader’s QTAIM analysis\(^43\) for integrating atomic basins and locating critical points.\(^44\) Electronic localization function (ELF) calculations were also done using QUANTUMESPRESSO and crystal orbital Hamilton populations (COHP) calculated using the LOBSTER code.\(^45\)–\(^48\)

III. RESULTS

A. \( \text{NH}_4\text{F Under Pressure} \)

As many as seven solid phases have been reported for \( \text{NH}_4\text{F} \),\(^49\) three of which have ice analogues; phase I is a hexagonal structure and ice Ih analogue\(^50\) stable up to 0.4 GPa; phase II is a rhombohedral structure\(^50\) stable up to 1 GPa, an analogue of the metastable phase IV of ice; phase III is a cubic CsCl-like structure and ice VII analogue;\(^51\) phase IV is a plastic phase stable at higher temperatures, in a NaCl-like structure;\(^52\) and phases V-VII are likely stacking disordered structures of phase I\(^49,53\).

Bellin et al. suggested a disorder-order transition above 10 GPa in the cubic \( \text{NH}_4\text{F-III} \) phase.\(^51\) Above the ordering pressure, a small tetragonal distortion has been implied from broadening of Raman peaks\(^51\) and density functional theory was used to give a qualitatively similar phase sequence at low temperatures. The proposed disorder in phase III is qualitatively different from that seen in ice VII. The latter has two intertwined hydrogen-bonded sublattices, and the hydrogen network within each sublattice is disordered. In \( \text{NH}_4\text{F-III} \), rotational disorder on the \( \text{NH}_4 \) sites is proposed to result in disordered hydrogen bonds between the sublattices.

To explore the potential phase evolution of \( \text{NH}_4\text{F} \) we generated candidate structures by building
Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

$\text{NH}_4\text{F}$ analogues from known water ice structures, zeolite frameworks and by crystal structure searching.

To build potential water analogue structures, we surveyed water network geometries in the zeolite-inspired dataset provided by Engel et al.$^{54}$ This dataset contains 15869 water ice structures, optimised after substitution $\text{H}_2\text{O}$ into $\text{SiO}_2$ zeolite structures. Of the original $\text{SiO}_2$ structures, 3908 contain exclusively even-membered rings along –$\text{Si}–\text{O}–\text{Si}$– bonds. After $\text{H}_2\text{O}$ substitutions and subsequent optimisations, 1326 of these even-ringed structures still possess well defined tetrahedral networks at every molecular site. Into these structures we inserted $\text{NH}_4\text{F}$ ion pairs, placing them on the oxygen sites such that there is a consistent $\text{NH}_4\cdots\text{F}$ hydrogen bonding network. These structures were then optimised at 5 GPa. The initial, first two intermediate, and final enthalpies of the geometry optimisations are shown in Figure 1a. Many of these $\text{NH}_4\text{F}$ structures relax via geometry optimisation to an equivalent of $\text{NH}_4\text{F-III}$, which correctly emerges as the most stable (lowest enthalpy) $\text{NH}_4\text{F}$ structure at 5 GPa.

The convex hull of enthalpy and volume can be used to estimate the transition pressures to metastable structures, assuming linear pressure dependence of relative enthalpies.$^{55}$ The gradients of lines connecting points on the convex hull give transition pressures relative to the base pressure (5 GPa). The convex hull contains $\text{NH}_4\text{F-II}$ (from ice IV) and $\text{NH}_4\text{F-I}$ (from ice Ih) as stable structures. Figure 1a shows this and predicts the transitions $\text{NH}_4\text{F-III} \rightarrow \text{II}$ and $\text{NH}_4\text{F-II} \rightarrow \text{I}$ at 2.7 and 1.4 GPa, respectively. The rhombohedral structure based on ice II is also found as a candidate structure, in addition to three low density structures; the cubic clathrate structure CS-IV, and structures based on the AST and SOD zeolite frameworks. These low-density structures are estimated to become stable at negative pressures of -10.8, -1.7 and -1.5 GPa, respectively. In analogy to water clathrate networks at negative pressures, this suggests these structures could be stabilised at positive pressures if suitable guest molecules occupy their internal cages and voids. The only other remaining valid ice analogue structures are ice VI and CS-III. Ice VI is close to the enthalpy-volume convex hull whereas CS-III is very unstable, see Figure 1a. Finally, note that no candidate structure for a high-pressure $\text{NH}_4\text{F}$ phase beyond $\text{NH}_4\text{F-III}$ emerges from this dataset.

Figure 1b shows the relative enthalpies of the structures discussed above as a function of pressure, using the PBE exchange correlation functional. The phase sequence of $\text{NH}_4\text{F-I} \rightarrow \text{II} \rightarrow \text{III}$ is reproduced, albeit with overestimated transition pressures compared to experiment, which is similar to what is seen in water ice calculations with the PBE functional.$^{56}$ Note that the $P4/nmm$ structure of $\text{NH}_4\text{Br}$ (a structure with no zeolite or ice analogue) emerges as an energetically com-
petitive phase between NH$_4$F-II and -III. This could be an artifact of our calculations or point to a new phase in the low-temperature phase diagram of NH$_4$F. To examine the robustness of these results, we study the low-pressure phase sequence with several other different functionals and optional dispersion correction schemes. Detailed results are given in Figures S1-S2 in the Supplementary Material (SM) and compared to low-temperature experimental data.$^{51}$ Amongst other functionals, the RSCAN functional gives a more accurate NH$_4$F-I→II transition pressure, but underestimates the II→III transition. Conversely, the BLYP functional overestimates all the transition pressures much more than PBE. Semi-emperical dispersion correction schemes generally act to reduce the transition pressures, but tend to overestimate the stability of NH$_4$F-III and the $P4/nmm$ structure. Overall, PBE results are in satisfactory agreement with experiment.

As mentioned above, Figure 1a shows that NH$_4$F-III represents the highest pressure structure to form from ice analogues and zeolite structure types. To continue the search to higher pressures we used unbiased crystal structure searches. A total of 2500 structures were generated for NH$_4$F at 30, 100 and 300 GPa. Searches at 30 GPa successfully reproduced NH$_4$F-III as the most stable structure, whereas the searches at 100 GPa and 300 GPa reveal two alternative high-pressure structures. Firstly, an $I4_{1}/amd$ structure stable above 80 GPa (at PBE level; 89 GPa with BLYP, and 86 GPa with RSCAN, see Figure S3 in the SM) and secondly, a monoclinic $P2_{1}/c$ stable above 220 GPa. NH$_4$F as a compound remains very stable against decomposition into NH$_3$ + HF up to high pressures, see Figure 1b.

Both new phases, of $I4_{1}/amd$ and $P2_{1}/c$ symmetry, are shown in Figure 2b and c. They are dynamically stable in their respective stability regions (see Figure S7 in the SM), and so are all other new structures presented in this work. Structurally they are similar, with identical heavy atom lattices that are more distorted in the $P2_{1}/c$ structure. Importantly, they are no longer characterized by the network of NH$_4$···F hydrogen bonds, but rather take up denser structures with the nearest-neighbour shells around either NH$_4^{+}$ and F$^{-}$ ions consisting of both NH$_4^{+}$ and F$^{-}$ ions. The environments surrounding the NH$_4$/F ions transform from body-centred cubic, with 8 nearest neighbours in NH$_4$F-III, to quasi-face-centred cubic, with 12 nearest neighbours, see the histograms of separations in Figure 2a. Due to the global 1:1 stoichiometry of NH$_4$:F, eight nearest neighbours are of the opposite type, with the remaining four being occupied by the same type as the central ion. Hence, above 80 GPa, the energetic cost of nearest neighbour F–F or NH$_4$–NH$_4$ connections, which is so energetically prohibitive at low pressures, is outweighed by the compression work gain due to the closer packing. This is not entirely new: in the autoionized high-pressure
Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

**FIG. 1.** a) Enthalpy-volume scatter plot of NH$_4$F structures at 5 GPa resulting from the H$_2$O structures from Engel et al.$^{37}$ Data points relate to enthalpies and volumes for initial geometries (blue), the first two optimisation steps (red, yellow), and the optimised geometries (green). Black circles represent the convex hull, with structure types labeled. Gradients of the connections between these structures represent the transition pressures, relative to 5 GPa. Grey circles and labels highlight other water ice geometries. b) Relative enthalpies as a function of pressure, in a low pressure (up to 5 GPa) and high pressure regime (up to 300 GPa).

$Pma2$ phase of NH$_3$, which forms an ionic NH$_4$·NH$_2$ solid, each molecular ion has 12 nearest neighbours (quasi close-packed), of which four are the same type as the central ion.

However, a general observation is that one of the central rules that governs the topology of NH$_4$···F structures at low pressures, the alternation of anions and cations, breaks down in these high-pressure structures; and so do, therefore, the structural analogies to ice. However, the high-pressure phases still retain hydrogen bonding. In the $I4_1/amd$ structure, all four NH$_4$···F bonds still form close to linear hydrogen bonds with N–H···F angles of 161 degrees, whereas the $P2_1/c$ structure has bonds at 172, 157, and 124 degrees. In the latter case, the enthalpy gain from the denser packing of rotated NH$_4$ cations outweighs the energy cost from non-ideal hydrogen bonds.

A second observation is that, in contrast to ice, pressure does not lead to symmetric hydrogen bonds in NH$_4$F (note there is no symmetry argument why this should happen) but instead distorts and weakens them. NH$_4$F remains a molecular ionic solid up to at least 300 GPa, representing a marked deviation from the structural trends seen in ice. At 100 GPa the charge transfer from
Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

FIG. 2. a) Pair distribution functions for the heavy atom lattices at 100 GPa. Crystal structures of (b) NH$_4$F-$P2_1/c$, (c) $I4_1/amd$, and (d) III at 100 GPa. F–F nearest neighbours are connected as a guide to the eye.

NH$_4$ to F (based on a Bader analysis) is 0.76e, 0.77e and 0.77e for NH$_4$F-III, $-I4_1/amd$ and $-P2_1/c$ respectively. At 300 GPa, the charge transfer in NH$_4$F-III reduces slightly to 0.74e whereas the charges persist for the high-pressure structures, supporting the ionic picture remaining up to very high pressures. Note that the $I4_1/amd$ structure is the same structure type as LiAg,$^{58}$ which has significant ionic character. All of these structures remain wide-gap insulators across the entire pressure range studied here. The partial densities of states and crystal orbital Hamilton populations (COHP) are shown in Figure 3. They confirm that the valence states are distinct blocks made up of N-s, F-s, and N/F-p character, while the conduction states are of H-s character. The integrated COHP up to the Fermi level gives an indication of the bond strengths and are listed in Table S1 in the SM. Typical N–H bond strengths do not change between the different crystal settings. However, there is some variation in the H⋯F bonding character, which is about 20% stronger in NH$_4$F-III than the denser structures at 100 GPa, a difference that increases to 40% at 300 GPa. The integrated COHP of N-F contributes less than 3% of the total bond strength. F-F and N-N neighbours contribute effectively nothing. Neither is unexpected as these interactions are of almost pure ionic character, which is not captured by COHP. The 2.1 and 2.2 % volume reductions in the $I4_1/amd$ and $P2_1/c$ structures over NH$_4$F-III (taken at 80 GPa) appear to be
FIG. 3. Crystal orbital Hamilton populations (pCOHP) and partial density of states (pDOS) for the NH$_4$F structures at 100 GPa. pCOHP values are averaged over all first neighbour shells of each bond type and normalized per NH$_4$F formula unit. F-F and N-N populations are enhanced by a factor of 10 for clarity.

enough to compensate for the less favourable electrostatic and bonding configurations than those present in NH$_4$F-III.

The tendency to form these denser structure types also makes ammonium fluoride stand out amongst ammonium halides. In both NH$_4$Br and NH$_4$Cl the $P4/nmm$ structure persists in calculations up to high pressures and remains stable against the $I4_1/amd$ and $P2_1/c$ structure types (see Figure S8 in the SM for relative formation enthalpies). If the ammonium halides simply followed the ionic radii ratio rules, they should all crystallize in the NaCl structure. Considering the tetrahe-
Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

![Graph showing relative formation enthalpies for mixtures in binary systems NH\textsubscript{4}F–H\textsubscript{2} (left) and H\textsubscript{2}O–H\textsubscript{2} (right), at a series of pressures. Solid black lines and outlined symbols denote convex hulls and calculated stable phases. Square symbols in the H\textsubscript{2}O–H\textsubscript{2} panel represent C\textsubscript{0}.](image)

FIG. 4. Relative formation enthalpies for mixtures in the binary systems NH\textsubscript{4}F–H\textsubscript{2} (left) and H\textsubscript{2}O–H\textsubscript{2} (right), at a series of pressures. Solid black lines and outlined symbols denote convex hulls and calculated stable phases. Square symbols in the H\textsubscript{2}O–H\textsubscript{2} panel represent C\textsubscript{0}.

The analogy of NH\textsubscript{4}F with water ice breaks down above 80 GPa, with the advent of its distinct high-pressure phases. At much lower pressures, water can form numerous additional networks in the form of porous hydrogen-bonded cage structures that serve as host networks to encapsulate atomic or molecular guest species such as H\textsubscript{2}, Ne, CH\textsubscript{4}, or N\textsubscript{2}.\textsuperscript{16} Amongst these clathrate hydrates, hydrogen hydrates (H\textsubscript{2}O–H\textsubscript{2} mixtures) are of particular technological and fundamental (planetary) interest, and have been studied extensively in the past.\textsuperscript{16,60–62} The next step in this study is to probe the NH\textsubscript{4}F-ice analogy (and its potential breakdowns) via the ability of NH\textsubscript{4}F to form host networks.

B. NH\textsubscript{4}F Gas Inclusions

The analogy of NH\textsubscript{4}F with water ice breaks down above 80 GPa, with the advent of its distinct high-pressure phases. At much lower pressures, water can form numerous additional networks in the form of porous hydrogen-bonded cage structures that serve as host networks to encapsulate atomic or molecular guest species such as H\textsubscript{2}, Ne, CH\textsubscript{4}, or N\textsubscript{2}.\textsuperscript{16} Amongst these clathrate hydrates, hydrogen hydrates (H\textsubscript{2}O–H\textsubscript{2} mixtures) are of particular technological and fundamental (planetary) interest, and have been studied extensively in the past.\textsuperscript{16,60–62} The next step in this study is to probe the NH\textsubscript{4}F-ice analogy (and its potential breakdowns) via the ability of NH\textsubscript{4}F to form host networks.
Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

around guest species, as typified by potential NH$_4$F–H$_2$ mixtures.

At the lowest pressures, hydrogen hydrate forms in the cubic sII clathrate structure, with 136 water molecules and 64 H$_2$ molecules per unit cell.$^{61}$ There are four further known or predicted stable hydrogen hydrates, denoted as C$_0$, C$_1$, C$_2$ and C$_3$. These compounds have H$_2$O:H$_2$ ratios of 2:1, 6:1, 1:1, and 1:2, respectively. C$_0$ has a chiral water network (S$_\chi$) with channels that the guest molecules can occupy$^{3,17,63}$ whereas the others are based on ice II (C$_1$)$^{60}$ and ice Ic (C$_2$ and C$_3$)$^{39,60}$ None of these are stable at ambient conditions, but they form under application of a few kbar. There is also a metastable C$_{-1}$ hydrate with a ice I$_{sd}$ water network, a stacking disordered variant of ice I.$^{64}$

DFT calculations with TS dispersion corrections predict a spurious region of stability for an ice Ih-based dihydrate, which is structurally close to but still distinct from C$_{-1}$. Careful treatment by way of Hartree-Fock and local second-order Møller-Plesset perturbation theory is required to reproduce the experimental observations.$^{40}$ Nevertheless, a simple treatment of both systems with PBE and semi-empirical dispersion corrections gives a reasonable qualitative estimate of the phase stability.

Through the substitution 2(H$_2$O) → NH$_4$F in the hydrogen hydrates we constructed candidate NH$_4$F–H$_2$ compounds. An NH$_4$F–C$_0$ compound is ruled out because the S$_\chi$ network possesses odd membered hydrogen-bonded rings, while C$_1$ to C$_3$ are topologically allowed. Of the known stable ultra-low density ice polymorphs, CS-I to -IV, S-H, S-T and S-K,$^{65}$ only CS-III and CS-IV are topologically allowed to form NH$_4$F networks. Despite CS-IV and the zeolite frameworks being predicted as energetically competitive low density NH$_4$F structures in Figure 1a, not all of these structures have been considered as NH$_4$F:H$_2$ networks in this work. Their large cavities will need to be filled with H$_2$ molecules in unknown amounts and configuration to determine the most stable compounds, which is beyond the scope of this work.

The NH$_4$F-SOD structure has the smallest cavities, which holds one H$_2$ molecule per cavity. This structure has the same stoichiometry as C$_1$ but is still 50 meV/molecule higher in energy (and so does not appear on the scale in Figure 4). Furthermore, we can speculate on the stability of the CS-IV and AST structures by noting that their networks contain 4-membered rings, and so feature destabilising F$^-$-F$^-$ and NH$_4^+$-NH$_4^+$ neighbours along the diagonals. Furthermore, low density ice structures with four-membered rings are stable only in narrow pressure regions and otherwise mechanically unstable.$^{66}$ However, these structures may still play a role as host networks for larger molecules.
Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

On the other hand, filled NH$_4$F-I (equivalent to ice Ih) is geometrically feasible and dynamically stable. Convex hull constructions for hydrides of both water and NH$_4$F host structures, obtained from semi-empirical dispersion correction (SEDC) calculations combined with PBE, are shown in Figure 4. These are qualitatively remarkably similar and confirm that NH$_4$F can indeed act as host network to small guest species. But the phase diagrams also exhibit some differences. At 0 GPa, PBE+SEDC predicts both filled ice Ih and filled NH$_4$F-I (see Figure 5) to be stable. With pressure, the filled ice Ih structure gives way to C$_1$, which is topologically forbidden in the NH$_4$F–H$_2$ system. At 2 GPa, both C$_1$ structures are stable. At 3 GPa, both systems should in addition stabilise the C$_2$ structure. The C$_3$ analogue in NH$_4$F–H$_2$ (with the same NH$_4$F network as C$_2$) is only metastable between around 20 and 50 GPa. This is a second notable difference from the corresponding C$_3$ hydrogen hydrate, which is stable in calculations from 21 GPa to at least 120 GPa.\textsuperscript{39} Free energy estimates that include zero-point vibrational energies and vibrational entropies within the harmonic approximation destabilise the filled Ih structure at 0 K and room temperature at its upper pressure stability limit (see Figure S5 in the SM) but otherwise do not qualitatively affect the phase stabilities; which agrees with reports for hydrogen hydrates.\textsuperscript{39}

FIG. 5. a) Ground-state phase diagram for the NH$_4$F–H$_2$ binary system as function of pressure and composition. Colored bars indicate pressure regions of stability. Black lines indicate metastability (see main text). Grey bars represent the corresponding stability regions calculated for the H$_2$O–H$_2$ analogues. b) Unit cells for structures. C$_1$ is shown in a conventional unit cell setting.
Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

Figure 5 summarises the ground state stability regions of the different NH$_4$F–H$_2$ host-guest compounds, obtained from interpolating convex hull data on a fine grid of pressure points, and depicts the various crystal structures. We declare compounds “metastable” if they are less than 10 meV/molecule removed from the convex hull at a given pressure. This captures typical free energy changes between the ground state and room temperature (see Figs S4-S6 in the SM), which are driven by subtle changes to the low-energy librational phonon modes between different compounds. Filled NH$_4$F-I is stable in the calculations from 0.1 to 2.7 GPa, “C$_1$” (the filled ice II equivalent of NH$_4$F) between 0.9 and 3.7 GPa, and “C$_2$” (one filled sublattice of NH$_4$F-III) between 2.5 and 6.7 GPa; all are dynamically stable in those pressure regions, see Figure S9 in the SM. The latter two are not significantly different from the hydrogen hydrates (shown as grey bars in Figure 5a). Since these pressure ranges are likely to be overestimated (as seen when compared to hydrogen hydrate experiments), it seems reasonable that NH$_4$F as a host network can be explored at relatively low pressures, e.g. using neutron diffraction. NH$_4$F is, therefore, an interesting ice analogue for molecular host-guest systems: its filled-ice analogue structures are clearly capable of hosting a small molecular species. In fact, this increases its structural variety (the ice II equivalent of NH$_4$F does not form for NH$_4$F itself). However, there are again differences to ice, at both ends of the pressure scale: the topological barriers against the formation of the known clathrate cage structures mean its low-pressure phase diagram will be poorer, unless other, as yet unknown, cage structures with exclusively even-membered hydrogen-bonded rings can form. In that regard, it would be very interesting to study, e.g., the NH$_4$F-CH$_4$ system: a larger guest species would require the formation of larger voids or cages in a potential NH$_4$F host network. At the high-pressure end the stability of NH$_4$F hydrides also seems limited, with a “C$_3$” phase never becoming stable.

Hydrogen inclusions in NH$_4$F are effectively inserted into an ionic solid. A recent study related the ability of non-polar species (in that case, noble gas atoms) to penetrate ionic lattices to the lowering of the Madelung energy by reducing electrostatic repulsion$^{67}$ – however, this was identified as a driving force specifically for ionic compounds with uneven cation and anion numbers (formula AB$_2$ etc.). Here, this argument does not hold; instead, the tetrahedrally coordinated NH$_4$F phases simply have large enough cavities to host small guest species. There is no evidence for significant host-guest interactions, with the integrated COHP between neighbouring N and H$_2$ sites having values of less than 0.02 eV.
Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

C. Expanding Chemical Space: \( \text{NH}_3\text{-HF Binary Compounds} \)

Ammonium fluoride is the end member of a large family of ammonia-fluoride compounds. The \( \text{NH}_4\text{F–HF} \) binary system and structures comprising this system have been studied experimentally by at least three generations of scientists, mostly using differential thermal analysis (DTA)\(^{68–72} \) and suggesting stable or metastable compounds for \( n = 1 – 5 \) and \( n = 7 \). Continuing with the ice analogy theme, this corresponds to traversing the chemical space \( \text{H}_2\text{O}_{1+x} \) from \( x = 0 \) (water, at \( n = 0 \)) to \( x = 1 \) (hydrogen peroxide, at \( n \to \infty \)). Arguably the analogy becomes more stoichiometric rather than chemically significant. In the \( \text{H}_2\text{O–H}_2\text{O}_2 \) binary system a stable structure of hydrogen peroxide dihydrate has been observed\(^{73–75} \) and attracted renewed interest since the discovery of \( \text{H}_2\text{O}_2 \) on Jupiter’s icy moon Europa.\(^{76–78} \) Within the present \( \text{NH}_4\text{F(HF)}_n \) analogy, the \( \text{H}_2\text{O}_2 \) dihydrate corresponds to \( n = 2 \). So far, there has been no comprehensive computational study on the \( \text{NH}_4\text{F(HF)}_n \) structures, and there have been even fewer studies involving pressure, which may provide new synthesis pathways for these compounds.

This is of interest as polyhalides have a wide range of applications. Polyfluorides in particular are used in drug design and to form fluorocarbons such as PTFE.\(^{79} \) Metal fluorides are a good candidate for next generation high energy density battery cells\(^{80} \) where ammonium fluoride has been used in the synthesis process.\(^{81} \) A related class of compounds are hydrogen halide halogenates of the form \( [\text{X(HX)}_n]^– \). The salts found in the \( \text{NH}_4\text{F–HF} \) system will give rise to several hydrogen fluorides consisting of a large positive charge on the hydrogen and negative charge on the fluorine atoms. A well-known example of this is the \( [\text{HF}_2]^– \) molecule, wherein the central hydrogen is bonded symmetrically to both fluorines with mixed covalent and hydrogen bond character.\(^{82} \) The higher fluorides form anion clusters consisting of a central fluorine with strong hydrogen bonds to surrounding hydrogen fluoride molecules.

Experimentally, the melting diagram of the \( \text{NH}_4\text{F(HF)}_n \) binary\(^{68} \) was studied by Ruff and Otto in 1933. They found HF-rich compounds to be stable up to around 290 K for \( n = 1, 2, 3 \) and 5. In 1961, Euler and Westrum repeated the study, only to find stable phases at \( n = 1, 3 \) and 5.\(^{69} \) And in 1984, Mootz and Poll found \( n = 3, 4 \) and 7,\(^{70} \) supported by XRD measurements that provided crystal structures for these solid phases. There is some discrepancy between these three generations of experiments, which are summarized in Figure 6a. Only two phases are found consistently, \( n = 1 \) and \( n = 3 \), whereas the others are particular to each experiment. This sensitivity could indicate that the observed compounds at \( n = 2, 4, 5 \) and 7 may be in fact metastable at these
Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

FIG. 6. Ground state energetics of the NH₄F–HF system. a) Experimental composition phase diagrams adapted from 68–70. Black lines mark phases seen in all experiments, to the highest measured melt temperature. Solid compositions NH₄F(HF)ₙ include n = 1 – 5 and 7. b) Calculated convex hulls of relative formation enthalpies of NH₄F–HF compounds. The structures are of the form (NH₄)⁺(HₙFₙ⁺₁)⁻ where n is given along vertical dashed lines. c) Calculated ground state phase diagram as a function of pressure. Stable phases are coloured lines and metastable phases (less than 10 meV removed from the convex hull) are thin black lines.

conditions or that impurities in the sample stabilise (or destabilise) selected compounds.

An ab-initio calculation on isolated (HₙFₙ⁺₁)⁻ polyfluoride clusters with n = 1 – 4 suggests the stable configurations of isolated anions are linear, angular, planar trigonal and tetrahedral, respectively, 83 all forming globular hydrogen-bonded clusters centred around an F⁻ anion. The H-bond dissociation energy decreases with increasing cluster size, such that a n = 6 anion would reportedly be unstable against decomposition into (H₄F₅)⁻·HF. Another ab-initio study considers some specific configurations of the n = 6 and 7 clusters. 84 Amongst the known NH₄F(HF)ₙ structures, 70 all stable fluoride clusters appear, except for the angular (H₂F₃)⁻ anion (for n = 2) that is missing. The n = 2 polyfluoride corresponds to the only known stoichiometric composition in the analogous H₂O–H₂O₂ system. Under pressure, however, new compositions may become stable, paving new routes to fluorine chemistry.

Here, we explored the full NH₃–HF chemical space with unbiased structure searching at 30 and
Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

50 GPa at 1:6, 1:5, 1:4, 1:3, 1:2, 1:1, 2:1 and 3:1 compositions, generating over 6000 candidate structures. We note that apart from a previously known ammonia rich structure, \((N_2H_7)(F)^{85}\), which we calculate to be stable up to 4 GPa, no other \(NH_3\)-rich structures appear on or close to the convex hull. Therefore, we focus on the fluoride-rich \(NH_4F-HF\) phase diagram. Convex hulls at specific pressures are shown in Figure 6b and the phase stability chart in Figure 6c. Vibrational entropy effects, shown for a representative pressure in Figure S6 in the SM, do not qualitatively change the convex hull.

Relative formation enthalpies of the polyfluorides \(n = 1–3\) are shown in Figure 7. In ammonium bifluoride \((NH_4)(HF_2)\) \((n = 1)\), a pressure-induced phase transition was reported, from the known orthorhombic phase I (space group \(Pm\)) to an unknown structure - labelled phase III - around 5-10 GPa.\(^72\) We reproduce the stability of phase I at low pressures. The central structural motif for phase I is of tetrahedral ammonium cations hydrogen-bonded to four \((HF_2)^-\) anions, see Figure 8. Connecting neighbouring fluoride ions reveals a layered two-dimensional motif consisting of tessellating squares and triangles, where the squares are formed of F-F neighbours and the triangles are formed of F-F neighbours and bridging hydrogens in the F-H-F bonds. At 10 GPa, we predict a transition from phase I to a monoclinic structure with \(P2_1/c\) symmetry, which we propose as the structure of phase III. This structure is best understood as a sheared distortion of a tetragonal parent structure \(P42m\) that is metastable at low pressures (see Figure 7a, and also shown in Figure 8). The phase III structure consists of layers of \((NH_4)^+\) and \((HF_2)^-\) ions, the latter aligned along the \(c\) axis. Under pressure, this structure becomes unstable towards a shear strain between layers, and in the optimised structure, the \((HF_2)^-\) ions are tilted, see Figure 8. The \(P2_1/c\) structure is dynamically stable; phonon dispersions are shown in Figure S10 in the SM. This new phase III is not expected to survive much further under continued compression: beyond 15 GPa, a 1:1 mixture of \(NH_4F-III\) and HF is most stable. All relevant \((NH_4)(HF_2)\) structures retain the structural motifs of phase I, in particular the linear \((HF_2)^-\) anion (in line with most of the biflourides except \(Rb\cdot HF_2\)),\(^71\) but differ in the packing arrangements.

The \((NH_4)(H_2F_3)\) \((n = 2)\) compound has only been seen in historical DTA experiments,\(^68\) but may be at least metastable at ambient conditions. Our structure searches reveal the compound can be stabilised above 6 GPa in a \(Pca2_1\) structure before decomposing at 15.5 GPa to \((NH_4)F + 2(HF)\), see Figure 7b. This structure forms an ionic crystal made from hydrogen-bonded chains of \(NH_4\cdot F\cdot H\cdot F\cdot H\cdot F\cdot H_4N\). The central anion, \(F_3H_2\) is similar to that seen in \(Na^+(H_2F_3)^-\),\(^86\), although the overall structure is different. The structure is dynamically stable, see the phonon
Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

FIG. 7. Enthalpy values as a function of pressure for the NH₄F(HₙFₙ₊₁) compounds a) (NH₄F)⁺(HF₂)⁻, b) (NH₄F)(H₂F₃), c) (NH₄F)(H₃F₄).

FIG. 8. Crystal structures for HF-rich mixtures NH₄F(HF)ₙ, labelled by n and space group. Some structural motifs highlighted by thin pink lines connection neighbouring fluorine atoms.
Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

dispersions in Figure S10 in the SM and, like the bifluoride phase III predicted above for \( n = 1 \), is a wide-gap insulator, see the electronic densities of states in Figure S11 in the SM.

For \((\text{NH}_4)(\text{H}_3\text{F}_4)\) \((n = 3)\), the experimental \(R3c\) structure is confirmed in our calculations to be stable from 0 GPa up to around 6 GPa, see Figure 7c. Our structure searches reveal a monoclinic structure (space group \(Cm\)) that supersedes the \(R3c\) structure at 7.5 GPa. In contrast to the other known hydrogen fluoride salts, this structure has both an HF\(_2\) anion and HF molecule. Increased pressure likely reduces the space available to form the globular arrangements seen in the other structures. However, the \(Cm\) phase turns out to be metastable against the newly predicted \(n = 2\) compound discussed in the previous paragraph above 6 GPa, which suggests that the missing \(n = 2\) compound could be synthesized along a secondary route, either by starting from the \(n = 1\) compound in the presence of extra HF or directly from compressing the \(n = 3\) compound.

Overall, for the higher fluorides \((n = 3, 4, 7)\) the \(\text{NH}_4\text{F}-\text{HF}\) binary phase diagram shown in Figure 6 agrees with experimental findings, as all of the known \((\text{NH}_4)(\text{H}_3\text{F}_4),(\text{NH}_4)(\text{H}_4\text{F}_5)\) and \((\text{NH}_4)(\text{H}_7\text{F}_8)\) structures are at least metastable at ambient pressure conditions. Figure S6 in the SM shows relative Gibbs free energies for the \(\text{NH}_4\text{F}-\text{HF}\) binary at 10 GPa. Finite temperature effects do not impact stability significantly; ZPE stabilise the \((\text{NH}_4)(\text{H}_3\text{F}_4)-Cm\) structure against decomposition at \(T=0\) K, but not at room temperature. The SM further contains more detailed analyses of the chemical bonding in these phases, in particular within the anionic \(\text{H}_n\text{F}_{n+1}\) clusters. Under pressure these higher fluorides are destabilised, likely due to the presence of the large anionic clusters. Instead, the missing stoichiometry \(n = 2\), \((\text{NH}_4)(\text{H}_2\text{F}_3)\), becomes stable. This compound is the analogue to \((\text{H}_2\text{O})_2\cdot(\text{H}_2\text{O}_2)\), the only known stoichiometric hydrogen peroxide hydrate. The fact that this compound is so much less stable than several other polyfluorides, and stable only at high pressure, illustrates again how much weaker the analogy of ammonia fluorides and ice has become in this expanded chemical space.

IV. CONCLUSION

In summary, we have explored here how far the analogy of ammonium fluoride, \(\text{NH}_4\text{F}\), to water ice, \(\text{H}_2\text{O}\), holds. To this end, we have studied the high-pressure phase diagram of \(\text{NH}_4\text{F}\), examined its suitability to act as a host network to small molecular guest species, and expanded into the full \(\text{NH}_3-\text{HF}\) chemical space. Crystal structure prediction with density functional theory calculations was supplemented by detailed analyses of electronic structures and chemical bonding.
Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

While at typical pressures studied experimentally, NH$_4$F shares features of water ice, there are a few differences as pressure increases. Firstly, the topological restrictions on allowed NH$_4$F structures limit the number of potential ice analogues. Secondly, H$_2$O ice eventually, between 60 and 100 GPa, forms symmetrised hydrogen bonds in the ice VIII $\to$ ice X transition. Such a symmetrisation is not possible for NH$_4$F. Both limitations have consequences for the NH$_4$F phase diagram, deviating from water’s phase diagram at high pressures. Indeed, we find that the ice VII analogue NH$_4$F-III gives way, around 80 GPa, to close-packed structures that break the network topology restrictions against like ion nearest neighbours, and where N-H-$\cdots$F hydrogen bonding is less significant. Nonetheless we find that NH$_4$F remains a molecular solid and stable against decomposition up to at least 300 GPa.

We furthermore show that NH$_4$F can form stable host-guest hydride compounds of the form (NH$_4$F)$_m$(H$_2$)$_n$, where the NH$_4$F host networks are analogous to those of hydrogen hydrates. Similar constraints as discussed above affect the NH$_4$F–H$_2$ systems, which is topologically forbidden to form the S$_X$, CS-I or CS-II host networks. While an NH$_4$F doped H$_2$O CS-I cage has been studied,$^{25}$ it remains to be seen if NH$_4$F rich compounds could form with H$_2$O doping and how dramatically the phase diagram will change as a result. The hydrogen bond symmetrisation predicted in hydrogen hydrate C$_3$ at high pressures is also not feasible. The ammonium fluoride hydride (NH$_4$F)(H$_2$)$_2$ in the C$_3$ analogue structure does not appear to be stable at any pressure, possibly for this reason. However, structural analogues of ice I$_h$, C$_1$, and C$_2$ hydrogen hydrates emerge as stable, and in the same pressure sequence and roughly the same pressure scale as in the hydrogen hydrates.

Finally, we explore the NH$_3$–HF binary system, which (chemically) corresponds to the H$_2$O–H$_2$O$_2$ binary system. While the former is very rich, the latter features a single stoichiometric mixture, 1:2. Its equivalent here, ammonium bifluoride, had not been identified unambiguously in experiments. We show here that ammonium bifluoride becomes stable at pressures accessible to high-pressure syntheses. In addition we present a structural candidate for the previously unresolved high-pressure phase of (NH$_4$)(HF)$_2$. With increasing HF content these polyfluorides show an intriguing evolution of anionic H$_n$F$_{n+1}$ cluster structures dominated by hydrogen bonding.

The relation and analogies between NH$_4$F and water ice remain complex. On one side, we have shown here that NH$_4$F can form filled ice-like host-guest structures very similar to the hydrate equivalents. On the other side, at high pressures, NH$_4$F departs remarkably from the structural trends seen in ice. And lastly, there are chemical avenues available to NH$_4$F; such as continous ad-
Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

dition of HF, that are very interesting in their own right, without immediately obvious connections to the physics or chemistry of water.

V. SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIAL

See the supplementary material for results from other exchange-correlation functionals and dispersion correction schemes; Gibbs free energy analyses; phonon dispersions for all new structures; tabulated COHP data; partial electronic DOS and ELF data; further electronic structure and bonding analyses; and crystal structure information for all new structures.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

L.J.C. and K.B. were supported by the UK’s EPSRC through the Condensed Matter Centre for Doctoral Training (EP/ L015110/1). Computational resources provided by the UK’s National Supercomputer Service through the UK Car-Parrinello consortium (EP/P022561/1) and project ID d56 ‘Planetary Interiors’ and by the UK Materials and Molecular Modelling Hub (EP/P020194) are gratefully acknowledged.

DATA AVAILABILITY

The data that support the findings of this study are openly available in the Edinburgh DataShare at http://dx.doi.org/xxxx.

REFERENCES

Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice

Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice


Ammonium fluoride’s analogy to ice