



THE UNIVERSITY *of* EDINBURGH

Edinburgh Research Explorer

To achieve "zero covid" we need to include the controlled, careful acquisition of population (herd) immunity

Citation for published version:

Bhopal, RS 2020, 'To achieve "zero covid" we need to include the controlled, careful acquisition of population (herd) immunity', *BMJ (Clinical research ed.)*, vol. 370, pp. m3487.
<https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.m3487>

Digital Object Identifier (DOI):

[10.1136/bmj.m3487](https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.m3487)

Link:

[Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer](#)

Document Version:

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Published In:

BMJ (Clinical research ed.)

General rights

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy

The University of Edinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact openaccess@ed.ac.uk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.





Edinburgh Migration, Ethnicity, and Health Research Group, Usher Institute, Medical School, University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh EH8 9AG, UK

raj.bhopal@ed.ac.uk

Cite this as: *BMJ* 2020;370:m3487

<http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/bmj.m3487>

Published: 9 September 2020

AIMING FOR “ZERO COVID”

To achieve “zero covid” we need to include the controlled, careful acquisition of population (herd) immunity

Raj S Bhopal *emeritus professor of public health*

Torjesen asks whether the UK should aim for zero covid.¹ Of course it should, but how? My suggested strategy includes herd immunity, which I rename population immunity given the antipathy to the word herd, evoking animals.²

On 7 April 2020 Martin McKee wrote to the covid-19 global researchers email group “seeking sensible thoughts about coming out of lockdown.” I responded with an eight point plan, the last point being that in the absence of a vaccine we should allow young people under 30, particularly women, to get the infection voluntarily, preferably in controlled circumstances. This kind of approach has been conceptualised and modelled by others.³⁻⁵ McKee replied that it was good to think out of the box. But this is already happening in unplanned and haphazard ways.⁶ Letting the pandemic unfold uncontrolled is not public health strategy.²

I suggest population immunity as part of a comprehensive response.² I estimate that about 40-50% population immunity would be sufficient to suppress an infection with a reproduction number of about 1 or slightly more, which requires continuing, reasonable control measures. Others consider this proportion to be much lower.⁷ Allowing infection in people at low risk is justifiable if we make it safer for them than allowing it to occur uncontrolled.²

Covid-19 is currently rarely fatal in children and young people, less so than influenza for which we already have a vaccine. Showing that a vaccine is safer than covid-19 in young people is, therefore, tough.^{8,9}

Public debate, including on population immunity through both natural infection and future vaccination, is urgent.² My paper has been covered in national and international media with huge support from public and professionals. My views have been interrogated in detailed interviews by Wired (https://youtu.be/l1FFKT_VZ5c) and Contagion (<https://youtu.be/VbU6FYrnG8U>).

Population immunity through a mixture of vaccination and natural infection is the only long term solution for zero covid.²

Competing interests: None declared.

Full response at: <https://www.bmj.com/content/370/bmj.m3071/rr>.

1 Torjesen I. Covid-19: Should the UK be aiming for elimination? *BMJ* 2020;370:m3071. doi: 10.1136/bmj.m3071 pmid: 32747404

2 Bhopal RS. COVID-19 zugzwang: Potential public health moves towards population (herd) immunity. *Public Health in Practice*. 2020;1:doi: 10.1016/j.puhip.2020.100031.

3 Smith GD, Spiegelhalter D. Shielding from covid-19 should be stratified by risk. *BMJ* 2020;369:m2063. doi: 10.1136/bmj.m2063 pmid: 32467287

4 McKeigue PM, Colhoun HM. Evaluation of “stratify and shield” as a policy option for ending the COVID-19 lockdown in the UK. *MedRxiv* 2020.04.25.20079913 [Preprint]. 2020. <https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2020.04.25.20079913v1>

5 Van Bunnik BAD, Morgan ALK, Bessell P, et al. Segmentation and shielding of the most vulnerable members of the population as elements of an exit strategy from COVID-19 lockdown. *MedRxiv* 2020.05.04.20090597 [Preprint]. 2020. <https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2020.05.04.20090597v1>

6 COVID-19 in Brazil: “So what?”. *Lancet* 2020;395:1461. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(20)31095-3 pmid: 32386576

7 Lourenco J, Pinotti F, Thompson C, Gupta S. The impact of host resistance on cumulative mortality and the threshold of herd immunity for SARS-CoV-2. *MedRxiv* 2020.07.15.20154294 [Preprint]. 2020. <https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2020.07.15.20154294v1>

8 Bhopal S, Bagaria J, Bhopal R. Children’s mortality from COVID-19 compared with all-deaths and other relevant causes of death: epidemiological information for decision-making by parents, teachers, clinicians and policymakers. *Public Health* 2020;185:19-20. doi: 10.1016/j.puhe.2020.05.047 pmid: 32516623

9 Bhopal S, Olabi B, Bagaria J, Bhopal R. COVID-19 deaths in children: comparison with all- and other causes and trends in incidence of mortality. *Public Health* 2020; doi: 10.1016/j.puhe.2020.08.022.

10 Bhopal R. “Zero-COVID”: to achieve it we need to broaden our thinking to include the controlled and careful acquisition of population immunity [electronic response to Torjesen. Covid-19: Should the UK be aiming for elimination?]. *BMJ* 2020. <https://www.bmj.com/content/370/bmj.m3071/rr>

This article is made freely available for use in accordance with BMJ’s website terms and conditions for the duration of the covid-19 pandemic or until otherwise determined by BMJ. You may use, download and print the article for any lawful, non-commercial purpose (including text and data mining) provided that all copyright notices and trade marks are retained.