



THE UNIVERSITY *of* EDINBURGH

## Edinburgh Research Explorer

### Closing the Door on Modern Scotland's Gilded Cage

**Citation for published version:**

Griffiths, T & Morton, G 2013, 'Closing the Door on Modern Scotland's Gilded Cage', *The Scottish Historical Review*, vol. 92, pp. 49-69. <https://doi.org/10.3366/shr.2013.0167>

**Digital Object Identifier (DOI):**

[10.3366/shr.2013.0167](https://doi.org/10.3366/shr.2013.0167)

**Link:**

[Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer](#)

**Document Version:**

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

**Published In:**

The Scottish Historical Review

**Publisher Rights Statement:**

© Griffiths, T., & Morton, G. (2013). Closing the Door on Modern Scotland's Gilded Cage. *Scottish Historical Review*, 92, 49-69doi: 10.3366/shr.2013.0167

**General rights**

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

**Take down policy**

The University of Edinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact [openaccess@ed.ac.uk](mailto:openaccess@ed.ac.uk) providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



GRAEME MORTON and TREVOR GRIFFITHS

## Closing the Door on Modern Scotland's Gilded Cage

### *Part I: 1800 to 1900*

Writing in 1994 for the *SHR*, Morris and Morton's historiographical survey of modern Scotland was a tag-team grappling match with the gilded cage of the nation. They explored how historians had deployed the concept of nation when capturing the nineteenth-century past. They asked could, and should, national history be written through comparison with the historical development of England, reading off one nation against the other. For historians it seemed straightforward to assume that before our eyes lay the nation, standing unambiguously distinct from other nations. After all, nation, state and ethnicity bind the standard paradigm of narrative history.<sup>1</sup> Published at a time when the arguments against devolution were dissolving, their approach reflected the prevailing civic mobilisation of an historically specific reading of the democratic nation.<sup>2</sup> The authors observed the key survey literature: noting that Smout's Scottish people had swapped a *History* for a *Century*; it seemed a downgrading. Five years on, the Holyrood parliament opened to the strains of 'A man's a man for a' that' as the firm riposte from a galvanised civil society to a long mourned democratic deficit. Scotland had regained its parliament. For Devine in 1999 the container ship was again the *Nation*. With the title, might we ask, had nothing changed; had the cage of thinking automatically in terms of the nation been re-gilded?<sup>3</sup>

Conceptually the 'nation' was a definite entity in the century from 1800. The rise of its political form dates to the three decades before the time period considered in this survey. The same era also witnessed the

<sup>1</sup> R. J. Morris & Graeme Morton, 'Where was nineteenth-century Scotland?', *SHR* 74 (1994) 89–99. Our thanks go to Bob Morris for observations on an earlier draft of this paper.

<sup>2</sup> A. Henderson, *Hierarchies of Belonging: National Identity and Political Culture in Scotland and Quebec* (Montreal and Kingston, 2007); G. Morton, 'The moral foundations of constitutional change in Canada and Scotland at the end of the twentieth century', *International Review of Scottish Studies* 33 (2008) 87–122.

<sup>3</sup> T. C. Smout, *A Century of the Scottish People: Scotland 1830–1950* (London, 1986; reissued, 2010); T. M. Devine, *The Scottish Nation: 1700–2000* (London, 1999), 3–21.

development of the expectation that the nation's normal condition was to be wedded to the state. Out of the hybridised constructions flowing from Enlightenment's rationalism and Romanticism's *Heimat*, through the commercial-industrial interplay that strapped the interests of the people so closely to the pursuit of imperial-commercial projects, the political nation took its bow.<sup>4</sup> Yet for all this apparent coherence, the continued lack of a single or bounded definition of nation cannot be hidden from historical analyses. Increasingly and decisively theorists have tied the concept of nation to social praxis, with outcomes as varied as the examples inputted.<sup>5</sup> These investigations do not deny that comparable trends and conceptual commonalities can be discerned, but confirm that analytical purchase depends on empirical and conceptual flexibility.

To reflect on current historiographical trends, we have chosen to question, for the nineteenth century at least, whether the concept of nation needs repositing. The bringing of men into the decision making process of the state—adult suffrage—and the mobilisation of male subjects to fight war are two heavily cited examples of nation and state coherence. But in other instances, many in fact, might we muse that the national muse needs a fresh examination? Concepts work best when they are inelastic. And while it remains the case that Scotland lies within Western traditions of nationalism that once aspired to match political territory and state, such aspirations have been undermined by the empirical absence of unitary nation-states. This Western tradition has been compelled to move on, progressed conceptually and empirically beyond state building towards an elastic interplay of self, society and politics. Nationalism, and from it the concept of nation, is generally presented as the product of a portable identity that is variously conveyed through literary and community imagination, a 'banal' presence in daily life, and countless acts of personal, imaginative construction.<sup>6</sup> The tenor of these approaches, Cohen's especially, is that nationalist discourse is appropriated and personalized by the Scots in ways that best fit their life course. Dialectically formed, the concept of nation exists as the objective

<sup>4</sup> G. H. Herb and D. H. Kaplan, *Nations and Nationalism: A Global Historical Overview*, vol. 1 1770 to 1880 (Santa Barbara, 2008), xvii–xx, 1–42, 59–71, 126–136.

<sup>5</sup> D. McCrone, *The Sociology of Nationalism: Tomorrow's Ancestors* (London, 1998).

<sup>6</sup> J. Hearn, 'National identity: banal, personal and embedded', *Nations and Nationalism* 13 (2007), 657–674; B. Anderson, *Imagined Communities*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edn. (London, 2006); M. Billig, *Banal Nationalism* (London, 1995); J. M. MacKenzie, 'Empire and national identities: the case of Scotland', *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society* 6th series, 8 (1998) 215–32; A. P. Cohen, 'Personal nationalism: a Scottish view of some rites, rights, and wrongs', *American Ethnologist* 23 (1996) 802–815; A. P. Cohen, 'Peripheral Vision: nationalism, national identity and the objective correlative in Scotland', in A. P. Cohen (ed.), *Signifying Identities: Anthropological Perspectives on Boundaries and Contest Values* (London, 2000); A. Ichijo, *Scottish Nationalism and the Idea of Europe* (London, 2004).

correlative within which people define themselves as individuals.<sup>7</sup> Accordingly, by working within these conceptual insights, current scholarship roots the nation in the dynamism of people's lives within and across borders, not confined by geography of state structures, and within economic and political divisions simultaneously supra- and infra-national. If the Scottish nation means the Scots' community of place, then *ipso facto* it is to the Scots we should focus.

While this interplay of self, society and politics might seem an unwelcome muddying of the nation-state boundaries it is, to our thinking, a development that fits well the experience of one of Europe's greatest emigrant nations, where to 'be Scottish' meant to breach routinely national confines. And while we argue that the historian's conceptual use of nation remains slow to embrace this point, the empiricists have offered increasingly extensive support for not just Scottish national identity, but also nationalism that lies beyond political borders. Post Kilbrandon (the Royal Commission on the Constitution which reported in 1973), historians went 'in search of Scotland' the geo-politically bounded nation; a concept furthered in common cause as 'the 1707 nation' throughout the next two decades of constitutional reflection; to then be expedited by a slew of publications marking the tercentenary of Union. Having reached the ridge of the '1707-2007 nation', how long before the narrative of Hegira, the Scots who left for *The Ends of the Earth*, reconfigures the conceptual nation?<sup>8</sup>

### *Surveying the land*

On balance we suggest that rather than any single paradigm shift being identifiable since 1994, Scotland's historiography has undergone a recalibration of older debates. The door to the gilded cage here stands ajar. The fragmentation of essays then identified by Morris and Morton as a hindrance to understanding Scotland's history is not an argument we would like to pursue here. It has clearly not worried some of our major publishers who have produced authoritative anthologies dealing with modern Scotland in ways that give credence to the bounded national paradigm.<sup>9</sup> Often overlooked when reflecting upon *The New Penguin History of Scotland*, is the weight given to the modern period in a survey from the earliest times. Three of its eight extended essays cover post-1832 Scotland, jointly conceiving national history through the supporting concepts of civil society, social structure, and political realignment—it is little wonder that the publisher chose modern monuments to Bruce and Wallace to adorn

<sup>7</sup> Hearn, 'National Identity', 663–4; Cohen, 'Peripheral Vision', 163–7; McCrone, *Sociology of Nationalism*, 7–8, 21.

<sup>8</sup> T. M. Devine, *To the Ends of the Earth: Scotland's Global Diaspora* (London, 2011), 12–14.

<sup>9</sup> I. Brown, T. O. Clancy, S. Manning, M. Pittock (eds), *The Edinburgh History of Scottish Literature. Volume Two: Enlightenment, Britain and Empire (1707–1918)* (Edinburgh, 2007).

its cover.<sup>10</sup> Nor has working within the bounded nation hindered the discipline's willingness to focus on economic, social and cultural history, including events involving Scots outside their national boundaries. Under Wormald's tutelage, *Scotland: A History* eschewed the national moniker to cover the nineteenth century in Hutchison's 'Workshop of Empire' and period wide in Armitage's 'The Scottish Diaspora'.<sup>11</sup> After the demise of cotton, Hutchison explains, it was shipbuilding and the technical developments around it that were central to the expansion of the Scottish economy. Lowland *and* Highland agricultural change; cultural *and* political realignment, in rural *and* urban communities: all were relationships under transformation where the antecedents of the twentieth-century's economic malaise began despite headline strength achieved in 1913's record year of shipbuilding on the Clyde.

Within the rubric of nation, Hutchison shows the heterogeneity of people's lives under the broader ink of major structural movements. Two series on Scotland's everyday life, appearing almost simultaneously, has similarly worked away from the politics of nation to better understand routine and mundane life *in* the nation. The ethnological approach of Alexander Fenton guided the multi-volume *Scottish Life and Society* series into print.<sup>12</sup> The approach of the two modern volumes of *Everyday Life in Scotland* differs not just for the imperatives of two quite different centuries, but also in their use of theory. The nineteenth century volume drilled down to the everyday from larger institutional, cultural, and structural processes.<sup>13</sup> The pressure of time—at work and in the home—the experience of religion within and outside the church, and the struggle to put food on the kitchen table and coal in the grate, were part of Scots' daily endeavours. Pushing this conceptual approach further, cleaving the humanities onto the social sciences, social anthropology in particular, came in the twentieth century volume edited by Abrams and Brown. By perceiving of economic and social history in terms of the everyday, these series moved beyond national economics and politics to give due weight to evidence delimited and carried by nothing less structural than people themselves.

Within the current historiography, explorations of the interplay between social structure and agency continue to hold sway but national boundaries are made permeable. Scholars have placed the Scottish nation within a range of international crosscurrents: Kidd, for example, employed both the geographical and temporal *longue durée* to study

<sup>10</sup> R. A. Houston and W. W. J. Knox (eds), *The New Penguin History of Scotland: From the Earliest Times to the Present Day* (London, 2001).

<sup>11</sup> I. G. C. Hutchison's 'Workshop of Empire: the nineteenth century', 209–240, and D. Armitage, 'The Scottish Diaspora', 274–303, both in J. Wormald (ed.), *Scotland: A History* (Oxford, 2005).

<sup>12</sup> *Scottish Life and Society: A Compendium of Scottish Ethnology*, 14 vols. (Edinburgh, 2000–2009).

<sup>13</sup> T. Griffiths and G. Morton (eds), *A History of Everyday Life in Scotland, 1800 to 1900* (Edinburgh, 2010).

the language of race.<sup>14</sup> In a reassessment of the Chartist movement, the challenge Fraser faced was not simply that Scotland was different (more 'moral' in its actions) than England, but by questioning the standard accounts he finds less passivity in the movement north of the border than reading off one nation against the other would suggest.<sup>15</sup> In a similar vein the two leading religious historians of modern Scotland, C. G. Brown and S. J. Brown, have moved their respective surveys onto a British plane, no longer content to view the people's ecclesiastical beliefs from the front pew of the local kirk.<sup>16</sup> Nor can the deeply Scottish concern of Disruption in the Kirk be pinpointed simply as national bellwether. Further splintering, as explored in MacLeod's analysis of the Free Church's own disruption in 1893, and Kehoe's presentation of the institutionalised faith of Roman Catholicism as a Scottish church, foregrounding the role of women-religious in the spread of religiosity, shows personal devotion over institutional politicking in the Scots' (rather than the nation's) beliefs.<sup>17</sup> Each reads of the 'daily plebiscite' of personal identity that is ported across, beyond, and into the geo-political nation by the movement of people.

#### *The 1707 Nation*

While there has been such willingness to bleed the people's history out from the political margins, Scotland the 1707 nation was captured most completely in the lead up to the three hundredth anniversary of Union. Published under the auspices of the British Academy, Smout's collection on Anglo-Scottish relations offered two chapters for the modern period.<sup>18</sup> In the first, Thomas Carlyle frames an eloquent example of a Scotsman's encounters with England, the metropolis in particular, shaped through the words he coined and brought before an audience in his lectures. This essay speaks to the analytical place of biography and personal nationalism within national historical studies. While surveying a period with four Prime Ministers of Scottish descent, Hutchison highlights the break-down of the divide between the two nations, interaction confirmed in the dominance of British political issues with only limited exceptions, notably the Disruption in the Kirk and the Highland land crisis of the 1880s. Contemporaries questioned

<sup>14</sup> C. Kidd, *The Forging of Races: Race and Scripture in the Protestant Atlantic World, 1600–2000* (Cambridge, 2006).

<sup>15</sup> W. Hamish Fraser, *Chartism in Scotland* (Pontypool, 2010).

<sup>16</sup> C. G. Brown, *The Death of Christian Britain: Understanding Secularisation, 1800–2000* (London, 2001); S. J. Brown, *Providence and Empire: Religion, Politics and Society in the United Kingdom, 1815–1914* (London, 2008).

<sup>17</sup> J. L. MacLeod, *The Second Disruption: The Free Church in Victorian Scotland and Origins of the Free Presbyterian Church* (East Linton, 2000); S. Karly Kehoe, *Creating a Scottish Church: Catholicism, Gender and Ethnicity in Nineteenth-Century Scotland* (Manchester, 2010).

<sup>18</sup> R. Ashton, 'Anglo-Scottish Relations: the Carlyles in London', and I. G. C. Hutchison, 'Anglo-Scottish Political Relations in the Nineteenth Century, c.1815–1914', both in T. C. Smout (ed.), *Anglo-Scottish Relations from 1603–1900* (London & Oxford, 2005).

their nation at the level of Scottish rights, then in terms of local and national state intervention; in each case, the British head was to remain on the Scottish body politic.

These debates augment the scholarly endeavour that has charted the Union's trajectory in Scottish life and politics. McLean and McMillan have analysed the ideological sway of Unionism; Kidd has further explored the Union's philosophical hold: Macdonald its historical antecedents; Morton its sociological underpinning; and Pentland its place within franchise debate.<sup>19</sup> Others have tracked debate in party political terms, traversing the high road and low road to devolution, engaging in a mix of historical, literary and political analyses.<sup>20</sup> They lie in contrast to the administrative trail followed by Mitchell who shows epochal change coming from prosaic evolution.<sup>21</sup> Scholars have then explored whether devolution delivered. Here the sociologists and political scientists have used a range of survey data to determine *A New Scotland* or *A New Society*.<sup>22</sup> Taken together, the 1707 nation was confirmed in the complexity of the political and social oscillations revealed. And with matching confidence that the 'search for Scotland' was resolved, the editor's intention for *Scotland and the Union* was not only to re-evaluate the 1707 bargain at specific points in time, but also to offer sustained analysis of its unbroken history up to and beyond devolution in 1999.<sup>23</sup> Here the thesis underpinning the nineteenth-century chapters (at least) is carried by Scotland's engagement with empire: sojourning abroad, tales of great men, especially military men, are each analysed for bolstering nation-building at home. The regiments and the battling success of the soldier were influential narratives in the Scots' sense of 'self', replicated, by way of contrast, in the Scots' sense of 'place' as reported by societies dedicated to missionary work overseas.<sup>24</sup> Cameron takes on the political story of Unionism by stressing the respective timing of union with Ireland and

<sup>19</sup> I. McLean, A. McMillan, *State of the Union: Unionism and the Alternatives in the United Kingdom Since 1707* (Oxford, 2005); C. Kidd, *Union and Unionism: political thought in Scotland, 1500–2000* (Cambridge, 2008); C. M. M. Macdonald (ed.), *Unionist Scotland: 1800–1997* (Edinburgh, 1998); G. Morton, *Unionist-Nationalism: Governing Urban Scotland, 1830–1860* (East Linton, 1999); G. Morton, 'Identity within the Union State, 1800–1900', in T. M. Devine and J. Wormald (eds), *The Oxford Handbook of Modern Scottish History* (Oxford, 2012); G. Pentland, *Radicalism, Reform and National Identity in Scotland, 1820–1833* (Suffolk, 2008).

<sup>20</sup> T. Gallagher, *The Illusion of Freedom: Scotland under Nationalism* (New York, 2010); M. Pittock, *The Road to Independence: Scotland since the Sixties* (London, 2008); C. Harvie and P. Jones, *The Road to Home Rule* (Edinburgh, 2001).

<sup>21</sup> J. Mitchell, *Governing Scotland: The Invention of Administrative Devolution* (Basingstoke, 2003).

<sup>22</sup> C. Bromley, *Has Devolution Delivered?* (Edinburgh, 2006); L. Paterson et al, *New Scotland, New Politics?* (Edinburgh, 2001); J. Curtice, D. McCrone, A. Park and L. Paterson (eds), *New Scotland, New Society?: Are Social and Political Ties Fragmenting?* (Edinburgh, 2002).

<sup>23</sup> T. M. Devine (ed.), *Scotland and the Union, 1707–2007* (Edinburgh, 2008).

<sup>24</sup> E. Breitenbach, *Empire and Scottish Society: The Impact of Foreign Missions at Home, c.1800 to c.1914* (Edinburgh, 2009).

the Anglo-Scottish Union in the political mind-set of politicians and the people. A third section of *Scotland and the Union* is given over to the challenges of devolution for Scotland as a political nation within the United Kingdom and a fourth to the future gauged from electoral and social attitude surveys, each progressively closing the gap between nation and state.<sup>25</sup>

When, by way of contrast, nation and state are kept conceptually 'open'—as in Mitchell's stress on the union not unitary state—the analysis produces a political relationship in flux and one that joins rather than supplants a range of identity carriers.<sup>26</sup> Correspondingly an investigation into the Union's longevity—in distinction to other early-modern conglomerate unions elsewhere in the world—credits its adaptability.<sup>27</sup> Working within this rubric, McCrone highlights the absence of objective identity makers in Scotland. Instead the national frame of reference is one of interpretation, where differentiation between 'political' and 'social', 'parliament' and 'society', is persistently vague.<sup>28</sup> Just as the Union is no hard and fast constitutional arrangement, so the 1707 nation, as concept, is analysed as correspondingly compliant.<sup>29</sup>

As we have seen, the version of political Unionism formulated within Scotland's home rule debates, and in distinction to Ireland's claims for renewed parliamentary power, led contemporaries to mobilise Scotland's nationalism within the politics of Empire and against the backdrop of nation-building by the white colonies, an argument repeated by Finlay.<sup>30</sup> As a top-down approach to conceptualising the nation this thesis places Unionism at the heart of a Scottish frame of reference. Yet as we have also seen, statist conceptualisations of nationalism, and of the nation, have been overtaken. Scholars have moved understanding forward by assigning analytical fluidity to self, society and politics and by assigning analytical weight to the portability of national identity, creating the nation as an imagined (but not imaginary) place. As well, the conceptualization of the nation simply through political Unionism is unhelpfully narrow. Even if we were to set aside its disconnect from the Scottish nation, the nineteenth-century

<sup>25</sup> T. M. Devine, 'Imperial Scotland'; Ewen A Cameron, 'The politics of the Union in the age of Unionism'; T. M. Devine, 'The challenge of nationalism'; Richard J. Finlay, 'Thatcherism and the Union'; W. L. Miller 'The death of Unionism?'; Charlie Jeffery, 'Where Stands the Union Now?'; and John Curtice, 'How firm are the foundations?', all in Devine (ed.), *Scotland and the Union*.

<sup>26</sup> J. Mitchell, *Strategies for Self-Government: The Campaigns for a Scottish Parliament* (London, 1996).

<sup>27</sup> *Angles on the English-Speaking World* 7, 'The State of the Union, 1707–2007', eds. J. Seveltsen and J. Rahbek Rasmussen (Copenhagen, 2007).

<sup>28</sup> D. McCrone, 'State, Society and Nation: The Problem of Scotland', in *Angles on the English-Speaking World*.

<sup>29</sup> A. Raffe, '1707, 2007 and the unionist turn in Scottish history', *The Historical Journal* 53 (2010) 1071–1083.

<sup>30</sup> R. J. Finlay, 'National identity, Union, and Empire, c.1850-c.1970', in J. M. MacKenzie and T. M. Devine (eds), *Scotland and the British Empire* (Oxford, 2011).

British state contributed to Othering the Scots: Scottish women and children did not vote for their politicians, and most adult men were not enfranchised until the twentieth century. Of obvious concern is that both gender history and labour history are marginalized by the historian's emphasis on Unionism's 1707 nation, although work by Abrams et al, Gordon and Nair, and Ewan et al is representative of major revisions already in place.<sup>31</sup> For to be plain, the evidence confines historians to the conclusion that the political frame of reference sustained no more than a limited nationalist narrative of state-building, and only for some Scots. Whereas when projected (amongst other frameworks) within Presbyterianism, the near diaspora in Ulster, and the trade, settlement and military engagement of Empire, Unionism did augment the objective correlative within which the Scots reflected their personal nationalism. But without identifying and linking correctly to the many vehicles that conveyed nationalism and national identity, Unionism remains a weak indicator of the nation. Indeed, if the aim is to delineate the Scottish nation within the union state of 1800 to 1900, then a number of social structures could be called upon, civil society most notably. The national concept, we recall, directs analysis to the history of the Scottish people when not constrained by their constituency boundaries, both in imagination and in praxis. By refusing to ignore the two million Scots (neither delimited by gender or age) who left Scotland in the decades from 1830 to 1914, totaling around forty-two percent of the 1911 population, we encounter many more lives than those whose national self was marked at the ballot box. However and by whomever it was imagined, the nineteenth-century nation was 'a place'; and the *natio* is forged in and from a place-able community.

### *Turning in the Wind*

In the period since 1994 the historiographical pathway taken towards Scotland's 'place' overseas has developed via the study of Empire as part of inquiries increasingly interrelated.<sup>32</sup> The re-ignition of a once unfashionable topic has mainly sidelined analysis of Britain's strategic military and economic conquests in order to flag the explicit coupling of Scotland and Empire in the actions of Scots people: the business of trade (including the earlier slave trade), and cultural, literary,

<sup>31</sup> L. Abrams, E. Gordon, D. Simonton and E. Yeo (eds), *Gender in Scottish History Since 1700* (Edinburgh 2006); L. Abrams, *Myth and materiality in a woman's world: Shetland 1800–2000* (Manchester, 2005); E. Gordon and G. Nair, *Public Lives: Women, Family and Society in Victorian Britain* (New Haven, CT, 2002); E. L. Ewan, S. Innes, S. Reynolds, R. Pipes (eds), *The Biographical Dictionary of Scottish Women* (Edinburgh, 2007). And within labour history, as noted, Fraser's *Chartism in Scotland*; also, T. Griffiths, 'Work, Leisure and Time in the Nineteenth Century', in Griffiths and Morton (eds), *A History of Everyday Life in Scotland*.

<sup>32</sup> J. M. MacKenzie and T. M. Devine, 'Introduction', in MacKenzie and Devine (eds), *Scotland and the British Empire*, 4–9; Michael Fry, *The Scottish Empire* (East Linton and Edinburgh, 2001); T. M. Devine, *Scotland's Empire, 1600–1815* (London, 2003).

environmental, intellectual, religious and manpower exchanges.<sup>33</sup> By connecting home with events abroad, the parameters of the national concept as place are broadened in the study of contemporary lives.<sup>34</sup> Nor did the Scots stop being Scots (and being British) once their boat or train left its berth. For those involved in Empire and the diaspora, dialogue outside the homeland, and between the colonial settlements, remained apropos the Scottish nation.<sup>35</sup> Development of the steam railway, omnibus and tram did little to alter the long-standing logistics of the sea crossing to Ireland—at its shortest only thirteen miles—that encouraged cultural and economic exchange, including radicalism as Newby has shown in the Scottish Highlands.<sup>36</sup> These were established experiences for contemporaries, and Irish people in Scotland were not ignored.<sup>37</sup> Also geographically close, the Scots in England, and the English in Scotland, was a small but not insignificant part of the nation's history.<sup>38</sup> Of those that did journey greater distances, scholarly attention has firmed up the modern emigration experience as peaking in the 1920s not earlier, as lowland rather than highland centered after internal migrations, and as generally voluntary not forced after 1860 despite the economic imperatives that turned the head of many towards a life away from home.<sup>39</sup>

Harper's *Adventurers and Exiles* and, with Constantine, *Migration and Empire* account for this emigration experience in all its diversity of praxis, part of a corpus joined by Devine's *To the Ends of the Earth*.<sup>40</sup> These books bring out the decision-making and the practicalities of emigration: funding the boat journey overseas or the land-journey to England, distilling information from guidebooks and agent propaganda, and calling upon the experiences of relatives and friends.

<sup>33</sup> MacKenzie and Devine (eds), *Scotland and the British Empire*; D. Mack, *Scottish Literature and the British Empire* (Edinburgh, 2006); C. Craig, *Intending Scotland: Explorations in Scottish Culture Since the Enlightenment* (Edinburgh, 2009); P. Basu, *Highland Homecomings: genealogy and heritage tourism in the Scottish Diaspora* (London, 2007).

<sup>34</sup> Devine, *To the Ends of the Earth*, xiii-xvi.

<sup>35</sup> E. Richards, 'Australia and Scotland: the evolution of a long distance relationship', *Australian Journal of Politics and History* 56, 4, (2010) 485-502; J. M. MacKenzie, 'Essay and reflection: on Scotland and the Empire', *The International History Review* 15 (1993) 714-739.

<sup>36</sup> A. G. Newby, *Ireland, Radicalism and the Scottish Highlands, c.1870-1912* (Edinburgh, 2007).

<sup>37</sup> M. J. Mitchell (ed.), *New Perspectives on the Irish in Scotland* (Edinburgh, 2008).

<sup>38</sup> A. McCarthy, 'The Scots' Society of St. Andrew, Hull, 1910-2001: immigrant, ethnic, and transnational association', in T. Bueltmann, A. Hinson and G. Morton (eds), *Ties of Blood, Kin and Countrie: Scottish Associational Culture in the Diaspora* (Guelph, 2009); F. Bechhofer et al, 'Constructing national identity: arts and landed elites in Scotland', *Sociology* 35 (2001) 195-199; B. Braber, 'Immigrants', in Devine and Wormald (eds), *Oxford Handbook of Modern Scottish History*.

<sup>39</sup> M. Harper, *Emigration from Scotland between the Wars: Opportunity Or Exile?* (Manchester, 1999); A. McCarthy, 'The Scottish diaspora since 1815', in Devine and Wormald (eds), *Oxford Handbook of Modern Scottish History*.

<sup>40</sup> M. Harper, *Adventurers and Exiles: The Great Scottish Exodus* (London, 2003); M. Harper and S. Constantine, *Migration and Empire* (Oxford, 2010); Devine, *To the Ends of the Earth*.

What is found is that invariably a trail of business and social networks supported these people, with evidence revealed in letters and account books linking the Scots who left with those they left behind.<sup>41</sup> Many Scots did not stay away for long. Failed migrants joined sojourners and the homesick in returning to Caledonia.<sup>42</sup> It may be no fault, but these studies are not based around number crunching – *The Mobile Scot* being one exception to this – and the potential remains for more nuanced and extensive research with sample and complete count census data.<sup>43</sup> Nevertheless the evidence we have of the Scots in motion points to a concept of nation that is both malleable and unfettered. This result has found historians weighing Scots' cultural experience of diaspora as one of association over solitude. Career interlinkage between home and Australia in the teaching profession and botanical interchange between Scotland, Chile, and Canada has been unearthed.<sup>44</sup> The trend has been to bring the human dimension into the migration story, comparatively for the home nations in Richards' *Britannia's Children*, and with a focus on material culture in *Transatlantic Scots, Heather and the Fern* and *A Kingdom of the Mind*.<sup>45</sup> Each stress the portability of national identity, and detailed research has appeared on the Scots in South Africa, Australia, New Zealand, India and England,<sup>46</sup> along with case studies mined through doctoral work.<sup>47</sup> Speaking English and being of

<sup>41</sup> A. McCarthy (ed.), *A Global Clan: Scottish migrant networks and identities since the eighteenth century* (London and New York, 2006); S. R. H. Jones, *Doing Well and Doing Good: Ross & Glendinning, Scottish Enterprise in New Zealand* (Dunedin, 2010); A. McCarthy, *Personal Narratives of Irish and Scottish Migration, 1921–65: 'For Spirit and Adventure'* (Manchester, 2007).

<sup>42</sup> M. Harper (ed.), *Emigrant Homecomings: the return movement of emigrants, 1600–2000* (Manchester, 2005); M. Varricchio (ed.), *Return to Caledonia: Scottish Homecomings from the Seventeenth Century to the Present* (Edinburgh, 2012).

<sup>43</sup> J. M. Brock, *The Mobile Scot* (Edinburgh, 1999).

<sup>44</sup> M. D. Prentis, 'Minister and Dominie: creating an Australasian Scottish world?', *International Review of Scottish Studies* 33 (2008) 7–36; J. McCarthy, *Monkey Puzzle Man: Archibald Menzies, Plant Hunter* (Dunbeath and Edinburgh, 2008).

<sup>45</sup> E. Richards, *Britannia's Children: Emigration from England, Scotland, Wales and Ireland Since 1600* (London, 2004); C. Ray (ed.), *Transatlantic Scots* (Tuscaloosa, 2005); T. Brooking and J. Coleman (eds), *The Heather and the Fern: Scottish Migration and New Zealand Settlement* (Dunedin, 2003); P. E. Rider and H. McNabb (eds), *A Kingdom of the Mind: How The Scots Helped Make Canada* (Kingston & Montreal, 2006).

<sup>46</sup> J. M. MacKenzie with N. R. Dalziel, *The Scots In South Africa: Ethnicity, Identity, Gender and Race, 1772–1914* (Manchester, 2007); M. Prentis, *The Scots In Australia* (New South Wales, 2009); A. McCarthy, *Scottishness and Irishness In New Zealand since 1840* (Manchester, 2011); M. McLaren, *British India and British Scotland, 1780–1830: Career Building, Empire Building, & a Scottish School of Thought on Indian Governance* (Ohio, 2001); E. Buettner, 'Haggis in the Raj: private and public celebrations of Scottishness in late Imperial India' *SHR* 81 (2002) 212–39; A. Burnett, "'Hail Brither Scots O' Coaly Tyne": networking and identity among Scottish migrants in the North-East of England, c.1860–2000', *Immigrants & Minorities* 25 (2007) 1–21.

<sup>47</sup> C. Bourbeau, 'The Scots in Montreal: The Development and Perpetuation of Scottish Memories, Identities and Culture in a Post-Migratory Urban Context', unpublished Ph.D thesis (University of Aberdeen, 2010); A. Hinson, 'Migrant Scots in a British City: Toronto's Scottish Community, 1881–1911', unpublished Ph.D thesis (University of Guelph, 2010); K. Hughes, 'The Scottish-born community of Victorian and

the Protestant faith were part of the advantage held by colonial Scots, but Scottish Catholic migrants, where conditions suited, defined their religious identity in distinction to Irish and French Roman Catholics.<sup>48</sup> Nor were Gaelic speakers simply lost in transatlantic translation despite the challenge of integration, again helped in some cases by geographic isolation.<sup>49</sup> Being no hermetic society, Scotland's national self was refracted in others' objectification of Scotland, both inside and distant from the nation.<sup>50</sup> That the Scots objectified themselves in their encounters with other peoples, and have been so objectified, has leveled scholarly attention upon contemporary interpretations of Scottish Highlanders and Native peoples. Here linguistic and racial experiences under the cloud of imperialism have been suggestive of affinity. The preponderance of an oral culture, the use of myth, and the experience of being colonized, has banded Native Americans and Maori alike with Highland Scots.<sup>51</sup> This line of argument spreads the Scottish nation out into other peoples' and other nation's histories. Still, as Calloway and Stroh have cautioned, more commonly Scots–Highland Scots included—exhibited all the prejudices and exploitative practices engaged in by other immigrants. Most Scots in the diaspora were actively engaged in colonizing rather than sharing empathetically their colonized experience. But the debate and newly hewn evidence has unearthed testimony that the conceptual nation—in its praxis—existed beyond the narrow boundaries of home.

It would appear that the door has closed a little more firmly on the concept of the 1707 nation; how open historians are to the concept of the diasporic nation remains to be seen.

<sup>47</sup> (*Continued*) Edwardian Belfast', unpublished Ph.D thesis (Northumbria University, 2010); G. Leitch, 'The Importance of Being English: Identity and Social Organisation in Montreal, 1800–1850, unpublished Ph.D thesis (University of Montréal, 2007); R. Lenihan, 'From Alba to Aotearoa: Profiling New Zealand's Scots Migrants, 1840–1920', unpublished Ph.D thesis (Victoria University of Wellington, 2010); K. Sullivan, 'Scots by Association: Scottish Diasporic Identities and Ethnic Associationism in the Nineteenth-Early Twentieth Centuries and the Present Day', unpublished Ph.D thesis (University of Otago, 2011); D. Hesse, 'Warrior Dreams: Playing Scotsmen in mainland Europe, 1945–2010' unpublished Ph.D thesis (University of Edinburgh, 2011).

<sup>48</sup> S. Karly Kehoe, 'Catholic Identity in the Diaspora: nineteenth-century Ontario', in Bueltmann, Hinson, and Morton (eds), *Ties of Blood, Kin and Country*, 84–7.

<sup>49</sup> M. Newton, *Warriors of the Word: The World of the Scottish Highlanders* (Edinburgh, 2009); M. Newton, 'Scotland's two solitudes abroad: Scottish Gaelic immigrant identity and culture in North America', in J. A. Campbell, E. Ewan, and H. Parker (eds), *The Shaping of Scottish Identities: Family, Nation, and the Worlds Beyond* (Guelph, 2011); S. Stroh, *Uneasy Subjects: Postcolonialism and Scottish Gaelic Poetry* (Amsterdam and New York, 2011), 12–22, 194–9, 235–7.

<sup>50</sup> G. Morton, *Ourselves and Others: Scotland, 1832–1914* (Edinburgh, 2012).

<sup>51</sup> C. Calloway, *White People, Indians and Highlanders: Tribal Peoples and Colonial Encounters in Scotland and America* (Oxford, 2008); B. Patterson, "'It is curious how keenly allied in character are the Scotch Highlander and the Maori": Encounters in a New Zealand Colonial Settlement', *Journal of Irish and Scottish Studies* 4 (2010) 163–184.

*Part II: 1900 to 2000*

In the years since the last historiographical survey of modern Scotland was undertaken, the study of the twentieth century and Scotland's place within it has undergone significant change. As recently as 1996, when the century had only four years to run, it was possible for T. M. Devine and Richard Finlay in their introduction to a series of essays on *Scotland in the Twentieth Century*, to write that 'The more recent past has been comparatively neglected [in comparison that is with the period from the seventeenth to the nineteenth centuries]. It would probably be true to say that scholars know more about the period of the Enlightenment and the Industrial Revolution than they do about our own century'.<sup>52</sup> The volume which those remarks prefaced aimed to address this perceived deficiency through a series of focused studies on varied aspects of the recent Scottish experience. It has been supplemented over the last seventeen years by a number of synoptic histories, many of which are specifically devoted to the twentieth century in its long or truncated form. *The New Penguin History of Scotland*, which marked the century's end and the new millennium, devoted two chapters to the period from 1914, with a pivot at 1979, marking the failure of the first drive for devolved government in the century and the final collapse of Britain's social democratic consensus.<sup>53</sup> This volume provided early evidence that constructing an overarching narrative to capture Scotland's experience of the twentieth century was far from straightforward and, if anything, was becoming more complex.

Reflecting this, the last few years have seen a number of contrasting approaches to the task of exploring Scotland's recent past: a narrative overview from the later nineteenth century with an emphasis on political changes by Ewen Cameron; the final volume of a series on the history of everyday life in Scotland, edited by Lynn Abrams and Callum Brown; and Catriona Macdonald's inclusive treatment of economic, social, political, and cultural trends across Scotland's twentieth century, *Whaur Extremes Meet*. When to these is added Richard Finlay's own survey of *Modern Scotland*, from 1914, which appeared in 2004, it is apparent that the twentieth century no longer constitutes quite the historiographical gap encountered by Devine and Finlay.<sup>54</sup>

Other, more particular aspects of Scotland's recent past have also been explored. Economic histories of Britain are, thanks to the work of Devine and Lee, obliged to give more than mere lip service to the

<sup>52</sup> T. M. Devine, 'Introduction', in T. M. Devine and R. J. Finlay (eds), *Scotland in the Twentieth Century* (Edinburgh, 1996), 2.

<sup>53</sup> J. Foster, 'The Twentieth Century, 1914–1979' and C. Harvie, 'Scotland after 1978: From Referendum to Millenium', in Houston and Knox (eds), *The New Penguin History of Scotland*, 417–531.

<sup>54</sup> E. A. Cameron, *Impaled Upon a Thistle: Scotland since 1880* (Edinburgh, 2010); L. Abrams and C. G. Brown (eds), *A History of Everyday Life in Twentieth-Century Scotland* (Edinburgh, 2010); C. M. M. Macdonald, *Whaur Extremes Meet: Scotland's Twentieth Century* (Edinburgh, 2009); R. J. Finlay, *Modern Scotland, 1914–2000* (London, 2004).

Scottish experience. The long-run forces shaping Scotland's economic record may be explored in the essays included in the first two volumes of *The Cambridge Economic History of Modern Britain*.<sup>55</sup> Their message is amplified in the dedicated volume on *The Transformation of Scotland*, in which it is notable that, in contrast to the outline treatment afforded by the Cambridge volumes, almost 40% of a book dealing with long-run patterns of development from 1700 is devoted to the period from 1914.<sup>56</sup> That said, the tale it recounts is a largely familiar one of a prolonged retreat from the heights of heavy industrial success and the problems encountered by an economy in which, for much of the period, average incomes lagged behind those for Britain as a whole and dependence on public sector employment became more firmly entrenched than was the case elsewhere within the Union.<sup>57</sup>

Others have delved deeper into the abundant archival resources that can inspire and occasionally intimidate historians of the modern age. Many of these take Scotland as their primary or sole point of focus and include Roger Davidson and Gayle Davis' work on the regulation of sexual behaviours, Callum Brown's challenging approach to rethinking the process and chronology of secularisation in modern Britain, Jim Phillips' work on the political economy of post-war Scotland, tracing the final convulsions of an industrial order that had sustained Scotland over the previous two centuries, and Jim Tomlinson's studies into the wider ramifications of economic policy making and, more recently, the extent and implications of globalisation for the Scottish way of life.<sup>58</sup>

<sup>55</sup> T. M. Devine, 'Scotland', in R. Floud and P. Johnson (eds), *The Cambridge Economic History of Modern Britain. Volume 1: Industrialisation, 1700–1860* (Cambridge, 2004), 388–416; C. H. Lee, 'Scotland, 1860–1939: Growth and Poverty', in id., *The Cambridge Economic History of Modern Britain. Volume 2: Economic Maturity, 1860–1939* (Cambridge, 2004), 428–55.

<sup>56</sup> T. M. Devine, C. H. Lee and G. C. Peden (eds), *The Transformation of Scotland: The Economy since 1700* (Edinburgh, 2005), 159–268 (essays by Newlands, Cameron, Lee and Peden).

<sup>57</sup> For these themes, see also, C. H. Lee, *Scotland in the United Kingdom: The Economy and the Union in the Twentieth Century* (Manchester, 1995).

<sup>58</sup> R. Davidson and G. Davis, '“A Field for Private Members”: The Wolfenden Committee and Scottish Homosexual Law Reform, 1950–67', *Twentieth-Century British History*, 15 (2004) 174–201; id., 'Sexuality and the State: The Campaign for Scottish Homosexual Law Reform, 1967–80', *Contemporary British History*, 20 (2006) 533–58; id., '“This Thorniest of Problems”: School Sex Education Policy in Scotland, 1939–80', *SHR* 84 (2005) 221–46; id., '“A Festering Sore on the Body of Society”: The Wolfenden Committee and Female Prostitution in mid-Twentieth-Century Scotland', *Journal of Scottish Historical Studies*, 24 (2005) 80–98; Brown, *The Death of Christian Britain*; id., 'What was the Religious Crisis of the 1960s?', *Journal of Religious History*, 34 (2010) 468–79; J. Phillips, *The Industrial Politics of Devolution: Scotland in the 1960s and 1970s* (Manchester, 2008); id., 'Workplace Conflict and the Origins of the 1984–5 Miners' Strike in Scotland', *Twentieth-Century British History*, 20 (2009) 152–72; id., 'Material and Moral Resources: The 1984–5 Miners' Strike in Scotland', *Economic History Review*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ser., LXV (2011) 256–76; J. Tomlinson, 'Managing the Economy, Managing the People: Britain c.1931–70', *Economic History Review*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ser., LVIII (2005) 555–85; id., 'Dundee and the World: De-globalisation, De-industrialisation and Democratisation',

Others could be added, but most seek to locate their research in a wider context, placing the Scottish experience within a broader trans-national pattern of development. While not unique to the twentieth century, the relationship between Scotland and wider 'global' forces assumed a particular character in these years. Many, including the impact of the retreat from Empire, the impact of migrant populations of growing size and diversity, and Scotland's exposure to broader cultural and commercial forces, are only now coming becoming subjects of extended historical analysis.<sup>59</sup>

The result of this collective endeavour is a picture of the twentieth century that is more varied and complex than that which used to apply. For much of its length, the twentieth century could be viewed largely as a period in which forces at work from the later nineteenth century were fully worked out. It was a narrative constructed around the initial consolidation and then decline of heavy industry, a process which found its political equivalent in the replacement of a liberal hegemony with one based on the interests of Labour and its ties to a burgeoning public sector.<sup>60</sup> It was a story punctuated by a series of well-defined landmarks, dominated by a tradition for political radicalism generated by events on Clydeside during the First World War.<sup>61</sup> A further aspect of the changes set in store in this period appeared to be a prolonged and sustained process of secularisation, by which the influence of the Presbyterian church on the outlook and behaviour of Scots became progressively more marginal.<sup>62</sup>

Elements of that story remain, but are now accommodated within a rather different narrative, in which key changes are identified around the 1960s. This decade saw the beginnings of what would become a sustained downturn in the importance of manufacturing in the wider economy, a development that was seen to have profound implications

<sup>58</sup> (Continued) in J. Tomlinson and C. A. Whatley (eds), *Jute No More: Transforming Dundee* (Dundee, 2011), 1–26.

<sup>59</sup> See, for example, Mitchell (ed.), *New Perspectives on the Irish in Scotland*; M. Dutto (ed.), *The Italians in Scotland: Their Language and Culture* (Edinburgh, 1986); W. Ugolini, *Experiencing War as the 'Enemy Other': Italian Scottish Experience in World War II* (Manchester, 2011).

<sup>60</sup> P. L. Payne, 'The Decline of the Scottish Heavy Industries, 1945–83', in R. Saville (ed.), *The Economic Development of Modern Scotland, 1950–80* (Edinburgh, 1985), 79–113; id., 'The End of Steelmaking in Scotland, c.1967–93', *Scottish Economic and Social History*, 15 (1995) 66–84; C. M. M. Macdonald, *The Radical Thread: Political Change in Scotland: Paisley Politics, 1885–1924* (East Linton, 2000); J. J. Smyth, *Labour in Glasgow, 1896–1936: Socialism, Suffrage, Sectarianism* (East Linton, 2000); W. W. Knox and A. MacKinlay, 'The Re-Making of Scottish Labour in the 1930s', *Twentieth-Century British History*, 6 (1995) 174–93.

<sup>61</sup> R. Duncan and A. J. McIvor (eds), *Militant Workers: Labour and Class Conflict on the Clyde, 1900–50: Essays in Honour of Harry McShane (1891–1988)* (Edinburgh, 1992); I. McLean, *The Legend of Red Clydeside* (Edinburgh, 1983).

<sup>62</sup> S. Bruce, *God is Dead: Secularization in the West* (Oxford, 2002); C. G. Brown, 'Secularisation: A Theory in Danger?', *Scottish Economic and Social History*, 11 (1991) 52–8; C. D. Field, "'The Haemorrhage of Faith?': Opinion Polls as Sources for Religious Practices, Beliefs and Attitudes in Scotland since the 1970s', *Journal of Contemporary Religion*, 16 (2001) 157–75.

for gender relations, as patterns of work which had supported male employment and particular versions of masculinity gave way before the rise of female involvement in paid work.<sup>63</sup> The effects were felt within families, both as regards the formation of the basic household unit and the relationships between those making up the modern family. The most obvious changes, charted in the work of Michael Anderson and Lynn Jamieson, included a marked rise in the age of first marriage, new expectations surrounding married life, leading to higher rates of divorce and the greater recourse to co-habitation prior to marriage.<sup>64</sup> The fundamental change in female roles informing these developments is also seen to be key to an accelerated process of secularisation from that decade. Female religiosity, which had long under-scored the position of organised religion within Scottish society, declined as ambitions came to be pursued elsewhere, primarily via careers in paid work.<sup>65</sup> The decline of older industries was also behind the initial weakening and finally collapse of ideas of 'Britishness', as the economic underpinnings of political unionism were removed.<sup>66</sup>

In contrast to earlier periods, which have undergone elongation in order to render them historically comprehensible (both the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries exist in the literature in their 'long' versions), the twentieth century appears subject to contraction, as it is increasingly conceived of as two distinct blocs, hinged at the 1960s. Given the overlapping economic, social, political, and cultural changes associated with that decade and beyond, this perspective has a clear rationale. There is also a sense in which the Scottish experience becomes more sharply differentiated from that of Britain as a whole as we move towards the latter part of the century. With political unionism in ever more rapid retreat, it would appear, Scotland comes more sharply into focus in the final decades of century.<sup>67</sup>

But, we need to be aware that there are also pitfalls in accepting too readily a clear point of division around the 1960s. Michael Anderson's

<sup>63</sup> A. McIvor, 'The Realities and Narratives of Paid Work: The Scottish Workplace', in Abrams and Brown (eds), *A History of Everyday Life in Twentieth-Century Scotland*, 103–30; id., 'Gender Apartheid?: Women in Scottish Society', in Devine and Finlay (eds), *Scotland in the Twentieth Century*, 188–209; L. Paterson, F. Bechhofer, and D. McCrone, *Living in Scotland: Social and Economic Change since 1980* (Edinburgh, 2004).

<sup>64</sup> Curtice et al (eds), *New Scotland, New Society?*; L. Jamieson, 'Changing Intimacy: Seeking and Forming Couple Relationships', in Abrams and Brown (eds), *A History of Everyday Life in Twentieth-Century Scotland*, 76–102; M. Anderson, 'What is New About the Modern Family?', in M. Drake (ed.), *Time, Family and Community: Perspectives on Family and Community History* (Milton Keynes, 1994), 67–90.

<sup>65</sup> Brown, *The Death of Christian Britain*.

<sup>66</sup> I. G. C. Hutchison, *Scottish Politics in the Twentieth Century* (Basingstoke, 2001); Christopher Harvie, 'The Moment of British Nationalism, 1939–70', *Political Quarterly*, 71 (2000) 328–40.

<sup>67</sup> D. McCrone, *Understanding Scotland: The Sociology of a Nation*, 2nd ed. (London, 2001); M. B. Dickson, 'Scottish Political Culture: Is Scotland Different?—A Preliminary Investigation', *Strathclyde Papers on Government and Politics*, 108 (Glasgow, 1996); M. Keating, *Nations against the State: The New Politics of Nationalism in Quebec, Catalonia and Scotland* (Basingstoke, 2001).

work on the family has stressed that while there is much that is new about current household arrangements by this period, some aspects that are taken to be novel may be seen, taking the longer view, as a reversion to earlier patterns, particularly as regards the practice of cohabitation prior to marriage and the conception of children outside wedlock.<sup>68</sup> Anderson's work provides a useful reminder of the need to maintain a longer-term historical perspective if we are to gain a more precise understanding of observed changes. The same may be said for the process of secularisation. While changes witnessed since the 1960s cannot be denied, it is not clear that their origins were as immediate as some accounts have suggested. The study of earlier periods may indicate that much of the groundwork for those changes was laid in the period before 1960. Griffiths' work on the provision of Sunday entertainments early in the twentieth century suggests that the church gradually withdrew from close involvement in the debate, with the result that an area of life in which it had sought to play an important guiding role before 1914 was increasingly conducted without reference either to it or to its teachings. As early as 1939, it had become plausible to argue, even in Edinburgh, 'the metropolis of Sabbatarianism', that defence of Sunday as a day apart to be devoted to the glorification of God, was now a position only held by those outwith the mainstream.<sup>69</sup> While none of this made outright secularisation inevitable, the consequence may well have been to make the decision finally to dissociate from formal involvement in church affairs rather easier.

The suggestion is then that it is important in studying the dramatic changes of the last fifty years not to lose sight of potentially equally significant developments in the decades that preceded them. Here, there are important gaps which, at present, show few signs of being filled. In the 1980s, Conservative electoral dominance south of the border encouraged attempts to explore the roots of an earlier phase of success for the party in the 1920s and 1930s.<sup>70</sup> Fortunately, some might argue, a similar inducement was lacking in Scotland, but this does leave

<sup>68</sup> Anderson, 'What is New About the Modern Family?'; see, for example, A. Blaikie, *Illegitimacy, Sex and Society: Northeast Scotland, 1750–1900* (Oxford, 1993); id., 'Rituals, Transitions and Life Courses in an Era of Social Transformation', in Griffiths and Morton (eds), *A History of Everyday Life in Scotland*, 89–115.

<sup>69</sup> T. Griffiths, *Cinema and Cinema-going in Scotland, 1896–1950* (Edinburgh, 2012), ch.4; *Evening Times* (Glasgow), 30 Nov. 1901, 2, for the description of Edinburgh. In May 1939, the branding as 'extremists' of individuals who resigned from the city's Air Raid Protection scheme in protest at moves to hold recruitment meetings in the city's cinemas on Sundays provoked the observation, 'We have indeed progressed amazingly when it can be said, in the capital of Scotland, that those who maintain the validity of the Fourth Commandment are "extremists"', *Scotsman*, 11 May 1939, 13.

<sup>70</sup> R. I. McKibbin, *Parties and People: England 1914–1951* (Oxford, 2010), esp. ch.3; id., 'Class and Conventional Wisdom: The Conservative Party and the "Public" in Inter-War Britain', in id., *The Ideologies of Class: Social Relations in Britain, 1880–1950* (Oxford, 1991), 259–93; D. Jarvis, 'The Shaping of Conservative Electoral Hegemony, 1918–1939' in J. Lawrence and M. Taylor (eds), *Party, State and Society: Electoral Behaviour in Britain since 1820* (Aldershot, 1998), 131–52; E. H. H. Green, *Ideologies of Conservatism* (Oxford, 2002).

an important phase in Unionist politics comparatively unexplored, as Ewen Cameron has recently argued.<sup>71</sup> There may be, it must be acknowledged, little attraction in seeking to explore what has become and, at present, shows every indication of remaining, a historical cul-de-sac, but it will be interesting to see whether the current vogue for coalition politics revives interest in the contribution of an older radical Liberal tradition to the Scottish take on Unionism.<sup>72</sup> At present, the nature of popular unionism across early to mid-twentieth-century Scotland remains under-explored, leaving our understanding of the transition to a post-unionist political phase seriously incomplete.

If we move to consider possible future directions for research, going beyond specific gaps to identify possible themes that can provide an overarching framework for analysis of the twentieth century, the historiography's preoccupation with the worlds of work and production may be seen to impose limits on our understanding of the recent past. Themes such as the decline of heavy industry and the failures of regional policy remain important, but perhaps we need also to consider what Adam Smith deemed 'the sole end and purpose of production'-consumption.<sup>73</sup> Even practitioners of the dismal science have begun to broaden their conception of economic welfare to take in notions of contentment, an idea with which politicians have recently flirted, although not it would appear with lasting effect. So, to complement 'Happiness Economics', we might perhaps enter a plea for 'Happiness History'.<sup>74</sup> Here, the scope for potential investigation remains wide, as it remains frustratingly true that well-documented histories of attempts to regulate popular behaviour have not been, to date, balanced by attempts to examine the cultures that were the subjects of such efforts at control. As Hamish Fraser notes in his review of Bill Knox's *Industrial Nation*, it continues to be the case that far more is known of the temperance movement across Scotland than of the world of the pub with which it sought to grapple.<sup>75</sup> Presbyterianism, it would appear, continues to cast a long cultural shadow.

<sup>71</sup> Cameron, *Impaled Upon a Thistle*, 263; although see Macdonald (ed.), *Unionist Scotland, 1800-1997*; and Devine (ed.), *Scotland and the Union*, for more recent attempts to address this theme.

<sup>72</sup> M. Dyer, '“A Nationalist in the Churchillian Sense”: J. MacCormick, the Paisley By-Election of 18 February 1948, Home Rule and the Crisis in Scottish Liberalism', *Parliamentary History*, 22 (2003) 285-307; M. McManus, *Jo Grimond: Towards the Sound of Gunfire* (Edinburgh, 2001).

<sup>73</sup> Adam Smith, *An Inquiry into the Nature and Causes of The Wealth of Nations*, ed., Edwin Cannan (Chicago, 1976 ed.), Volume Two, Book IV, 179.

<sup>74</sup> D. G. Blanchflower and A. J. Oswald, 'Well-Being over Time in Britain and the United States', *Journal of Public Economics*, 88 (2004) 1359-86; id., 'Money, Sex and Happiness', *Scandinavian Journal of Economics*, 106 (2004) 393-415; B. S. Frey and A. Stutzer, *Happiness and Economics* (Princeton and Oxford, 2002).

<sup>75</sup> W. Hamish Fraser, review of W. W. Knox, *Industrial Nation: Work, Culture and Society in Scotland, 1800- Present* (Edinburgh, 1999), *Scottish Economic and Social History*, 20 (2000), 142.

So, the degree to and manner in which Scots participated in the first flush of mass consumption from the later decades of the nineteenth century remain obscure, as historians of the twentieth century have still to take on fully the insights of writers for earlier periods for whom patterns of consumption are often taken as important signifiers of social attitudes and identities.<sup>76</sup> If such themes may appear trivial when set alongside the travails of heavy industry, which have for so long dominated our perspectives of modern Scotland, they form a necessary and valuable counterpoint to that narrative. There are signs that this is beginning to be recognised. Paul Maloney's examination of Music Hall and Variety Theatre in Scotland has hinted at indigenous developments at variance with those observed in London, the focus of most comparable studies.<sup>77</sup> This idea has been taken up with Adrienne Scullion's study of the distinctive theatrical form that was Scottish pantomime.<sup>78</sup> Such work represents but the start of a process that can be carried forward into analyses of the mass media which have done much to shape the popular experience of the twentieth century: cinema, wireless, television, culminating in Scotland's pronounced success, until very recently, in the computer games business.<sup>79</sup>

Similarly, the experience of Scots on holiday, a point in the year when ordinary social disciplines were often relaxed, has been studied extensively across the nineteenth century, by Alastair Durie, and attention is increasingly turning to the development of particular holiday traditions, such as Glasgow Fair. As yet, however, the story has not been taken on in systematic fashion beyond 1914, so that our understanding of the forces shaping an industry of increasing importance for the wider economy and the impact of changed holiday practices as Scots ventured south of the border and to lands beyond the British Isles in growing numbers remains limited.<sup>80</sup>

<sup>76</sup> M. Berg and H. Clifford (eds), *Consumers and Luxury: Consumer Culture in Europe, 1650–1850* (Manchester, 1999); M. Berg and E. Eger (eds), *Luxury in the Eighteenth Century: Debates, Desires and Delectable Goods* (2002); M. Berg, *Luxury and Pleasure in Eighteenth-Century Britain* (Oxford, 2005).

<sup>77</sup> P. Maloney, *Scotland and the Music Hall, 1850–1914* (Manchester, 2003); also D. Kift, *The Victorian Music Hall: Culture, Class and Conflict* (Cambridge, 1996).

<sup>78</sup> A. Scullion, *Pantomime in Scotland: A Celebration of Scottish Pantomime on Film* (Glasgow, DVD, 2009); F. Bruce, *Scottish Showbusiness: Music Hall, Variety and Pantomime* (Edinburgh, 2000).

<sup>79</sup> W. H. McDowell, *The History of BBC Broadcasting in Scotland, 1923–83* (Edinburgh, 1992); A. Scullion, 'BBC Radio in Scotland, 1923–1939: Devolution, Regionalism and Centralisation', *Northern Scotland*, 15 (1995) 63–92; T. Hajkowski, *The BBC and National Identity in Britain, 1922–53* (Manchester, 2010); D. P. Walker, *The BBC in Scotland: The First 50 Years* (Edinburgh, 2011); House of Commons, Scottish Affairs Committee, *Video Games Industry in Scotland, Second Report of Session 2010–11*. Volume 1 (Stationery Office Ltd., 2011), 5, in which it is noted that 'Scotland is home to nearly 25% of UK video games companies'.

<sup>80</sup> A. J. Durie, *Scotland for the Holidays: Tourism in Scotland, c.1780–1939* (East Linton, 2003); J. K. Walton, *The British Seaside: Holidays and Resorts in the Twentieth Century* (Manchester, 2000).

Particularly notable, given the importance which attaches to it at an everyday level, has been the lack of sustained investigation into the place of sport in Scottish society. Here, the tendency has been, for the most part, to re-traverse well-worn paths, so that the Old Firm and the sectarian (and, in the case of one of its members, financial) controversies that cling relentlessly to them continue to dominate both academic and popular discourse on matters sporting.<sup>81</sup> The promise contained in the Jarvie and Walker collection on Scottish sport, itself sparked by claims that Scots were 'ninety-minute patriots' has only fitfully been realised, so that sport's broader importance as a signifier of local, regional and national allegiances continues to constitute a matter for speculation.<sup>82</sup> Here, as elsewhere, the archival riches available to the historian of the twentieth century remain under-exploited. The creation of nationally and internationally significant collections relating to golf and football is yet to call forth a comparable growth in scholarly engagement, although Wray Vamplew's work on golf professionals and the club structures around which the game developed through the nineteenth century provides early evidence of the potential that sport offers to explore issues of class and gender difference over time.<sup>83</sup> The growing interest of the State in the physical health and everyday behaviour of its citizens offers an alternative way in to exploring sport's wider importance, a route mapped out by Callum Brown's work on the files of the Scottish Home and Health Department.<sup>84</sup>

Sport and the growth in popular consumerism of which it may be seen to form a part posed varied challenges to the prevailing moral sentiment, embodying the disciplines of self-denial and restraint. The degree to which churches and secular agencies sought to respond by challenging, regulating, or accommodating such developments has much to tell us about the manner in which Scotland encountered the twentieth century and the cultural as well as economic 'modernity' it was seen to embody.<sup>85</sup> Indications are that, for much of the century, regulation continued to be exercised through local structures of governance inherited from the previous century, giving rise to a

<sup>81</sup> B. Murray, *The Old Firm in a New Age* (Edinburgh, 1998); J. M. Bradley, 'Sport and the Contestation of Ethnic Identity: Football and Irishness in Scotland', *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 32 (2006) 1189–1208.

<sup>82</sup> G. Jarvie and G. Walker (eds), *Scottish Sport in the Making of the Nation: Ninety Minute Patriots?* (Leicester, 1994); G. Jarvie and J. Burnett (eds), *Sport, Scotland and the Scots* (East Linton, 2000).

<sup>83</sup> W. Vamplew, 'Exploited Labour or Successful Workingmen: Golf Professionals and Professional Golfers in Britain before 1914', *Economic History Review*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ser., LXI (2008) 54–79; J. Kay, J. George and W. Vamplew, 'Women to the Fore: Gender Accommodation and Resistance at the British Golf Club before 1914', *Sporting Traditions*, 23 (2007) 79–98.

<sup>84</sup> C. G. Brown, 'Sport and the Scottish Office: The Promotion of a Social and Gender Policy', *European Sports History Review*, 1 (1999) 183–202.

<sup>85</sup> On this theme, see A. Blaikie, *The Scots Imagination and Modern Memory* (Edinburgh, 2010).

varied and variable system of controls that is only just beginning to be appreciated.<sup>86</sup>

The local constellation of forces at work in regulating everyday aspects of society may be contrasted with broader, more global influences which, while not a novel feature of the century operated in a manner that assumed new and more varied forms. Scots, as historians of material culture in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries remind us, had long been global consumers, and had played a full and active part in generating a world economic order through the export of capital and manpower. In some respects, as Jim Tomlinson's work on Dundee indicates, this sequence of globalisation was checked in the twentieth century, as policies of protection and exchange controls in its middle decades signalled a reorientation of the economy away from truly global industries such as jute and shipbuilding in favour of a public sector geared to servicing more immediate, local needs and insulated from wider international forces.<sup>87</sup> If viewed alongside the precipitate retreat from Empire, a process whose origins and implications acquire a new significance in the light of the weight increasingly given to the nation's diasporic dimensions, it would be tempting to argue that twentieth-century Scots were markedly less global than their forebears had been.<sup>88</sup> Yet as recent events from the credit crunch to Icelandic ash clouds demonstrate, the global is an inescapable aspect of modern life and it is the manner in which it has been experienced that marks out the period from 1900.

National boundaries have been transcended in various aspects of modern life, from the legal and the economic to the recreational. Environmental controls and property rights over natural resources are increasingly subject to international negotiation, while the attraction of inward investment means that the lives of many Scots are subject to decisions taken at some remove from where their effects are felt.<sup>89</sup> From its earliest days, the cinema, a mass entertainment form of which, so contemporary surveys indicated, Scots were among the most avid consumers, juxtaposed the local and the global, thereby encapsulating many aspects of the twentieth-century experience. Alongside scenes

<sup>86</sup> R. Rodger, *The Transformation of Edinburgh: Land, Property and Trust in the Nineteenth Century* (Cambridge, 2001); G. Morton and R. J. Morris, 'Civil Society, Governance and Nation, 1832–1914', in Houston and Knox (eds), *New Penguin History of Scotland*, 355–416.

<sup>87</sup> J. Tomlinson, 'The Deglobalisation of Dundee, c.1900–2000', *Journal of Scottish Historical Studies*, 29 (2009) 123–40.

<sup>88</sup> The work of Esther Breitenbach and Lesley Orr on 'Empire and Civil Society in Twentieth-Century Scotland' promises to illuminate the processes behind and implications of Scotland's disengagement from Empire.

<sup>89</sup> J. Sheail, *An Environmental History of Twentieth-Century Britain* (Basingstoke, 2002); E. Ashby and M. Anderson, *The Politics of Clean Air* (Oxford, 1981); B. Knox and A. McKinlay, 'Working for the Yankee Dollar: American Inward Investment and Scottish Labour, 1945–70', *Historical Studies in Industrial Relations*, 7 (1999) 1–26; J. Henderson, 'Semiconductors, Scotland and the International Division of Labour', *Urban Studies*, 24 (1987) 389–408.

of Princes Street and Waverley Steps on a windy day, audiences at Edinburgh's Operetta House in 1903 were treated to images of the Delhi Durbar marking the start of the new reign as well as views of Canada, aimed presumably at inducing higher rates of emigration.<sup>90</sup> Over time, the exotic would increasingly win out over the local in theatre programmes so that, to the alarm of many, Scottish minds were opened to new metropolitan ways of thinking. As early as the 1930s, the fear was being voiced that such trends, whether emanating from London or Los Angeles, would inexorably work to efface a sense of nationhood.<sup>91</sup> From the perspective of the early twenty-first century such concerns appear, if understandable, considerably overdone. Rather than being rendered 'temporary American citizens' by repeated exposure to the products of Hollywood, Scots assimilated such aspects of Americana as seemed appropriate into their experiences beyond the picture house.<sup>92</sup> Far from being expunged as some predicted, a sense of nationhood was reshaped and reinvigorated by contact with new and unfamiliar cultures, reflecting more than anything the continued mutability and adaptability of ideas of Scotland over time.

<sup>90</sup> *Scotsman*, 20 Feb. 1903, 1.

<sup>91</sup> See, for example, A. D. Gibb, *Scotland in Eclipse* (London, 1930).

<sup>92</sup> M. Glancy, 'Temporary American Citizens?: British Audiences, Hollywood Films and the Threat of Americanisation in the 1920s', *Historical Journal of Film, Radio and Television*, 26 (2006) 461–84; the process is neatly encapsulated by the career of 'Sheriff Lobey Dosser of Calton Creek', charted by Bud Neill in the pages of Glasgow's *Evening News* from the late 1940s, and subsequently celebrated in B. Neill, *Lobey's the Wee Boy!: Five Lobey Dosser Adventures* (Edinburgh, 1992).