

THE UNIVERSITY of EDINBURGH

Edinburgh Research Explorer

Climate warming as a driver of tundra shrubline advance

Citation for published version: Myers-Smith, I & Hik, DS 2017, 'Climate warming as a driver of tundra shrubline advance', *Journal of Ecology*. https://doi.org/10.1111/1365-2745.12817

Digital Object Identifier (DOI):

10.1111/1365-2745.12817

Link: Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer

Document Version: Peer reviewed version

Published In: Journal of Ecology

General rights

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy The University of Edinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact openaccess@ed.ac.uk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



2	
3	Climate warming as a driver of tundra shrubline advance
4	Isla H. Myers-Smith
5	^{1,2,*} and David S. Hik ²
6	
7	1. School of GeoSciences, King's Buildings, West Mains Road, University of Edinburgh,
8	Edinburgh, EH9 3FF, United Kingdom
9	2. Department of Biological Sciences, CW405 Biological Sciences Bldg., University of
10	Alberta, Edmonton, Alberta, T6G 2E9, Canada
11	* correspondence author, <u>isla.myers-smith@ed.ac.uk</u>
12	
13	Key-words. shrub, alpine, tundra, high-latitude, range expansion, recruitment, age distributions,
14	climate, willow (Salix), Yukon
15	
16	Tweetable Abstract. Shrubs advance into northern alpine tundra as climate warms: summer
17	temperature influences growth; winter temperature influences recruitment
18	
19	Summary
20	1. Climate warming is predicted to alter ecological boundaries in high-latitude ecosystems
21	including the elevational or latitudinal extent of tall shrubs in Arctic and alpine tundra. Over
22	60 studies from 128 locations around the tundra biome have investigated shrub expansion in
23	tundra ecosystems; however, only six studies test whether shrublines are actually advancing
24	up hill-slopes or northward into tundra where tall shrubs are currently absent.
25	

26 2. We test the hypothesis that willow shrublines have expanded to higher elevations in relation
27 to climate across a 50 x 50 km area in the Kluane Region of the southwest Yukon Territory,
28 Canada by surveying of 379 shrubs at 14 sites and sampling of 297 of the surveyed shrubs at
29 10 sites. We compared growth and recruitment to climate variables to test the climate
30 sensitivity of shrub increase using annual radial growth analysis, age distributions and repeat
31 field surveys to estimate the current rate of shrubline advance.

32

We found consistent and increasing rates of recruitment of alpine willows, with estimates of
 faster advancing shrublines on shallower hill-slopes. Mortality was extremely low across the
 elevation gradient. Aspect, elevation and species identity did not explain variation in
 recruitment patterns, suggesting a regional factor, such as climate, as the driver of the
 observed shrubline advance.

38

39 4. Annual radial growth of willows was best explained by variation in summer temperatures, 40 and recruitment pulses by winter temperatures. Measured recruitment rates are $\sim 20 \pm 5$ 41 individuals per hectare per decade (mean \pm SE) and measured rates of increased shrub cover of \sim 5 ± 1 % per decade (mean ± SE) measured at the Pika Camp site between field surveys 42 in 2009 and 2013. Our results suggest that shrubline will continue to advance over the next 43 44 50 years, if growing conditions remain suitable. However, if future conditions differ 45 between summer and winter seasons, this could lead to contrasting trajectories for 46 recruitment versus growth, and influence the vegetation change observed on the landscape. 47 48 Synthesis. Our findings in the context of a review of the existing literature indicate that elevational

49 and latitudinal shrublines, like treelines, are advancing in response to climate warming; however,

50 the trajectories of change will depend on the climate drivers controlling recruitment versus growth.

51 Introduction

52 Species distributions are expected to track climate at the global scale (Gaston 2009), and tundra ecosystems are an excellent place to test for climate-induced range expansion, as the tundra biome 53 54 is climate constrained and experiencing the most rapid change of any terrestrial biome on the planet 55 (Post et al. 2009). Climate warming has already altered ecological boundaries in high-latitude 56 ecosystems, and is thought to have contributed to the expansion of at least half of treelines into 57 Arctic and alpine tundra globally (Harsch et al. 2009). Beyond the treeline, tall-statured shrub 58 species are projected to expand their ranges with climate warming into previously low-statured 59 tundra communities (Post et al. 2009; Myers-Smith et al. 2011a), hereafter referred to as shrubline 60 advance. Though we have ample evidence of treeline advance from sites around the world (Harsch et al. 2009), an advancing shrubline in northern alpine tundra has been reported in only a few 61 62 studies (Dial et al. 2007, 2016; Hallinger, Manthey & Wilmking 2010; Upshall 2011; Rundqvist et 63 al. 2011) Wipf, Rixen and Stoecki up. d., Fig. 1). In tundra ecosystems, advance of the shrubline 64 ecotone will alter albedo, soil temperatures, nutrient turnover times, carbon cycling and 65 biodiversity, which could create feedbacks to future shrub expansion and Arctic warming (Myers-66 Smith et al. 2011a; Pearson et al. 2013; Williamson et al. 2016). Thus, it is necessary to understand 67 the rates and drivers of shrubline advance, in addition to increased shrub growth and recruitment, to project future vegetation change in tundra ecosystems and resulting feedbacks to ecosystem 68 69 functions with warming.

70

Tundra ecosystems have been dominated by woody vegetation in the past (Higuera *et al.* 2008) and there is ample evidence that shrub expansion is currently underway at sites across the tundra biome (Fig. 1, Myers-Smith *et al.* 2011a). Paleoecological records indicate that shrub species were much more abundant in high-latitude ecosystems during the warmer and wetter period of the early Holocene (Higuera *et al.* 2008). Recent observations from sites around the Arctic indicate a transition towards more dense shrubland (Sturm, Racine & Tape 2001; Tape, Sturm & Racine 2006; 77 Forbes, Macias-Fauria & Zetterberg 2010; Myers-Smith et al. 2011a; Macias-Fauria et al. 2012;

78 Ropars & Boudreau 2012; Tremblay, Lévesque & Boudreau 2012; Lantz, Marsh & Kokelj 2013;

79 Frost & Epstein 2014; Naito & Cairns 2015). And, future climate warming in tundra ecosystems is

80 projected to again lead to deciduous tree or shrub dominated tundra (Swann et al. 2010; Pearson et

81 *al.* 2013). However, evidence is lacking for advances of shrubline ecotones up hill-slopes in

82 mountain regions or northward into the Arctic, as most studies instead test for changes in the cover

84

83

or abundance of tundra shrubs (Fig. 1).

85 Climate is linked to the position of the shrubline ecotone (Lantz, Gergel & Kokelj 2010b) and is 86 often invoked as the cause of tree or shrubline advance (Truong, Palmé & Felber 2007; Harsch et al. 2009; Hallinger et al. 2010). Experimental studies also indicate that warming will increase the 87 88 dominance of shrub species in tundra ecosystems (Arft et al. 1999; Walker et al. 2006; Elmendorf 89 et al. 2012a), and this is corroborated by observations of greater shrub increases at sites that have 90 experienced greater warming (Elmendorf *et al.* 2012b). Shrub growth has been demonstrated to be 91 climate sensitive (Forbes et al. 2010; Hallinger et al. 2010; Blok et al. 2011; Macias-Fauria et al. 92 2012; Myers-Smith et al. 2015a); however, new recruitment (Lantz, Gergel & Henry 2010a; 93 Boulanger-Lapointe et al. 2014; Büntgen et al. 2015), rather than growth alone, will drive shrubline 94 advance. Thus, it is still uncertain if the same climate or biological drivers will control shrubline 95 advance relative to shrub expansion in tundra ecosystems.

96

97 Treeline advance has been studied in more detail than changes in the elevation limit of tall shrub 98 species, and the reported drivers of treeline advance, though often linked to climate, are varied 99 (Harsch & Bader 2011). A global meta-analysis of 166 treelines found that over half had advanced 100 in elevation since 1900, while just under half remained unchanged over the same period (Harsch *et* 101 *al.* 2009). Climate sensitivity of tree growth has been identified at treeline (Ettinger, Ford & 102 HilleRisLambers 2011); however, the controls on tree recruitment at treeline are often related more

103 closely to winter (rather than summer) weather and microenvironmental conditions (Wilmking et al. 104 2012; Hagedorn et al. 2014) or biotic interactions (HilleRisLambers et al. 2013). Shrubby treelines 105 such as the often low-statured mountain birch (*Betula pubescens* subsp. *tortuosa*) treeline have been 106 documented to be advancing in alpine ecosystems in Norway (Tømmervik et al. 2009; Hofgaard, 107 Dalen & Hytteborn 2009) and Sweden (Kullman 2002; Sundqvist, Björk & Molau 2008). However, shrubline dynamics have been little studied relative to treeline advance, with only a few studies 108 109 investigating shrubline advance (Dial et al. 2007, 2016; Hallinger et al. 2010; Upshall 2011; 110 Rundqvist et al. 2011; Stöckli et al. 2011) and recruitment (Lantz et al. 2010a; Boulanger-Lapointe 111 et al. 2014; Büntgen et al. 2015) in tundra ecosystems (Fig. 1). Because shrubline advance is so 112 infrequently studied, we lack a complete understanding of the drivers of ecological boundaries 113 beyond treelines.

114

115 In this study, we tested the hypothesis that the willow shrubline has advanced over the past 50 years 116 in our focal research site in the Kluane region of the southwest Yukon Territory, Canada. We 117 compared largest stem initiation and growth rates to climate variables to test the climate sensitivity 118 of shrub recruitment and growth. If shrubline advance is related to a large-scale regional driver such 119 as climate, we predict consistent evidence of new recruitment across the study region. If shrubline 120 advance is mediated by local-scale processes, such as microclimate, herbivory or disturbances, we 121 predict variation in recruitment patterns across the region. We used dendroecology to investigate shrub largest stem initiation over the second half of the 20th century and repeat ecological 122 123 monitoring over a four-year period (2009 - 2013) to calculate current, and estimate future, rates of 124 cover change, recruitment, age distributions and shrub densities at the elevational shrubline in this 125 high-latitude alpine tundra ecosystem.

127 Materials and Methods

128 *Literature Review*

129 We surveyed the literature for all studies presenting evidence of shrub dynamics including: 130 patch/cover change, infilling or recruitment change in existing shrub tundra, and advance of the 131 latitudinal or elevational shrubline (Fig. 1). We began with existing reviews of shrub expansion 132 (Myers-Smith et al. 2011a; Büntgen et al. 2015) and then supplemented these literature reviews 133 using the search terms: "tundra" and "shrub" and conducting a comprehensive search for the years 2011 to 2016 using both Web of Science and Google Scholar. We recorded the shrub change 134 135 observed, coordinates of the study sites, species under investigation, methods used, sample size and 136 other relevant information for all studies identified (Table S1).

137

138 Field surveys

We investigated shrubline advance along 26 hill-slopes in 14 sites in the Kluane region of the
southwest Yukon Territory (Table S2, Fig. 3a, Fig. S1 and S2) from 2007 to 2009. The Kluane
Region is located along the continental divide where the Pacific flora transitions into the Arctic
flora (Cody 2000). Glacial refugia are thought to have been located in this region (Brubaker *et al.*2005), which could be a factor influencing the present-day variation in species composition (Fig.
S2).

145

At each site, we established a survey transect parallel to the contours of the valley hill-slope at shrubline, the maximum elevation at which tall willow species grow (Fig. 2, Table S2). We searched for the highest elevation at which a plant from any of the tall willow species grew along the hill-slope. This individual became the first transect point and shrub to be surveyed along the shrubline transect. We identified each willow individual for each different species found within 3 m of a transect point located every 10 m along the hill-slope from the first shrub sampled, until we had sampled 8 individuals for age determination and growth ring width measurements. If no willows 153 were present at a given transect point, we walked further along or slightly down towards the

154 shrubline transition until the next willow was reached. This survey method allowed for the distance 155 among individuals and the density of shrubs at the shrubline ecotone to be calculated.

156

After surveying at shrubline, we walked down the hill-slope until reaching a subjectively estimated zone of approximately 50% tall willow shrub cover. At two sites, Burwash and Bison, cover was closer to 20% as the topography of the valley did not permit surveying on the same aspect at a lower elevation (Table S2). At all sites except Printers Pass and Copper Joe Creek, we repeated this survey on the opposite aspect of the valley or in the case Five Lakes on the opposite side of the ridge, and for Aishihik Ridge and Cranberry Ridge, at a location further along the ridge (Table S2).

163

164 The six most abundant tall willow species in the Kluane Region were Salix pulchra Cham. 165 (diamond-leaf willow), Salix niphoclada Rydb. (barren-ground willow), Salix glauca L. Hook. (grey-leaf willow), Salix richardsonii Hook. (Richardson's willow), Salix barrattiana Hook. 166 167 (Barratt's willow), and Salix alaxensis Andersson (felt-leaf willow, Table S3, Fig. S2). During the 168 survey, we identified the species of each willow, and since these species are dioecious, we also identified the sex, if the individual had visible catkins (Myers-Smith & Hik 2012). When catkins 169 170 were absent, we were not able to distinguish between the species S. niphoclada and S. glauca 171 during field surveys. We have therefore combined these individuals into one taxonomic category; 172 however, we believe that most individuals sampled in this group are S. niphoclada. Species identifications were confirmed by George Argus (Emeritus, National Herbarium of Canada). The 173 location, elevation, hill-slope, and aspect were recorded, as well as the largest diameter of the shrub 174 175 patch and the maximum height.

176

177 *Climate data*

178 The Kluane Region has a continental climate that is also influenced by coastal weather patterns with 179 cold winters with October – February mean temperatures from -7°C to -15°C and relatively warm 180 summers with June – July mean temperatures from 7°C to 11°C at lower elevations around 800m (Fig. S3). We used lapse rate corrected monthly Climate Western North America (ClimateWNA) 181 182 v5.30 gridded temperature and precipitation data (4 x 4 km resolution, Wang et al. 2011) and Climate Research Unit (CRU) TS3.21 gridded temperature and precipitation data (0.5° resolution, 183 184 Harris, Ian 2013). These climate data correlate well with local meteorological station data (Myers-185 Smith et al. 2015a).

186

187 Sample collection

We collected stem samples from 297 individuals across 20 of the 26 hill-slopes at 10 of the 14 sites. 188 189 We collected a 3-5 cm sample of the largest stem of each individual for growth ring analysis just 190 above the stem-root interface along two elevational transects on two hill-slopes for a total of eight 191 individuals per transect and 32 individuals per valley (see above). Occasionally, samples could not 192 be collected due to low shrub prevalence (e.g. Copper Joe Creek) or could not be processed due to 193 wood rot or growth deformities, thus reducing the final sample sizes slightly at some sites (Table 194 S2). Sampling was not conducted at the sites Aishihik and Cranberry Ridge, was only conducted at 195 one aspect in Bison Valley, and at one elevation for Printer's Pass and Copper Joe Creek (Table 196 S2). At two sites with longer continuous elevation gradients, Gladstones and Observation Plateau, 197 we sampled again at a lower elevation where shrub cover was approximately 75% (Table S2).

198

In these alpine ecosystems near the elevational shrubline where shrub plants have few stems (from one to tens) and a stunted growth form, information from the base of the largest stem likely represents similar information to that found in the root collar, which may not be the case in more continuous shrub cover at lower elevations (Ropars *et al.* 2017). We restricted our sampling to higher elevations where willow patches were smaller and were non-contiguous in their extent (the average willow patch diameter was 100 cm and the average density of individuals was 17 per 100m,
Table S2), so that we were likely sampling only distinct genetic individuals. Although willow
species can spread laterally through clonal growth, individuals growing in these extreme
environments with shallow active-layer soil depths have been shown to be genetically distinct even
when growing in relatively close proximity (Douhovnikoff *et al.* 2010).

209

```
210 Age estimates
```

211 Age estimates were determined for all samples using dendrochronology following methods adapted 212 for tundra shrub species (Myers-Smith et al. 2015b). Rings were counted from thin cross sections of 213 the largest stems harvested just above the root collar. The age of shrub stems was estimated as the 214 maximum number of rings measured between four radii for each sample. We sampled two serial 215 sections ~5 cm apart along the largest stem of 25 individuals and age estimates differed by 2 ± 0.5 216 years (mean \pm SE). We compared age estimates between the first and second largest stems on 18 217 different shrub individuals, and found that the stem age varied by an average of 6 ± 2 years (mean \pm 218 SE) between these stems. Therefore, we assume that stem age estimates and the estimated initiation 219 dates of the largest stem could have an error of around ± 6 years. Stem ages are only minimum estimates because sometimes rings are missing, the pith of the stem is rotten, or the largest stem or 220 221 basal stem section might not represent the oldest part of the willow shrub. However, the estimated 222 years of initiation of stems gives a good indication of the overall history of growth of these high-223 elevation shrubs.

224

225 Growth measurements

To process samples for annual radial growth measurements, we made thin sections of the shrub stems, mounted the sections on glass slides, and took digital images with a microscope mounted digital camera. Each shrub section was measured along four radii for annual increment with a resolution of 1µm (WinDendro, Québec, Canada or ImageJ, Research Services Branch, National 230 Institute of Mental Health, Maryland, USA). Each at 90° from the other unless the placement of 231 radii had to be moved to avoid growth deformities or rotten wood, which occurred in approximately 10% of samples. To account for measurement error, we repeated the count for the first radii after 232 completing the other three radii. Missing rings were accounted for during the visual crossdating 233 234 conducted on the raw ring width measurements using marker rings such as the 2004 high growth 235 year and the 2001 low growth year. We identified missing rings in 19% of samples of these 236 repeated measurements. Willow stem sections varied in the ease at which rings could be counted 237 and the information that these rings contained. A statistic of the repeatability of the measurement 238 was calculated by correlating the ring width measurements between the two repeated radii. The 239 repeatability correlations (Pearson's r) was greater than 0.8 for 96% of samples. The radii for each 240 stem sample were averaged. A statistic of uniformity between the four radii was calculated for each 241 sample by averaging the correlation for each radius with the mean of all four radii. Correlations 242 (Pearson's *r*) among all of the sample radii were greater than 0.8 for 88% of the samples.

243

244 Growth data

We removed the first five years of growth to account for irregular growth patterns during early life stages. Data were not detrended to account for age-related growth, as these trends were not present in most shrub individuals and we wanted to treat all individuals in the same manner (Myers-Smith *et al.* 2015b). Growth data at the level of the individual and climate data at the site level were mean centred and variance scaled using the standard score to convert all growth and climate data into the same units and to meet the assumption of normality.

251

252 Shrubline Advance Estimates

Shrub densities were calculated from the sampling protocol as the number of shrub individuals
encountered along the length of the sampling transect with a final unit of shrubs per 100 m of
transect (Table S2). To calculate shrubline advance, we estimated the rate of change of shrub

density over time based on largest stem recruitment rates estimated from the dendroecological age
estimates among the two transect elevations. This was calculated as the slope of the linear
relationship between the number of shrubs per 100 m as recruitment progresses and time in years
(see Fig S5). Thus, our estimates of shrubline advance assumed that hill-slopes with higher rates of
shrubline advance had 1) greater rates of increasing shrub densities over time, and 2) greater
differences in age distributions among transects at shrubline versus at lower elevations (Fig. S5).

262

263 Shrub cover change

We surveyed shrub cover, density, growth and recruitment in six 50 x 50 m plots at the Pika Valley site in July 2009 and 2013 following the Tall Shrub Monitoring Protocol (Myers-Smith *et al.* 2009). Clonal species can have extremely long lifespans and might not experience any age-related senescence over time (de Witte and Stöcklin, 2010); therefore, tundra willow patches, once established and growing in conditions with limited herbivory and stem dieback, can continue to expand for decades. We used willow densities calculated from distances among individuals, percent cover and patch sizes collected in the field surveys to quantify current and future tall willow cover.

271

272 Statistical analysis of age distributions

273 Statistics were conducted with the software R (version 3.2.2, R Development Core Team, Vienna). 274 We used linear models to test for differences of shrubline advance and elevations between sites. We 275 compared the minimum age of shrub individuals among sites using Kruskal-Wallis tests or between 276 elevations among sites using Friedman rank sum tests using the package agricolae, because age 277 distributions at high elevations were right skewed and non-parametric tests were required. We used 278 mixed models with site as a random effect to test for a difference in patch width and height to 279 compare the patch size of shrubs between sites. We used MANOVA and ANOVA to test for 280 variation in patch size among species. We used a Shapiro-Wilk normality test to evaluate the age 281 distributions. The variables stem width, patch width, patch height, and age were log transformed to

meet criteria for normality and homogeneity of variance. We used time series analysis to test the correspondence between pulses of largest stem initiation and weather data using the stats, mFilter and TTR packages (Büntgen *et al.* 2015). We used linear models to test the correspondence between detrended largest stem initiation (Hodrick-Prescott filter) and summer (June-July) and winter (October-February) temperature and precipitation data including one-year lags.

287

288 Statistical analysis of growth data

289 We used a linear mixed model analysis to quantify the climate sensitivity of growth (Myers-Smith 290 et al. 2015b, a p.). Linear mixed models analysis can take into account hierarchical sampling 291 structure, temporal autocorrelation and unbalanced sampling (Crawley 2007). Linear mixed models are growing in popularity in annual radial growth analysis because these models can account for 292 293 variance in growth among years within individuals and variance among individuals within sites as 294 well as heterogeneity in growth patterns over time of different individuals growing at the same site 295 (Lapointe-Garant et al. 2010; Schmidt et al. 2010; Ettinger et al. 2011; Speed et al. 2011a; Subedi 296 & Sharma 2013). We used the nlme package to conduct the mixed model analysis, using maximum 297 likelihood estimation for model selection and restricted maximum likelihood estimation for slope 298 estimates (Crawley 2007). We mean-centred and variance scaled all growth ring data at the 299 individual level and climate data at the site-level prior to analysis, so that we can calculate the 300 climate sensitivity among individuals at different sites. Our model structure included annual radial 301 growth as the response variable, fixed effects included climate variables, and random intercepts for vear and an autocorrelation structure (AR1, autoregressive process of order one). We calculated the 302 conditional R² value for each mixed model using the r.squaredGLMM function of the MuMIn 303 304 package (Nakagawa & Schielzeth 2013). We did not include random slopes in addition to random 305 intercepts as this level of complexity led to singular convergences.

307 Model selection can be used to identify a single best model from a set of competing models

308 (Johnson & Omland 2004). We tested 33 climate models chosen to represent the climate variables
309 that we hypothesized would best explain the variation in annual radial growth and a null model. The
310 33 models included seasonal temperatures or precipitation variables and a selection of models with

311 both temperature and precipitation variables. We used the same climate models as used by Myers-

312 Smith et al. (2015a; sup. info) in a tundra biome-wide synthesis of annual radial growth data.

313

314 Estimates of shrub cover change

We used our collected age distribution, shrub cover and field survey data to make a simple projection of future patch expansion of tundra shrubs overtime across the Kluane Region. We used exponential relationships to project patch size increase with age, based on the change in patch size of currently existing shrub patches over a 50-year period, and compared these results to measured increases over a four-year period (2009 - 2013). The 95% quantile relationship was calculated using the quantreg package.

321

322 **Results**

Our literature review indicated few studies demonstrating shrubline advance and increased shrub 323 324 recruitment at sites around the tundra biome (Fig. 1, Table S1). Only six other studies at five study 325 sites investigated shrubline advance beyond current elevational limits of shrub species in addition to 326 this study (Dial et al. 2007, 2016; Hallinger et al. 2010; Upshall 2011; Rundqvist et al. 2011; 327 Stöckli et al. 2011), and none investigated shrubline advance beyond latitudinal limits of the species. Ten studies investigated recruitment of tundra shrubs. All of the above studies find some 328 329 evidence for shrubline advance and increased recruitment at sites around the tundra biome (Table 330 S1), with two of the studies indicating both increases and decreases or stable shrublines (Rundqvist 331 et al. 2011) or recruitment rates (Boulanger-Lapointe et al. 2014).

333 Our field surveys of 379 individuals at 14 sites indicated that shrub density and the stature of tall 334 willows decreased from treeline with greater elevation (Table S2). Our sampling of 297 of the surveyed individuals at 10 sites indicated skewed age distributions and younger willows at 335 336 shrubline transects than in the zone of 50% shrub cover (Fig. 5 and Fig. S4; Friedman rank sum test = 14.22, $F_{2,144}$ = 64, $P_{\chi 2} < 0.01$, P < 0.01). Ages at shrubline did not vary significantly between sites 337 (Kruskal-Wallis $\chi^2 = 34.40$, df = 36, P = 0.54). Shrub density differed between sites (Table S2); 338 339 however, all sites showed similar patterns of largest stem initiation and increasing density over time (Fig. S5). Only one case of mortality was observed in the survey of 379 individuals, and 340 341 observations of stem mortality were very infrequent. When travelling between sites, only three dead 342 individuals were observed, with evidence of stem girdling present in each case, likely as a result of 343 small mammal herbivory. The rates of shrubline advance (Fig. 3a) and elevation of shrubline (Fig. 344 S1) varied across the Kluane Region. Shrubline advance was negatively correlated with the hillslope of the alpine valleys (Fig. 3a) and was not explained by aspect and elevation (linear model, P 345 = ns). Willows were smaller at shrubline relative to those found at lower elevations (Table S2, 346 347 linear mixed models, shrubline estimate \pm SE = -0.44 \pm 0.06 m, t-value = -7.39, P < 0.01).

348

349 Tall willow diversity was variable across the Kluane Region with different willow species growing 350 at the shrubline ecotone (Fig. S2). However, three species, S. niphoclada, S. pulchra, and S. 351 *richardsonii*, were most abundant and made up ~ 80% of all the individuals sampled. Age among all willow species surveyed did not differ significantly (Kruskal-Wallis, $\chi^2 = 60.74$, df = 51, P = 352 0.17). Patch sizes, measured as both width and height, varied between species (MANOVA, Pillai's 353 trace = 0.25, $F_{10.564}$ = 7.91, P < 0.01) and this was due to variation in the growth form of the more 354 355 rarely sampled species. Salix alaxensis individuals grew taller, and S. barratiana individuals were 356 generally shorter in stature than the other species. No differences were observed in height of the three most commonly surveyed species (ANOVA, $F_{2,224} = 1.39$, P = 0.25); however, patch sizes 357 358 were larger for *S. pulchra* (ANOVA, $F_{2,224} = 8.61$, P < 0.01, Tukey's Test pair-wise comparisons).

359

360 Largest stem initiation pulses were correlated with winter temperatures (Fig. 5) and the variation in 361 annual radial growth of willows was best explained by summer temperatures (Fig. 6, Fig. 86, Table 362 S4). Climate sensitivity of willow annual radial growth was variable across the Kluane Region (Fig. 363 6, Fig. S6, Table S4) and this variability was not explained by hill-slope, elevation or species composition (linear mixed models, P = ns). We observed shrub recruitment rates of $\sim 20 \pm 5$ 364 365 individuals per hectare per decade (mean \pm SE) and measured rates of increased shrub cover of \sim 5 \pm 366 1% per decade (mean \pm SE) from seedling and patch expansion surveys at the Pika Camp site over 367 the period 2009 to 2013. Using a simplified relationship between age and patch size constrained by 368 the monitoring data, and based on the assumption that conditions will remain similarly favourable, we estimated that willow cover will increase by at least 20 percent at lower elevations and could 369 370 increase as much as five-fold at the shrubline ecotone over the next 50 years (Fig. 7).

371

372 Discussion

373 This study provides compelling evidence for wide-spread recent advance of the shrubline across 374 high-latitude alpine tundra of the Kluane Region. While it is commonly assumed that there is ample 375 evidence for shrubline advance in tundra ecosystems eg. IPCC Working Group II (2014), studies 376 documenting shrubline advance or increasing shrub recruitment are rare (Fig. 1, Table S1). In the 377 Kluane Region, we found uniform patterns of increases in the initiation of the largest stems among 378 species and sites with differing aspects and hill-slopes. This indicates that a regional driver such as 379 climate warming is likely to be responsible for the observed changes. Annual radial growth of these 380 willow species was best explained by interannual variation in summer temperatures, and pulses of 381 initiation of the largest stems by winter temperatures. A previous literature review of recruitment 382 rates of tundra shrubs did not identify a consistent timing of increased recruitment at sites around 383 the tundra biome (Büntgen et al. 2015).

385 In the Kluane Region, the earliest pulse in the initiation of the largest stems of shrubs at shrubline 386 occurred between 1989 and 1996, and began earlier, between 1980 – 1985, in the 50% shrub cover 387 zone (Fig. 4). Summer temperatures have been warming gradually in the region since 1960 and general increase in winter temperatures have occurred since the early 1980s (Fig. S3). We observed 388 389 almost no dead individuals, and saw little evidence of dieback or dead stems in the field surveys, 390 indicating that adult willow mortality has been very low in recent years. In cold tundra 391 environments, woody material decomposes slowly (Hobbie 1996) and should be preserved on the 392 landscape for decades. The observed high recruitment rates and low mortality, climate sensitivity of 393 initiation of largest stems and growth indicate that a rapid change in shrub cover is currently 394 occurring in alpine tundra of the Kluane region. If conditions remain favourable for growth and recruitment over the next 50 years, tall willow cover could increase by 20% or more and shrubline 395 396 could continue to advance in this region (Fig. 7).

397

398 Shrubline advance

399 We suggest that climate warming has improved growth and recruitment conditions, leading to the 400 observed increased shrub abundance and cover in the Kluane Region. We found a uniform pattern 401 of shrubline advance between the four dominant tall willow species and an increasing rate of largest 402 stem initiation across the Kluane Region. The age of willow stems was surprisingly uniform among 403 sites and between species, with a median shrubline age of 17 years at the shrubline ecotone, despite 404 variation in shrubline elevation. Rapid advance of white spruce treeline (Picea glauca) on south-405 facing hill-slopes and stable treelines on north-facing hill-slopes have been observed in this region 406 (Danby & Hik 2007). However, we observed no variation in age, height or advance of shrubline 407 with valley aspect. Our results indicate a contrasting importance of microclimate for treeline versus 408 shrubline advance in this region, and that regional factors are more important than local factors as 409 drivers of shrubline advance.

411 *Climate warming*

412 Our results suggest that growth and initiation of largest stems are controlled by different climate 413 variables in the Kluane Region. Annual radial growth of willows correlated best with summer 414 temperatures, whereas pulses in the initiation of largest stems correlated best with winter 415 temperatures. Climate has been identified as a significant factor influencing the growth (Forbes et 416 al. 2010; Hallinger et al. 2010; Blok et al. 2011; Macias-Fauria et al. 2012; Tape et al. 2012; 417 Elmendorf et al. 2012b; Weijers et al. 2012; Myers-Smith et al. 2015a p.) and establishment 418 (Harsch et al. 2009; Van Bogaert et al. 2010; Harsch & Bader 2011; Mamet & Kershaw 2012) of 419 woody species in northern alpine or tundra ecosystems. Summer temperatures could either 420 negatively influence (Shevtsova et al. 2009) or promote (Graae, Alsos & Eirnaes 2008; Milbau et 421 al. 2009; Büntgen et al. 2015) seedling establishment, and winter temperatures and cold 422 stratification can influence seed germination rates, seedling mortality and fungal infection (Graae et 423 al. 2008; Wilmking et al. 2012; Hagedorn et al. 2014). In alpine ecosystems, where snow is 424 redistributed by wind, seedlings may be exposed to atmospheric temperatures rather than being 425 protected by an insulating snow pack and thus increasing winter mortality on exposed ridges (Wipf, Stoeckli & Bebi 2009; Myers-Smith & Hik 2013). 426

427

428 Factors other than climate, such as cold-induced photoinhibition, permafrost disturbance, herbivory 429 or plant-plant interactions, could also influence growth and recruitment at elevational treelines and 430 shrublines (Harsch et al. 2009; Myers-Smith et al. 2011a; HilleRisLambers et al. 2013). In the 431 Kluane Region, shallow alpine tundra soils are underlain by bedrock, and thus permafrost thaw will 432 likely have less influence on surface conditions and shrub recruitment or productivity relative to 433 other tundra environments (Natali, Schuur & Rubin 2012; Wilmking et al. 2012). Signs of 434 herbivory on shrubs are low in the Kluane Region relative to other tundra ecosystems (Christie et 435 al. 2015; Barrio et al. 2016). The major herbivores on tundra shrubs include ptarmigan browsing 436 new buds in spring, non-cyclic insect herbivores, stem herbivory by small mammals including

marmots and rare browsing by moose or other large herbivores. Although not the focus of this
study, we believe that herbivory is unlikely to be a major limiting factor for shrub expansion
currently in the Kluane Region. In summary, our results point to climate as a driver of shrub
expansion and shrubline advance in the Kluane Region.

441

442 Similar to our observations for shrublines, treeline advance has been documented in the Kluane 443 Region and has been attributed to summer warming (Danby & Hik 2007). Summer temperatures have increased by approximately 1°C between 1980 and 2010 in the Kluane area (Fig. S3), and this 444 445 warming is likely linked to the climate regime shifts observed in the North Western Pacific in 1977 446 and 1989 (Hare & Mantua 2000). Sporadic pulses of recruitment are a common phenomenon at treeline (Körner 2012), however age distributions of tall willow species in this study indicate 447 448 conditions for recruitment have gradually improved over the past half century. We found that pulses 449 in largest stem initiation were best explained by variation in winter temperatures indicating that 450 frost damage might be a driver of seedling mortality. We predict that if recruitment conditions 451 continue to remain favourable, increased recruitment will continue to occur in this region.

452

453 Disturbance

454 Disturbance can influence recruitment rates in tundra ecosystems. Fire (Lantz et al. 2010a, 2013) 455 and permafrost degradation (Lantz et al. 2009) have been positively associated with recruitment in 456 alder in the Western Canadian Arctic (Alnus viridis subsp. fruticosa) and caribou trampling has 457 been associated with increased recruitment of Betula glandulosa in Northern Ouebec (Ropars & 458 Boudreau 2012). In contrast, herbivory can limit the advance of woody species up hill-slopes in 459 northern mountainous regions (Cairns & Moen 2004; Olofsson et al. 2009; Hofgaard et al. 2009; 460 Van Bogaert et al. 2010; Speed et al. 2010, 2011b, 2012) and shrub encroachment in tundra 461 ecosystems has been shown to be reduced or inhibited by herbivores (Post & Pedersen 2008; 462 Olofsson et al. 2009; Tape et al. 2010; Christie et al. 2015). Various animal species feed on willow shrubs ranging from large herbivores such as caribou and reindeer (Olofsson *et al.* 2009; Forbes *et al.* 2010; Zamin & Grogan 2013; Bernes *et al.* 2015), birds such as ptarmigan (Tape *et al.* 2010),
small mammals such as voles and lemmings (Predavec & Danell 2001; Olofsson *et al.* 2009), and
herbivorous insects (Olofsson & Strengbom 2000; Den Herder, Virtanen & Roininen 2004).
Herbivory can influence both the establishment of new recruits and reduce the survival of adults.
However, the impacts of herbivory on recruitment will likely have a larger influence on the
population age structure (Speed *et al.* 2010).

470

471 In the Kluane Region, herbivore damage causing shrub death was only observed once in surveys of 472 hundreds of willow individuals. Because seedlings are small and difficult to observe, we likely under-sampled willows younger than ~10 years, and therefore we might not have entirely accounted 473 474 for seedling and sapling mortality. Willow seeds have variable and often low germination rates 475 (Shevtsova et al. 2009; Graae et al. 2010), and therefore studying the factors promoting recruitment 476 in these species is logistically difficult. It is likely that in addition to winter temperatures, growing 477 season conditions, disturbance regimes, nutrient availability, seed quality, seed production, other 478 reproductive factors, and variable herbivory could all interact to determine the new recruitment of 479 willow species. However, increasing recruitment in recent decades suggests that herbivory on 480 seedlings or other sources of mortality are not currently a major limiting factor of shrubline advance 481 in the Kluane Region.

482

483 *Limits to shrubline advance*

Our results indicate that the initiation of the largest stems of tall willows and shrub cover have
increased and will likely continue to increase, if growing conditions remain the same or continue to
improve as long as other factors do not become limiting. However, quantitatively projecting future
shrubline advance in this region is more difficult. Shrub growth and patch expansion is limited by
available resources (Tape *et al.* 2012), and shrubline advance is limited by factors such as substrate,

seed source and disturbance. Large-scale disturbances such as hill-slope erosion were observed at many of the sites that had low elevation shrublines. Hill-slopes with talus, scree or exposed rock are not sufficiently stable at higher elevations to support further willow range expansion. On many of the hill-slopes with high shrublines, tall willows are already growing close to the tops of ridges. Though these shrubline individuals were small in stature and did not make up a significant proportion of the overall shrub cover, they had successfully established and were persisting at these higher elevation sites.

496

497 We observed low reproductive effort and potential pollen or resource limitation in these individuals 498 (Myers-Smith, Saunders and Hik, unpublished data). Inadequate successful reproduction is one of 499 the common demographic explanations for range limits (Gaston 2009). Willows growing at the 500 highest elevations in Kluane might not be reproductive and many established seedlings at the 501 shrubline ecotone could come from seed sources located further down the hill-slope. Reproduction 502 could improve with age allowing greater recruitment of individuals from seeds produced at high 503 elevations in the future. Although we predict further increase in cover of willow shrubs in this 504 region, shrubline advance could be limited by active disturbance, available soil substrates, seed 505 source and poor high-elevation reproduction.

506

507 Conclusions

508 Our findings add to the growing evidence of increases in shrub abundance in tundra ecosystems, 509 and provide one of the few examples of both upslope advancement and increasing rate of initiation 510 of largest stems of shrubs in relation to climate warming in tundra ecosystems (Fig. 1). We find that 511 contrasting seasons influence growth (summer) and largest stem initiation (winter) in this system. A 512 significant change in tall shrub canopy cover and elevational range extent will begin to alter a 513 variety of factors from soil temperatures and nutrients (Blok *et al.* 2010; Buckeridge *et al.* 2010; 514 Myers-Smith & Hik 2013) to habitat availability for tundra-dwelling animal species (Wheeler & Hik 2013; Boelman *et al.* 2015), which could feedback to influence tundra ecosystem functions as a whole. If growing conditions remain the same or improve over the next 50 years, we predict that tall willow cover will increase by at least 20% and enhanced recruitment will continue to lead to further shrubline advance. However, our results highlight that with different climate drivers for growth and recruitment, variation in the rates of future climate change between summer and winter seasons could lead to different trajectories for vegetation dynamics in this high-latitude alpine tundra.

521

522 Authors' contributions

523 IMS and DH conceived the study; IMS collected and analysed the data; IMS wrote the paper with524 contributions from DH.

525

526 Acknowledgements

527 Thank you to reviewers for providing very constructive revisions, to U. Büntgen for providing very

528 helpful suggestions regarding the time series analysis, to S. Williamson for providing hill-slope and

529 aspect data and to A. Trant, A.D. Bjorkman, H.D. Thomas, S. Angers-Blondin, J. Assmann, J.

530 Boyle and S. Nielsen for providing very helpful comments on this manuscript. Field and laboratory

531 assistance was provided by M.M. Grabowski, T.L. Elliot, A. Briggs, N. Stafl, C. Henry, J.

532 Pongracz, C. McDonald, E. Vezeau, H. Quinn, K. Reaume and M. Wong. This research was funded

533 by the Canon National Parks Science Scholars Program, Government of Canada International Polar

534 Year Program (PPS Arctic Canada Project), NSERC (Discovery, Northern Research Supplement,

and International Polar Year Programs), the Arctic Institute of North America, the Canada

536 Foundation for Innovation, the Northern Research Institute at Yukon College, Alberta Ingenuity,

537 the Northern Scientific Training Program, and the Circumpolar/Boreal Alberta Research Grant

538 Program, Canadian Circumpolar Institute, and Air North, Yukon's Airline (flight discounts). We

thank the Kluane First Nation for the opportunity to conduct research on their traditional lands.

541 Data Accessibility

542 Data are available at the polar data catalogue (<u>https://www.polardata.ca</u> Reference Number = 1647).

543 References

- Aiken, S.G., Dallwitz, M.J., Consaul, L.L., McJannet, C.L., Boles, R.L., Argus, G.W., Gillett, J.M.,
 Scott, P.J., Elven, R., LeBlanc, M.C., Gillespie, L.J., Brysting, A.K., Solstad, H. & Harris,
 J.G. (2003) Flora of the Canadian Arctic Archipelago NRC Research Press. URL
 http://www.mun.ca/biology/delta/arcticf/ [accessed 4 March 2010]
- Anthelme, F., Villaret, J.-C. & Brun, J.-J. (2007) Shrub encroachment in the Alps gives rise to the
 convergence of sub-alpine communities on a regional scale. *Journal of Vegetation Science*,
 18, 355–362.
- Arft, A.M., Walker, M.D., Gurevitch, J., Alatalo, J.M., Bret-Harte, M.S., Dale, M., Diemer, M.,
 Gugerli, F., Henry, G.H.R., Jones, M.H., Hollister, R.D., Jónsdóttir, I.S., Laine, K.,
 Lévesque, E., Marion, G.M., Molau, U., Mølgaard, P., Nordenhäll, U., Raszhivin, V.,
 Robinson, C.H., Starr, G., Stenström, A., Stenström, M., Totland, Ø., Turner, P.L., Walker,
 L.J., Webber, P.J., Welker, J.M. & Wookey, P.A. (1999) Responses of tundra plants to
 experimental warming: meta-analysis of the international tundra experiment. *Ecological Monographs*, **69**, 491–511.
- Barrio, I.C., Hik, D.S., Jónsdóttir, I.S., Bueno, C.G., Mörsdorf, M.A. & Ravolainen, V.T. (2016)
 Herbivory Network: An international, collaborative effort to study herbivory in Arctic and alpine ecosystems. *Polar Science*, 10, 297–302.
- Bernes, C., Bråthen, K.A., Forbes, B.C., Speed, J.D. & Moen, J. (2015) What are the impacts of
 reindeer/caribou (Rangifer tarandus L.) on arctic and alpine vegetation? A systematic
 review. *Environmental Evidence*, 4, 1–26.
- Blok, D., Heijmans, M.M.P.D., Schaepman-Strub, G., Kononov, A.V., Maximov, T.C. & Berendse,
 F. (2010) Shrub expansion may reduce summer permafrost thaw in Siberian tundra. *Global Change Biology*, 16, 1296–1305.
- Blok, D., Sass-Klaassen, U., Schaepman-Strub, G., Heijmans, M.M.P.D., Sauren, P. & Berendse, F.
 (2011) What are the main climate drivers for shrub growth in Northeastern Siberian tundra? *Biogeosciences*, 8, 1169–1179.
- Boelman, N.T., Gough, L., Wingfield, J., Goetz, S., Asmus, A., Chmura, H.E., Krause, J.S., Perez,
 J.H., Sweet, S.K. & Guay, K.C. (2015) Greater shrub dominance alters breeding habitat and
 food resources for migratory songbirds in Alaskan arctic tundra. *Global Change Biology*,
 21, 1508–1520.
- Boulanger-Lapointe, N., Lévesque, E., Boudreau, S., Henry, G.H.R. & Schmidt, N.M. (2014)
 Population structure and dynamics of Arctic willow (Salix arctica) in the High Arctic.
 Journal of Biogeography, 41, 1967–1978.
- Brubaker, L.B., Anderson, P.M., Edwards, M.E. & Lozhkin, A.V. (2005) Beringia as a glacial
 refugium for boreal trees and shrubs: new perspectives from mapped pollen data. *Journal of Biogeography*, **32**, 833–848.
- Buchwal, A., Rachlewicz, G., Fonti, P., Cherubini, P. & Gärtner, H. (2013) Temperature modulates
 intra-plant growth of Salix polaris from a high Arctic site (Svalbard). *Polar Biology*, 36,
 1305–1318.

- Buckeridge, K.M., Zufelt, E., Chu, H. & Grogan, P. (2010) Soil nitrogen cycling rates in low arctic
 shrub tundra are enhanced by litter feedbacks. *Plant and Soil*, 330, 407–421.
- Buizer, B., Weijers, S., van Bodegom, P.M., Alsos, I.G., Eidesen, P.B., van Breda, J., de Korte, M.,
 van Rijckevorsel, J. & Rozema, J. (2012) Range shifts and global warming: Ecological
 responses of Empetrum nigrum L. to experimental warming at its northern (high Arctic) and
 southern (Atlantic) geographical range margin. *Environmental Research Letters*, 7, 025501.
- Büntgen, U., Hellmann, L., Tegel, W., Normand, S., Myers-Smith, I.H., Kirdyanov, A.V.,
 Nievergelt, D. & Schweingruber, F.H. (2015) Temperature-induced recruitment pulses of
 Arctic dwarf shrub communities. *Journal of Ecology*, 103, 489–501.
- Cairns, D.M. & Moen, J. (2004) Herbivory influences tree lines. *Journal of Ecology*, 92, 1019–
 1024.
- Campioli, M., Schmidt, N.M., Albert, K.R., Leblans, N., Ro-Poulsen, H. & Michelsen, A. (2013)
 Does warming affect growth rate and biomass production of shrubs in the High Arctic?
 Plant Ecology, 214, 1049–1058.
- Cannone, N., Sgorbati, S. & Guglielmin, M. (2007) Unexpected impacts of climate change on
 alpine vegetation. *Frontiers in Ecology and the Environment*, 5, 360–364.
- 599 Christie, K.S., Bryant, J.P., Gough, L., Ravolainen, V.T., Ruess, R.W. & Tape, K.D. (2015) The
 600 role of vertebrate herbivores in regulating shrub expansion in the Arctic: A synthesis.
 601 *BioScience*, biv137.
- 602 Cody, W.J. (2000) Flora of the Yukon Territory. NRC Research Press, Ottawa, Canada.
- 603 Crawley, M.J. (2007) Mixed-Effects Models. The R Book, Second Edition, 681–714.
- Danby, R.K. & Hik, D.S. (2007) Variability, contingency and rapid change in recent subarctic
 alpine tree line dynamics. *Journal of Ecology*, 95, 352–363.
- Daniëls, F.J.A., de Molenaar, J.G., Chytrý, M. & Tichý, L. (2011) Vegetation change in southeast
 Greenland? Tasiilaq revisited after 40 years. *Applied Vegetation Science*, 14, 230–241.
- Den Herder, M., Virtanen, R. & Roininen, H. (2004) Effects of reindeer browsing on tundra willow
 and its associated insect herbivores. *Journal of Applied Ecology*, 41, 870–879.
- Dial, R.J., Berg, E.E., Timm, K., McMahon, A. & Geck, J. (2007) Changes in the alpine foresttundra ecotone commensurate with recent warming in southcentral Alaska: Evidence from
 orthophotos and field plots. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, **112**, 15 PP.
- Dial, R.J., Scott Smeltz, T., Sullivan, P.F., Rinas, C.L., Timm, K., Geck, J.E., Carl Tobin, S.,
 Golden, T.S. & Berg, E.C. (2016) Shrubline but not treeline advance matches climate
 velocity in montane ecosystems of south-central Alaska. *Global Change Biology*, 22, 1841–
 1856.
- Douhovnikoff, V., Goldsmith, G.R., Tape, K.D., Huang, C., Sur, N. & Bret-Harte, M.S. (2010)
 Clonal diversity in an expanding community of arctic Salix spp. and a model for recruitment
 modes of arctic plants. *Arctic, Antarctic, and Alpine Research*, 42, 406–411.

- Dullinger, S., Dirnböck, T. & Grabherr, G. (2003) Patterns of shrub invasion into high mountain
 grasslands of the Northern Calcareous Alps, Austria. *Arctic, Antarctic, and Alpine Research*,
 35, 434–441.
- 623 E-Flora BC. (2012) URL http://www.geog.ubc.ca/biodiversity/eflora/ [accessed 31 August 2011]
- 624 Elmendorf, S.C., Henry, G.H.R., Hollister, R.D., Björk, R.G., Bjorkman, A.D., Callaghan, T.V., 625 Collier, L.S., Cooper, E.J., Cornelissen, J.H.C., Day, T.A., Fosaa, A.M., Gould, W.A., 626 Grétarsdóttir, J., Harte, J., Hermanutz, L., Hik, D.S., Hofgaard, A., Jarrad, F., Jónsdóttir, I.S., Keuper, F., Klanderud, K., Klein, J.A., Koh, S., Kudo, G., Lang, S.I., Loewen, V., May, 627 628 J.L., Mercado, J., Michelsen, A., Molau, U., Myers-Smith, I.H., Oberbauer, S.F., Pieper, S., Post, E., Rixen, C., Robinson, C.H., Schmidt, N.M., Shaver, G.R., Stenström, A., Tolvanen, 629 630 A., Totland, Ø., Troxler, T., Wahren, C., Webber, P.J., Welker, J.M. & Wookey, P.A. (2012a) Global assessment of experimental climate warming on tundra vegetation: 631 632 Heterogeneity over space and time. *Ecology Letters*, **15**, 164–175.
- 633 Elmendorf, S.C., Henry, G.H.R., Hollister, R.D., Björk, R.G., Boulanger-Lapointe, N., Cooper, E.J., 634 Cornelissen, J.H.C., Day, T.A., Dorrepaal, E., Elumeeva, T.G., Gill, M., Gould, W.A., Harte, J., Hik, D.S., Hofgaard, A., Johnson, D.R., Johnstone, J.F., Jónsdóttir, I.S., Jorgenson, 635 636 J.C., Klanderud, K., Klein, J.A., Koh, S., Kudo, G., Lara, M., Lévesque, E., Magnússon, B., May, J.L., Mercado-Di'az, J.A., Michelsen, A., Molau, U., Myers-Smith, I.H., Oberbauer, 637 638 S.F., Onipchenko, V.G., Rixen, C., Schmidt, N.M., Shaver, G.R., Spasojevic, M.J., Þórhallsdóttir, Þ.E., Tolvanen, A., Troxler, T., Tweedie, C.E., Villareal, S., Wahren, C.-H., 639 640 Walker, X., Webber, P.J., Welker, J.M. & Wipf, S. (2012b) Plot-scale evidence of tundra 641 vegetation change and links to recent summer warming. Nature Climate Change, 2, 453-642 457.
- Ettinger, A.K., Ford, K.R. & HilleRisLambers, J. (2011) Climate determines upper, but not lower,
 altitudinal range limits of Pacific Northwest conifers. *Ecology*, 92, 1323–1331.
- Forbes, B.C., Macias-Fauria, M. & Zetterberg, P. (2010) Russian arctic warming and "greening" are
 closely tracked by tundra shrub willows. *Global Change Biology*, 16, 1542–1554.
- Formica, A., Farrer, E.C., Ashton, I.W. & Suding, K.N. (2014) Shrub expansion over the past 62
 years in rocky mountain alpine tundra: Possible causes and consequences. *Arctic, Antarctic, and Alpine Research*, 46, 616–631.
- Fraser, R.H., Lantz, T.C., Olthof, I., Kokelj, S.V. & Sims, R.A. (2014) Warming-Induced shrub
 expansion and lichen decline in the western Canadian Arctic. *Ecosystems*, 17, 1151–1168.
- Frost, G.V. & Epstein, H.E. (2014) Tall shrub and tree expansion in Siberian tundra ecotones since
 the 1960s. *Global Change Biology*, 20, 1264–1277.
- Frost, G.V., Epstein, H.E., Walker, D.A., Matyshak, G. & Ermokhina, K. (2013) Patterned-ground
 facilitates shrub expansion in Low Arctic tundra. *Environmental Research Letters*, 8,
 015035.
- Gaston, K.J. (2009) Geographic range limits: achieving synthesis. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*, 276, 1395–1406.
- 659 GBIF. (2015) Global Biodiversity Information Facility. URL http://www.gbif.org/ [accessed 29
 660 January 2013]

- Graae, B.J., Alsos, I.G. & Ejrnaes, R. (2008) The impact of temperature regimes on development,
 dormancy breaking and germination of dwarf shrub seeds from arctic, alpine and boreal
 sites. *Plant Ecology*, **198**, 275–284.
- Graae, B.J., Ejrnæs, R., Lang, S.I., Meineri, E., Ibarra, P.T. & Bruun, H.H. (2010) Strong microsite
 control of seedling recruitment in tundra. *Oecologia*, 166, 565–576.
- Hagedorn, F., Shiyatov, S.G., Mazepa, V.S., Devi, N.M., Grigor'ev, A.A., Bartysh, A.A., Fomin,
 V.V., Kapralov, D.S., Terent'ev, M., Bugman, H., Rigling, A. & Moiseev, P.A. (2014)
 Treeline advances along the Urals mountain range driven by improved winter conditions? *Global Change Biology*, 20, 3530–3543.
- Hallinger, M., Manthey, M. & Wilmking, M. (2010) Establishing a missing link: Warm summers
 and winter snow cover promote shrub expansion into alpine tundra in Scandinavia. *New Phytologist*, **186**, 890–899.
- Hare, S.R. & Mantua, N.J. (2000) Empirical evidence for North Pacific regime shifts in 1977 and *Progress In Oceanography*, 47, 103–145.
- Harris, Ian. (2013) CRU TS3.21: Climatic Research Unit (CRU) Time-Series (TS) Version 3.21 of
 High Resolution Gridded Data of Month-by-month Variation in Climate (Jan. 1901 Dec.
 2012).
- Harsch, M.A. & Bader, M.Y. (2011) Treeline form a potential key to understanding treeline
 dynamics. *Global Ecology and Biogeography*, 20, 582–596.
- Harsch, M.A., Hulme, P.E., McGlone, M.S. & Duncan, R.P. (2009) Are treelines advancing? A
 global meta-analysis of treeline response to climate warming. *Ecology Letters*, 12, 1040–
 1049.
- Higuera, P.E., Brubaker, L.B., Anderson, P.M., Brown, T.A., Kennedy, A.T., Hu, F.S. & Chave, J.
 (2008) Frequent fires in ancient shrub tundra: Implications of paleorecords for arctic
 environmental change. *PLoS One*, 3, e0001744.
- Hill, G.B. & Henry, G.H.R. (2011) Responses of high arctic wet sedge tundra to climate warming
 since 1980. *Global Change Biology*, 17, 276–287.
- HilleRisLambers, J., Harsch, M.A., Ettinger, A.K., Ford, K.R. & Theobald, E.J. (2013) How will
 biotic interactions influence climate change–induced range shifts? *Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences*, **1297**, 112–125.
- Hobbie, S.E. (1996) Temperature and plant species control over litter decomposition in Alaskan
 tundra. *Ecological Monographs*, 66, 503–522.
- Hofgaard, A., Dalen, L. & Hytteborn, H. (2009) Tree recruitment above the treeline and potential
 for climate-driven treeline change. *Journal of Vegetation Science*, 20, 1133–1144.
- Hollesen, J., Buchwal, A., Rachlewicz, G., Hansen, B.U., Hansen, M.O., Stecher, O. & Elberling,
 B. (2015) Winter warming as an important co-driver for Betula nana growth in western
 Greenland during the past century. *Global Change Biology*, 21, 2410–2423.
- Hollister, R.D., May, J.L., Kremers, K.S., Tweedie, C.E., Oberbauer, S.F., Liebig, J.A., Botting,
 T.F., Barrett, R.T. & Gregory, J.L. (2015) Warming experiments elucidate the drivers of
 observed directional changes in tundra vegetation. *Ecology and Evolution*, 5, 1881–1895.

- Hudson, J.M.G. & Henry, G.H.R. (2009) Increased plant biomass in a high arctic heath community
 from 1981 to 2008. *Ecology*, 90, 2657–2663.
- Hudson, J.M.G., Henry, G.H.R. & Cornwell, W.K. (2011) Taller and larger: shifts in Arctic tundra
 leaf traits after 16 years of experimental warming. *Global Change Biology*, 17, 1013–1021.
- 705 IPCC Working Group II. (2014) Climate Change 2014: Impacts, Adaptation, and Vulnerability.
- Johnson, J.B. & Omland, K.S. (2004) Model selection in ecology and evolution. *Trends in Ecology & Evolution*, 19, 101–108.
- Joly, K., Jandt, R.R., Meyers, C.R. & Cole, M.J. (2007) Changes in vegetative cover on Western
 Arctic Herd winter range from 1981 to 2005: potential effects of grazing and climate
 change. *Rangifer Special Issue*, 17, 199–207.
- Jørgensen, R.H., Hallinger, M., Ahlgrimm, S., Friemel, J., Kollmann, J. & Meilby, H. (2015)
 Growth response to climatic change over 120 years for Alnus viridis and Salix glauca in
 West Greenland. *Journal of Vegetation Science*, 26, 155–165.
- Jørgensen, R., Meilby, H. & Kollmann, J. (2013) Shrub expansion in SW Greenland under modest
 regional warming: Disentangling effects of human disturbance and grazing. *Arctic, Antarctic, and Alpine Research*, 45, 515–525.
- Jorgenson, J.C., Raynolds, M.K., Reynolds, J.H. & Benson, A.-M. (2015) Twenty-five year record
 of changes in plant cover on tundra of northeastern Alaska. *Arctic, Antarctic, and Alpine Research*, 47, 785–806.
- Körner, C. (2012) Treelines will be understood once the functional difference between a tree and a
 shrub is. *AMBIO: A Journal of the Human Environment*, 41, 197–206.
- Kullman, L. (2002) Rapid recent range-margin rise of tree and shrub species in the Swedish
 Scandes. *Journal of Ecology*, **90**, 68–77.
- Lantz, T.C., Gergel, S.E. & Henry, G.H.R. (2010a) Response of green alder (Alnus viridis subsp.
 fruticosa) patch dynamics and plant community composition to fire and regional
 temperature in north-western Canada. *Journal of Biogeography*, 37, 1597–1610.
- Lantz, T.C., Gergel, S.E. & Kokelj, S.V. (2010b) Spatial heterogeneity in the shrub tundra ecotone
 in the Mackenzie Delta Region, Northwest Territories: Implications for arctic environmental
 change. *Ecosystems*, 13, 194–204.
- Lantz, T.C., Kokelj, S.V., Gergel, S.E. & Henry, G.H.R. (2009) Relative impacts of disturbance and temperature: persistent changes in microenvironment and vegetation in retrogressive thaw slumps. *Global Change Biology*, 15, 1664–1675.
- Lantz, T.C., Marsh, P. & Kokelj, S.V. (2013) Recent shrub proliferation in the Mackenzie Delta
 Uplands and microclimatic implications. *Ecosystems*, 16, 47–59.
- Lapointe-Garant, M.-P., Huang, J.-G., Gea-Izquierdo, G., Raulier, F., Bernier, P. & Berninger, F.
 (2010) Use of tree rings to study the effect of climate change on trembling aspen in Québec.
 Global Change Biology, 16, 2039–2051.

- Macias-Fauria, M., Forbes, B.C., Zetterberg, P. & Kumpula, T. (2012) Eurasian Arctic greening
 reveals teleconnections and the potential for structurally novel ecosystems. *Nature Climate Change*, 2, 613–618.
- Mackay, J.R. & Burn, C.R. (2011) A century (1910–2008) of change in a collapsing pingo, Parry
 Peninsula, Western Arctic Coast, Canada. *Permafrost and Periglacial Processes*, 22, 266–
 272.
- Mamet, S.D. & Kershaw, G.P. (2012) Subarctic and alpine tree line dynamics during the last 400
 years in north-western and central Canada. *Journal of Biogeography*, **39**, 855–868.
- Milbau, A., Graae, B.J., Shevtsova, A. & Nijs, I. (2009) Effects of a warmer climate on seed
 germination in the subarctic. *Annals of Botany*, **104**, 287–296.
- Myers-Smith, I.H., Elmendorf, S.C., Beck, P.S.A., Wilmking, M., Hallinger, M., Blok, D., Tape,
 K.D., Rayback, S.A., Macias-Fauria, M., Forbes, B.C., Speed, J.D.M., Boulanger-Lapointe,
 N., Rixen, C., Lévesque, E., Schmidt, N.M., Baittinger, C., Trant, A.J., Hermanutz, L.,
 Collier, L.S., Dawes, M.A., Lantz, T.C., Weijers, S., Jørgensen, R.H., Buchwal, A., Buras,
 A., Naito, A.T., Ravolainen, V., Schaepman-Strub, G., Wheeler, J.A., Wipf, S., Guay, K.C.,
 Hik, D.S. & Vellend, M. (2015a) Climate sensitivity of shrub growth across the tundra
 biome. *Nature Climate Change*, 5, 887–891.
- Myers-Smith, I.H., Forbes, B.C., Wilmking, M., Hallinger, M., Lantz, T., Blok, D., Tape, K.D.,
 Macias-Fauria, M., Sass-Klaassen, U., Lévesque, E., Boudreau, S., Ropars, P., Hermanutz,
 L., Trant, A.J., Collier, L.S., Weijers, S., Rozema, J., Rayback, S.A., Schmidt, N.M.,
 Schaepman-Strub, G., Wipf, S., Rixen, C., Ménard, C.B., Venn, S., Goetz, S., AndreuHayles, L., Elmendorf, S., Ravolainen, V., Welker, J., Grogan, P., Epstein, H.E. & Hik, D.S.
 (2011a) Shrub expansion in tundra ecosystems: dynamics, impacts and research priorities. *Environmental Research Letters*, 6, 045509.
- Myers-Smith, I.H., Hallinger, M., Blok, D., Sass-Klaassen, U., Rayback, S.A., Weijers, S., J. Trant,
 A., Tape, K.D., Naito, A.T., Wipf, S., Rixen, C., Dawes, M.A., A. Wheeler, J., Buchwal, A.,
 Baittinger, C., Macias-Fauria, M., Forbes, B.C., Lévesque, E., Boulanger-Lapointe, N., Beil,
 I., Ravolainen, V. & Wilmking, M. (2015b) Methods for measuring arctic and alpine shrub
 growth: A review. *Earth-Science Reviews*, 140, 1–13.
- Myers-Smith, I.H., Hallinger, M., Tape, K.D., Naito, A.T., Trant, A., Blok, D., Klaassen, U.S.,
 Weijers, S., Buchwal, A., Baittinger, C., Rayback, S.A., Dawes, M., Wheeler, J., Wipf, S.,
 Wilmking, M. & Rixen, C. Methods for measuring arctic and alpine shrub growth: The
 dendrochronology and ecology of the trees of the tundra.
- Myers-Smith, I.H. & Hik, D.S. (2012) Uniform female-biased sex ratios in alpine willows.
 American Journal of Botany, 99, 1243–1248.
- Myers-Smith, I.H. & Hik, D.S. (2013) Shrub canopies influence soil temperatures but not nutrient dynamics: An experimental test of tundra snow-shrub interactions. *Ecology and Evolution*, 3, 3683–3700.
- Myers-Smith, I.H., Hik, D.S., Kennedy, C., Cooley, D., Johnstone, J.F., Kenney, A.J. & Krebs, C.J.
 (2011b) Expansion of canopy-forming willows over the twentieth century on Herschel
 Island, Yukon Territory, Canada. *AMBIO*, 40, 610–623.

- Myers-Smith, I.H., Lantz, T.C., Leathem, J., Briggs, A., Elliot, T., Grabowski, M. & Stafl, N.
 (2009) *Tall Shrub Monitoring Protocol for Arctic and Alpine Tundra in Northwestern Canada and Alaska*.
- Naito, A.T. & Cairns, D.M. (2015) Patterns of shrub expansion in Alaskan arctic river corridors
 suggest phase transition. *Ecology and Evolution*, 5, 87–101.
- Nakagawa, S. & Schielzeth, H. (2013) A general and simple method for obtaining R2 from
 generalized linear mixed-effects models. *Methods in Ecology and Evolution*, 4, 133–142.
- Natali, S.M., Schuur, E.A.G. & Rubin, R.L. (2012) Increased plant productivity in Alaskan tundra
 as a result of experimental warming of soil and permafrost. *Journal of Ecology*, 100, 488–
 498.
- Olofsson, J., Oksanen, L., Callaghan, T., Hulme, P.E., Oksanen, T. & Suominen, O. (2009)
 Herbivores inhibit climate-driven shrub expansion on the tundra. *Global Change Biology*,
 15, 2681–2693.
- Olofsson, J. & Strengbom, J. (2000) Response of galling invertebrates on Salix lanata to reindeer
 herbivory. *Oikos*, 91, 493–498.
- Pattison, R.R., Jorgenson, J.C., Raynolds, M.K. & Welker, J.M. (2015) Trends in NDVI and tundra
 community composition in the Arctic of NE Alaska between 1984 and 2009. *Ecosystems*,
 18, 707–719.
- Pearson, R.G., Phillips, S.J., Loranty, M.M., Beck, P.S.A., Damoulas, T., Knight, S.J. & Goetz, S.J.
 (2013) Shifts in Arctic vegetation and associated feedbacks under climate change. *Nature Climate Change*.
- Plante, S., Champagne, E., Ropars, P., Boudreau, S., Lévesque, E., Tremblay, B. & Tremblay, J.-P.
 (2014) Shrub cover in northern Nunavik: can herbivores limit shrub expansion? *Polar Biology*, 37, 611–619.
- Post, E., Forchhammer, M.C., Bret-Harte, M.S., Callaghan, T.V., Christensen, T.R., Elberling, B.,
 Fox, A.D., Gilg, O., Hik, D.S., Hoye, T.T., Ims, R.A., Jeppesen, E., Klein, D.R., Madsen, J.,
 McGuire, A.D., Rysgaard, S., Schindler, D.E., Stirling, I., Tamstorf, M.P., Tyler, N.J.C., van
 der Wal, R., Welker, J., Wookey, P.A., Schmidt, N.M. & Aastrup, P. (2009) Ecological
 dynamics across the Arctic associated with recent climate change. *Science*, 325, 1355–1358.
- Post, E. & Pedersen, C. (2008) Opposing plant community responses to warming with and without
 herbivores. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 105, 12353–12358.
- Predavec, M. & Danell, K. (2001) The role of lemming herbivory in the sex ratio and shoot
 demography of willow populations. *Oikos*, **92**, 459–466.
- Rayback, S.A., Lini, A. & Henry, G.H. (2011) Spatial variability of the dominant climate signal in
 Cassiope tetragona from sites in arctic Canada. *Arctic*, 64, 98–114.
- Rinas, C.L., Dial, R.J., Sullivan, P.F., Smeltz, T.S., Tobin, S.C., Loso, M. & Geck, J.E. (2017)
 Thermal segregation drives patterns of alder and willow expansion in a montane ecosystem
 subject to climate warming. *Journal of Ecology*, n/a-n/a.

- Ropars, P., Angers-Blondin, S., Gagnon, M., Myers-Smith, I.H., Lévesque, E. & Boudreau, S.
 (2017) Different parts, different stories: climate sensitivity of growth is stronger in root
 collars versus stems in tundra shrubs. *Global Change Biology*, n/a-n/a.
- Ropars, P. & Boudreau, S. (2012) Shrub expansion at the forest-tundra ecotone: spatial
 heterogeneity linked to local topography. *Environmental Research Letters*, 7, 015501.
- Ropars, P., Lévesque, E. & Boudreau, S. (2015) How do climate and topography influence the
 greening of the forest-tundra ecotone in northern Québec? A dendrochronological analysis
 of Betula glandulosa. *Journal of Ecology*, n/a-n/a.
- Rozema, J., Weijers, S., Broekman, R., Blokker, P., Buizer, B., Werleman, C., El Yaqine, H.,
 Hoogedoorn, H., Fuertes, M.M. & Cooper, E. (2009) Annual growth of Cassiope tetragona
 as a proxy for Arctic climate: Developing correlative and experimental transfer functions to
 reconstruct past summer temperature on a millennial time scale. *Global Change Biology*, 15,
 1703–1715.
- Rundqvist, S., Hedenås, H., Sandström, A., Emanuelsson, U., Eriksson, H., Jonasson, C. &
 Callaghan, T.V. (2011) Tree and shrub expansion over the past 34 years at the tree-line near
 Abisko, Sweden. *AMBIO*, 40, 683–692.
- Schmidt, N.M., Baittinger, C., Kollmann, J. & Forchhammer, M.C. (2010) Consistent
 dendrochronological response of the dioecious Salix arctica to variation in local snow
 precipitation across gender and vegetation types. *Arctic, Antarctic, and Alpine Research*, 42,
 471–475.
- Schmidt, N.M., Kristensen, D.K., Michelsen, A. & Bay, C. (2012) High Arctic plant community
 responses to a decade of ambient warming. *Biodiversity*, 13, 191–199.
- Shevtsova, A., Graae, B.J., Jochum, T., Milbau, A., Kockelbergh, F., Beyens, L. & Nijs, I. (2009)
 Critical periods for impact of climate warming on early seedling establishment in subarctic
 tundra. *Global Change Biology*, 15, 2662–2680.
- Speed, J.D.M., Austrheim, G., Hester, A.J. & Mysterud, A. (2010) Experimental evidence for
 herbivore limitation of the treeline. *Ecology*, 91, 3414–3420.
- Speed, J.D.M., Austrheim, G., Hester, A.J. & Mysterud, A. (2011a) Browsing interacts with climate
 to determine tree-ring increment. *Functional Ecology*, 25, 1018–1023.
- Speed, J.D.M., Austrheim, G., Hester, A.J. & Mysterud, A. (2011b) Growth limitation of mountain
 birch caused by sheep browsing at the altitudinal treeline. *Forest Ecology and Management*,
 261, 1344–1352.
- Speed, J.D.M., Austrheim, G., Hester, A.J. & Mysterud, A. (2012) Elevational advance of alpine
 plant communities is buffered by herbivory. *Journal of Vegetation Science*, 23, 617–625.
- Stöckli, V., Wipf, S., Nilsson, C. & Rixen, C. (2011) Using historical plant surveys to track
 biodiversity on mountain summits. *Plant Ecology & Diversity*, 4, 415–425.
- Sturm, M., Racine, C.H. & Tape, K.D. (2001) Increasing shrub abundance in the Arctic. *Nature*,
 411, 546–547.
- Subedi, N. & Sharma, M. (2013) Climate-diameter growth relationships of black spruce and jack
 pine trees in boreal Ontario, Canada. *Global Change Biology*, **19**, 505–516.

- Sundqvist, M.K., Björk, R.G. & Molau, U. (2008) Establishment of boreal forest species in alpine
 dwarf-shrub heath in subarctic Sweden. *Plant Ecology & Diversity*, 1, 67.
- Swann, A.L., Fung, I.Y., Levis, S., Bonan, G.B. & Doney, S.C. (2010) Changes in Arctic
 vegetation amplify high-latitude warming through the greenhouse effect. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, **107**, 1295–1300.
- 862 Tape, K. (2010) *The Changing Arctic Landscape*. University of Alaska Press, Fairbanks, AK.
- Tape, K., Hallinger, M., Welker, J. & Ruess, R. (2012) Landscape heterogeneity of shrub expansion
 in Arctic Alaska. *Ecosystems*, 15, 711–724.
- Tape, K.D., Lord, R., Marshall, H.-P. & Ruess, R.W. (2010) Snow-mediated ptarmigan browsing
 and shrub expansion in arctic Alaska. *Ecoscience*, 17, 186–193.
- Tape, K.D., Sturm, M. & Racine, C.H. (2006) The evidence for shrub expansion in Northern Alaska
 and the Pan-Arctic. *Global Change Biology*, **12**, 686–702.
- Tømmervik, H., Johansen, B., Riseth, J.Å., Karlsen, S.R., Solberg, B. & Høgda, K.A. (2009) Above
 ground biomass changes in the mountain birch forests and mountain heaths of
 Finnmarksvidda, northern Norway, in the period 1957-2006. *Forest Ecology and Management*, 257, 244–257.
- Tremblay, B., Lévesque, E. & Boudreau, S. (2012) Recent expansion of erect shrubs in the Low
 Arctic: evidence from Eastern Nunavik. *Environmental Research Letters*, 7, 035501.
- Truong, C., Palmé, A.E. & Felber, F. (2007) Recent invasion of the mountain birch Betula
 pubescens ssp. tortuosa above the treeline due to climate change: genetic and ecological
 study in northern Sweden. *Journal of Evolutionary Biology*, 20, 369–380.
- Upshall, M. (2011) Simulating Vegetation Change in the Torngat Mountains, Labrador Using a
 Cellular Automata-Markov Chain Model. MSc, Memorial University of Newfoundland, St.
 John's, Newfoundland, Canada.
- Van Bogaert, R., Jonasson, C., De Dapper, M. & Callaghan, T.V. (2010) Range expansion of
 thermophilic aspen (Populus tremula L.) in the Swedish subarctic. *Arctic, Antarctic, and Alpine Research*, 42, 362–375.
- Villarreal, S., Hollister, R.D., Johnson, D.R., Lara, M.J., Webber, P.J. & Tweedie, C.E. (2012)
 Tundra vegetation change near Barrow, Alaska (1972–2010). *Environmental Research Letters*, 7, 015508.
- Walker, M.D., Wahren, C.H., Hollister, R.D., Henry, G.H.R., Ahlquist, L.E., Alatalo, J.M., Bret-Harte, M.S., Calef, M.P., Callaghan, T.V., Carroll, A.B., Epstein, H.E., Jónsdóttir, I.S., Klein, J.A., Magnússon, B., Molau, U., Oberbauer, S.F., Rewa, S.P., Robinson, C.H., Shaver, G.R., Suding, K.N., Thompson, C.C., Tolvanen, A., Totland, Ø., Turner, P.L., Tweedie, C.E., Webber, P.J. & Wookey, P.A. (2006) Plant community responses to experimental warming across the tundra biome. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, 103, 1342–1346.
- Wang, T., Hamann, A., Spittlehouse, D.L. & Murdock, T.Q. (2011) ClimateWNA—High Resolution Spatial Climate Data for Western North America. *Journal of Applied Meteorology and Climatology*, 51, 16–29.

- Weijers, S., Broekman, R. & Rozema, J. (2010) Dendrochronology in the High Arctic: July air
 temperatures reconstructed from annual shoot length growth of the circumarctic dwarf shrub
 Cassiope tetragona. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 29, 3831–3842.
- Weijers, S., Greve Alsos, I., Bronken Eidesen, P., Broekman, R., Loonen, M.J.J.E. & Rozema, J.
 (2012) No divergence in Cassiope tetragona: Persistence of growth response along a
 latitudinal temperature gradient and under multi-year experimental warming. *Annals of Botany*, 110, 653–665.
- Wheeler, H.C. & Hik, D.S. (2013) Arctic ground squirrels Urocitellus parryii as drivers and
 indicators of change in northern ecosystems. *Mammal Review*, 43, 238–255.

Williamson, S.N., Barrio, I.C., Hik, D.S. & Gamon, J.A. (2016) Phenology and species determine
 growing-season albedo increase at the altitudinal limit of shrub growth in the sub-Arctic.
 Global Change Biology, n/a-n/a.

- Wilmking, M., Sanders, T.G.M., Zhang, Y., Kenter, S., Holzkämper, S. & Crittenden, P.D. (2012)
 Effects of climate, site conditions, and seed quality on recent treeline dynamics in NW
 Russia: Permafrost and lack of reproductive success hamper treeline advance? *Ecosystems*, 15, 1053–1064.
- Wilson, S.D. & Nilsson, C. (2009) Arctic alpine vegetation change over 20 years. *Global Change Biology*, 15, 1676–1684.
- Wipf, S., Stoeckli, V. & Bebi, P. (2009) Winter climate change in alpine tundra: Plant responses to
 changes in snow depth and snowmelt timing. *Climatic Change*, 94, 105–121.
- Zamin, T.J. & Grogan, P. (2012) Birch shrub growth in the low Arctic: the relative importance of
 experimental warming, enhanced nutrient availability, snow depth and caribou exclusion.
 Environmental Research Letters, 7, 034027.
- Zamin, T.J. & Grogan, P. (2013) Caribou exclusion during a population low increases deciduous
 and evergreen shrub species biomass and nitrogen pools in low Arctic tundra. *Journal of Ecology*, 101, 671–683.



)25

Figure 1. Evidence of shrubline advance (red), increased recruitment (green) from the 60 studies of shrub change and 128 study locations at sites around the tundra biome identified in the literature. Six studies at five study sites investigated shrubline advance beyond current elevational limits of shrub species in addition to this study, and none investigated shrubline advance beyond latitudinal limits of the species. Ten studies investigated increased recruitment.





)32 Figure 2. Elevational shrub densities from treeline to shrubline (the maximum elevational extent at *)*33 which tall shrubs grow) in the Kluane Region of the Southwest Yukon. At treeline willow shrubs can *)*34 reach over 2m tall, at the 50% shrub zone canopy heights are around 50 cm, at shrubline canopy **)**35 heights are often 30 cm or lower (Table S2). The hill-slopes and soil substrate vary across the region **)**36 with more stable shrublines being found on steeper hill-slopes (such as the west-facing Decoeli hill-**)**37 slope pictured here with a shrubline of approx. 1600 m) and faster-advancing and higher shrublines **)**38 being found on shallower hill-slopes (such as the north-facing Kluane Plateau pictured here with a *)*39 shrubline of approx. 1900 m).





Figure 3. Evidence of shrubline advance (slope of the relationship between the number of shrubs per 100 m as recruitment progresses and time in years, see Fig S5) at sites across the Kluane Region of the Southwest Yukon. Shrublines that are advancing faster (a greater increase in shrub density over time) are indicated by larger red circles (A). Shrubline advance was higher for sites with more shallow hillslopes across the 11 alpine valleys studied (B). Hill-slope was the only measured topographic or ecological variable that explained variation in shrubline advance among the 11 study sites.





)48Figure 4. Age distributions indicate that shrublines are advancing in the Kluane Region of the)49Southwest Yukon. Age distributions of willows at (A) and below (B) shrubline are pooled for all sites)50at the shrubline and 50% shrub ecotones. The distribution of willows at shrubline is right skewed)51indicating a higher proportion of younger individuals at the shrubine ecotone (Shapiro-Wilk normality)52test, W = 0.94, P < 0.01).





Figure 5. Variation in willow recruitment at the elevational shrubline plotted as a detrended index from the time series analysis (green) in the Kluane Region of the Southwest Yukon is best explained by winter temperatures the year after germination (B). The red lines in plots A and B indicate the June – July mean and October – February mean temperatures and the blue lines indicate precipitation over the same periods. Climate data are CRU TS3.21 gridded temperature and precipitation data (0.5° resolution).



)61

Figure 6. Map of climate sensitivity of growth of willows across the Kluane Region of the Southwest Yukon. Summer temperatures best explained the variation in shrub growth at most sites. The size of the circle indicates the strength of the climate sensitivity (Δ AIC value, see Figure S5 for other indices of climate sensitivity); colour indicates the type of climate model that best explained the variation in growth. Climate data are ClimateWNA v5.30 gridded temperature and precipitation data (4 x 4 km resolution).







- incorporated into this simple projection, are likely to result in an even greater rate of increase if rates of
-)80 mortality, stem dieback and herbivory remain low. However, lack of suitable substrates further upslope
-)81 may limit shrub expansion.