



THE UNIVERSITY *of* EDINBURGH

Edinburgh Research Explorer

The Politics of Spanish Orientalism

Citation for published version:

Hopkins, C 2017, 'The Politics of Spanish Orientalism: Distance and Proximity in Tapiró and Bertuchi', *Art in Translation*, vol. 9, no. 1, pp. 134-167. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17561310.2017.1309927>

Digital Object Identifier (DOI):

[10.1080/17561310.2017.1309927](https://doi.org/10.1080/17561310.2017.1309927)

Link:

[Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer](#)

Document Version:

Peer reviewed version

Published In:

Art in Translation

General rights

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy

The University of Edinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact openaccess@ed.ac.uk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



The Politics of Spanish Orientalism. Distance and Proximity in Tapiró and Bertuchi

Claudia Hopkins (University of Edinburgh)

Abstract: The two Spanish artists José Tapiró y Baró and Mariano Bertuchi Nieto, have been neglected in English-speaking scholarship. They spent nearly half their lives in Morocco. They are not only significant for our understanding of Spanish Orientalism but also relevant to broader theoretical debates about Western attitudes towards Islamic cultures. This article teases out the nuanced subject positions, changing inflections and possible meanings of their representations of Morocco in the ten years prior to and during the Spanish Protectorate of Morocco (1912-1956). Tapiró's ethnographic portraits have a distancing effect, ranging from suggestions of "primitivity" to "fanaticism", which resonate with European calls for intervention in Morocco. Yet, their political meaning remains unstable and dependent on their viewing context. Bertuchi's varied practice intersects with Andalucismo ideology and the concept of a "Spanish-Moroccan brotherhood" that was used to justify Spain's colonial enterprise, including under Franco. On the one hand, the relation between cultural expression and power recalls Said's theory of Orientalism; on the other, Bertuchi's visual rhetoric of cultural proximity and its continued appeal to Spanish and Moroccan audiences serve to refigure orthodox understandings of Orientalism based on opposition (us/them). The two case studies further demonstrate that it would be misleading to speak of Spanish Orientalism as a single, unified discourse.

Key words: Mariano Bertuchi Nieto, José Tapiró y Baró, Andalucismo, Morocco, French and Spanish Protectorates of Morocco, al-Andalus, racial thinking, anthropology, colonialism, Franco

Introduction

“Foreign invaders, different in race, language, and ritual,” Marcelino Menéndez y Pelayo, c. 1880.¹

“I repeat [...] the Muslims of the peninsula were Spaniards: of Spanish race, of Spanish language, of Spanish character, preferences, tendencies and spirit,” Julián Ribera, 1928.²

“There is so much of us in them [Moroccans] and of them in us! Shared roots nourish our races...,” José Francés, 1951.³

These sample quotations by major intellectual figures of nineteenth- and twentieth-century Spanish culture not only indicate some of the fluctuations in attitudes towards Spain’s Islamic world but also challenge orthodox understandings of Orientalism with which we have become so familiar since the publication of Edward Said’s book *Orientalism* in 1978.⁴ According to Said’s theory, the West culturally produced the Islamic East as its ‘other,’ creating a discourse that served to perpetuate Western power in the so-called Orient. Over the last two decades, scholars from various disciplines, including art history, have revealed the limitations of this argument by demonstrating that Orientalism is more polyphonic, cross-cultural, and complex than Said’s theory first suggested.⁵

Significantly, with regards to Spain, Said himself admitted in the 2002 preface of the second Spanish edition of his *Orientalism* that Spain represented a remarkable exception to his cultural analysis of British, North American and French Orientalism because Islam had not been a “foreign” element in Spain’s cultural identity.⁶ Indeed, Spanish Orientalism arises from a unique historical framework that is not based on geographical separation between East and West. As is well known, large parts of Spain had been under Muslim rule in the middle ages (711-1492), *mudéjares* (Muslims living in Christian territories) continued to live in the East of Spain into the sixteenth century, and *moriscos* (Muslim converts) remained in Spain until their final expulsion to North Africa in the early seventeenth century. In the nineteenth century, Spain’s Islamic heritage played a significant part in debates surrounding Spain’s national and regional identities and also influenced attitudes vis-à-vis the nearest “living” Islamic world: Morocco. As the Hispanist Susan Martin-Márquez has persuasively demonstrated, many late nineteenth- and twentieth-century Spanish writers from across the ideological spectrum often emphasized racial and/or cultural proximity between Spain and Morocco—a self-serving Orientalism that justified Spain’s colonial interventions in Morocco (1912-1956). Others continued to argue for

“difference” in order to construct a modern, European identity for Spain.⁷ Depending on political and regional allegiances, positions and inflections could vary. It is therefore important to be aware of the nuances, tensions, and contradictions within the term “Spanish Orientalism.”

Building on such insights, this article focuses on two Spanish expatriate artists, who made Morocco their permanent home: José Tapiró y Baró (Reus 1836-Tangiers, 1913) and Mariano Bertuchi Nieto (Granada, 1884-Tetuan, 1955). In the light of ongoing debates on Orientalism, both are interesting figures for their close and long-term engagement with Moroccan culture, and offer rich material for exploring the diversity of Western attitudes to the Islamic world from a position sympathetic towards Islamic society. The Catalan Tapiró lived in Tangiers more or less permanently from 1876 until his death in 1913, while selling his watercolor paintings in Spain, Britain, and France. He has been neglected by twentieth-century art historians, partly due to the fact that so few of his works are in public collections. A systematic unearthing of biographical data and works has only been achieved recently by Jordi A. Carbonell, curator of the first monographic exhibition on Tapiró, held at the Museu Nacional d'Art de Catalunya in 2014.⁸ A less elusive figure is the Granada-born artist Mariano Bertuchi Nieto, who first went to Tangiers in 1898 and visited Morocco many times before settling permanently in Tetuan in 1930. A key figure for visualizing Morocco for Spanish audiences during the Protectorate period, he has been the subject of Spanish-language articles and exhibitions, but remains little known outside Spain.⁹

One claim recently made for Tapiró and Bertuchi is that they presented a progressively more ethnographic, positive, and “truthful” vision of Morocco, which marked a radical departure from the clichéd works produced by nineteenth-century Orientalism, such as the harem, odalisques, slaves, snake charmers, etc. (fig.1).¹⁰ Whilst not denying the documentary quality and ‘realist effect’ of their works, such as Bertuchi’s representation of a hurrying Moroccan postman (fig.2), it will be argued here that such imagery is not ideologically innocent but needs to be gauged against the intersecting historical, racial, and political issues that impacted on Spanish-Moroccan relations. The essay does not pretend to survey Tapiró’s work and the great breadth of Bertuchi’s practice (painting, illustration, graphic design, education,

restauration, exhibition-making) but aims to trace the transformative process that is at work in their cultural translations of Morocco, involving shifts, omissions, and deletions that may not be obvious to the viewer at first sight. What were the inflections of Tapiró's and Bertuchi's supposedly 'realist' vision of Morocco? How did their national and regional identities (Spanish, Catalan/Andalusian) impact on their approach? In broader terms, and beyond the sphere of their control, how were their Moroccan iconographies understood and inserted into a context in which racial issues and colonial ambitions stood at the forefront of intellectual and political debate? To what extent can expressions of empathy be taken at face value, and when—and when they are not—propaganda for colonialism?

Tapiró's Ethnographic Gaze

Tapiró's fascination with Spain's Islamic past and Morocco crystallized at the age of thirty-five with a visit to Granada, Tangiers, and Tetuan in 1871 with his close friend Mariano Fortuny y Marsal, Spain's most successful painter of exotic scenes, whom he greatly admired.¹¹ Following Fortuny's death in 1874, Tapiró returned to Tangiers in 1875, which subsequently became his permanent home and a constant source of inspiration.¹² His development of an Orientalist imagery based on close observation of Moroccan life and people rather than fantasy is not surprising. Fortuny himself had publicly criticized artists for depicting North African scenes without ever having left Spain,¹³ and by the 1870s Spanish critics also denounced the studio-based Orientalism practiced by Fortuny's followers as an inauthentic '*moromanía*' – an obsession with Moorish themes (examples are Tomàs Moragas, Antoni Fabrés, Francesc Masriera).¹⁴ Tapiró's search for authenticity can also be understood with reference to the emerging disciplines of ethnography and anthropology. As a young artist, Tapiró befriended Cels Gomis i Mestre (while in Madrid in 1858), a pioneer in Catalan ethnology, who might have awakened Tapiró's curiosity for ethnographic research.¹⁵

The city of Tangiers offered rich artistic material for any artist or writer interested in ethnic, cultural and social diversity. Around 1900, according to one source, its population of 40,000 inhabitants consisted of approximately 23,000 Muslims, 11,000 Jews, 5,000 Spanish immigrants, followed by other Westerners, including British, French, German, Greeks and North Americans,¹⁶ which resulted in

a cosmopolitan city, where the old and the new, Moroccan traditions and Western fashions lived side by side. Tapiró's home was near the Zoco Chico markets, which offered a spectacle of the "fusion of races, cultures, religions, languages, and customs."¹⁷ In line with the characteristics of European Orientalism, Tapiró's work omitted any Western elements of Tangiers. Instead, he focused on religious rituals, wedding ceremonies, daily life, and portraits of members of Moroccan society – images to satisfy the demand for the exotic among a European clientele (fig. 3).¹⁸

Such works were clearly conceived as works of art, but also functioned on another level that challenged their artistic status. Art critics often perceived tensions between the aesthetic and documentary aspects of Tapiró's work. For one British critic, writing in 1897, Tapiró's detailed naturalism left "nothing to the imagination" and therefore failed "to be really interesting."¹⁹ In 1886, the eminent critic, Francisco Alcántara Jurado, stated that there was "beauty" in Tapiró's works but that they were not "art in the most elevated and strict sense of the term."²⁰ The documentary value of Tapiró's portraits becomes evident when comparing them with anthropological photographs, such as those included in *Razas y Tribus de Marruecos* (1903) by Manuel Antón y Ferrándiz, the first Chair of Anthropology at the Universidad y Museo de Ciencias Nacionales and professor at the Escuela de Estudios Superiores del Ateneo in Madrid.²¹ This essay was published as a booklet as well as across two issues of *La Ilustración Española y Americana* in 1903,²² with photographs of types, such as "Sacy-Ben-Bai Ben Salem, a pure Arab type," or "Banoy Ben Bazin, a pure kabila type" (fig. 4).

As Elizabeth Edwards observes in relation to anthropological photography, the image of a "type" functions to represent the "abstract essence of human variation." The "detail [...] becomes a symbol for the whole and tempts the viewer to allow the specific to stand for generalities," thereby reflecting wider truths at the risk of stereotyping.²³ Details of clothing, objects, the pose, or movements of the photographed subject function as "markers of primitivism", and the accompanying captions contribute to processes of interpretation. Such observations regarding the anthropological photograph are easily applicable to Tapiró's portraits, such as "A Darkawi," "A Gnawa," "A Jewish Bride" and so forth, each positioned within the impersonal, classificatory format of the profile portrait, or the more accessible three-quarter-profile portrait, against a plain background.

Contemporary reactions to his works confirm how the carefully rendered clothes and accessories function to signal both the “truthfulness” of the image and the supposed “primitivity” of the sitter. One critic, writing in *La Alhambra* in 1906, utilizes such terms in describing three portraits that he had seen in Tapiró’s studio. Commenting on the portrait of a black man, he refers to the sitter’s “pointed hat decorated with shells with a nacre that cannot be bettered on the sea bed itself” as evidence for the authenticity of the image: “this is simply an exact copy of reality”.²⁴ His comment on a portrait of a man “*de raza blanca*” (of the white race), (similar to the one shown in fig. 5), reveals the semantic function of clothes, accessories, and posture as markers of a “biblical” primitivism:

The holy man’s head is not covered, and in his thick hair, which is tied back around the front with a string, are various relics that frame the beautiful face of a primitive man in which there is toughness and majesty. The long beard gets lost in the folds of the brown clothes, and looking at him, one recalls the sons of Noah in the moment of dispersal, because this man, of whom we can see only head and shoulders, is in the pose of walking. One might say, he has been surprised walking at the time the copy was made.²⁵

In the same article, the writer insists on the racially accurate depiction of a “white” Moroccan nobleman in another portrait, especially his nose that, in his view, was typical for “this race”.²⁶

If Tapiró’s “types” triggered associations of race, hierarchy, and evolution, what did they mean in the wider racial discourse in the early twentieth century? As Joshua Goode and Susan Martin-Márquez have shown, Morocco not only constituted a laboratory for travelers, scholars, and writers to gather ethnographic data, but also featured in debates about Spain’s own racial identity and Spain’s role in Africa, especially after Spain’s humiliating defeat by the US in the colonial wars in Cuba, Puerto Rico, and the Philippines, and the loss of the remaining parts of her old empire in the New World (1898). The ensuing social, political, and economic crises raised painful questions about Spain’s status in relation to other powers with expanding colonial territories. For King Alfonso XIII (nicknamed “El Africano” for his imperial ambitions) Morocco represented a possibility, however unrealistic, to revive “imperial fortunes” and restore “claims to greatness.”²⁷

Racial ideas about Morocco were manipulated to serve colonial rhetoric but were far from stable. For example, the Granada-born writer Joaquín Costa had advocated the idea of a ‘blood brotherhood’ of Berbers and Spaniards at a conference in 1884 in favor of Spanish colonialism in Morocco, but distanced himself from such a view after 1898, insisting on Spain’s European-ness instead. Fin-de-siècle Catalan nationalists stressed that Catalans were Aryan and had remained unaffected by the invasion of the medieval Muslims, unlike the rest of Spain’s population consisting of “Semites”, “Moors,” and “Bedouins.”²⁸ But many other writers, from across the ideological spectrum, argued for Spain’s racial, cultural, and historical connections to Morocco. The influential anthropologist Antón y Ferrándiz divided Moroccans into two groups: the ‘white’ (and superior) group of the ‘Libyan-Iberians’ and the group of ‘Syrio-Arabs,’ which, so he argued, could also be found in Spain, often fused, due to earlier intermixing. He asserted that the North African influence on the “Spanish race” had been advantageous for it had brought a fiery sense of independence that had served Spain well in foreign wars and in the conquest of the Americas in the early modern period. As both Goode and Martin-Marquéz have pointed out, such ideas of racial connections were mobilized to argue that Spain, amongst all other European nations, was best suited to embark on a civilizing mission that could regenerate Morocco.²⁹

Returning to Tapiró, his colorful, jewel-like portraits of ethnic types may be seen as an aesthetic project in racial classification, malleable enough to fit various shades of racial attitudes. But, as I will argue here, the early years of the twentieth century—when Spain, along with Britain, France, and Germany, was vying for power in Morocco—opened up a new context for a political reading of Tapiró’s work.

Tapiro himself solicited such a reading by deliberately compromising his own integrity as an ethnographic artist in 1907, when he arrived in Madrid to promote his works only to discover that his highly detailed style was no longer in fashion. Greatly disenchanted with the difficulty of selling his works and under increasing financial pressures, he wrote to his brother that for the sake of the exhibition at the Circulo de Bellas Artes, he had given a portrait of a “black man” a new, invented title: *El santón Darkaguy, fanático moro de Marrakech, active e influyente predicador de la Guerra Santa* (A Darkawi holy man, a fanatical Moor from Marrakesh, active and influential advocate of the Holy War) (fig. 6).³⁰ This title directly speaks to the weight of moral characterizations of Muslims as ‘fanaticals,’ as affirmed by Antón y Ferrandiz in

relation to the “Syrio-Arab”. Ironically, as Carbonell pointed out, there is a mismatch between the title and the actual sitter, whose skin color and pointed hat, decorated with shells and tassel, indicate that he is not a member of the Darkawi (a leading sufi order, advocating asceticism, and in fierce opposition to foreign modern influence), but an elderly member of the Gnawa,³¹ a brotherhood of largely black people (originally enslaved and brought to Morocco from West Africa), who were known for their ceremonial dances but not militancy. A minority, the Gnawa often resorted to street performances to survive, and suffered discrimination at the hands of the Arab-Berber majority.³²

Tapiró’s invented title and dis-engagement from anthropological knowledge seems baffling.³³ Considering his first-hand contact with Moroccans (many of his models were provided to him by his friend, the Sharif Ouazzani), his re-titling comes across as a cynical gesture. Was it a way to test the racial assumptions of his Spanish audience from whom he felt so disconnected? Or, bearing in mind his disenchantment with the Spanish art scene, in which he had lost his place, did he hope to increase the marketability of his work through a newsworthy title that fitted in with the stories that reached Spanish audiences from Morocco around this time?

The notion of an “advocate of the jihad,” potentially evoked a number of named figures reported in the news at the time. For example, the kidnappings of Westerners by the warlord Sid Ahmed Raisuni, a self-declared holy man and sharif of the Rif Berber tribes,³⁴ who was sometimes described as a sultan of the jihad (and later fictionalized by Sean Connery in *Wind and the Lion*, 1975), had caused enough international concern for the cliché of the fanatical Arab to resurface (victims included *The Times* Moroccan correspondent Walter Harris in 1903, the American-Greek magnate Ion H. Perdicaris in 1904, and Caid Harry Maclean, the Scottish officer who worked for Sultan Abd-el Aziz, in 1907).³⁵ In 1902 the notorious rebel leader El Rogui had also declared a jihad against the ‘infidels’ (in which he included Sultan Abd-el Aziz for his European leanings), and with tribal support rampaged for years through the north of Morocco until his capture in 1909.

Following the European conference of Algeciras (1906), which granted France the dominant role and Spain a lesser one in pursuing a “peaceful penetration” of Morocco, ordinary Moroccans also showed their anger in the streets. In fact, the reference to “Marrakesh” in Tapiró’s title, far from being accidental, might be inspired by the murder of a French doctor, Emile Mauchamp, by a Moroccan mob in

Marrakesh on March 19, 1907. Mauchamp was quickly hailed by the French to a “martyr” to “the barbarous Muslim hatred of civilization,” and, in retribution, the French held the city of Oujda for ransom in return for exorbitant demands. On July 3, 1907, renewed “threatening attitudes” amongst tribal people at Marrakesh were reported, alongside the opinion that troops should be sent to Morocco to resolve the situation.³⁶ In the same month, the killing of eight European workmen by native tribesmen near Casablanca set off a general insurrection, which prompted the French to “send a force of two thousand men to occupy the city.”³⁷

Against this loaded background, Tapiró’s title gave his portrait a truly contemporary value that fitted into debates about potential Spanish and French intervention in the region. Yet, the critic writing for *La Ilustración Artística* in 1907 simply praised his “*santón de Marrakesh*” as his best watercolor and resisted commenting on the implications of the title; similarly another commentary published in 1908 firmly anchored Tapiró in the sphere of art by describing a portrait of a Darkawi monk as “a beautiful bust.”³⁸ A year later, however, a more political reading was encouraged through the reproduction of Tapiró’s works in newspapers. In October 1909, the portrait that had been mistitled by Tapiró in 1907 featured on the first page of *El Heraldo* under the short title “*El santón Darkaguy*,” serving as a visual introduction to the news item reporting violence in Morocco on the following page.³⁹ On October 2, 1909, the weekly *Actualidades* (a precursor of Spanish photojournalism) reproduced Tapiró’s profile-portrait of a black Gnawa dancer, and a three-quarter profile portrait of a Darkawi in the lower part of a page in order to announce their purchase by the state. The upper part of the same page featured a photograph of Spanish émigrés in a public interior in Tangiers, possibly a charity event (fig. 7). This juxtaposition inevitably accentuated the divide between Europe and Morocco, with the émigrés wearing Western clothes, some looking into the camera, in contrast to the colorfully “primitive,” and passive aspects of Tapiró’s sitters. At the same time, the juxtaposition also resonated with the Spanish political-anthropological view, however unrealistic, that Spain’s past imperial success in the New World might be renewed through positive interactions between Christians and Muslims in the supposedly primitive setting of Morocco. Tapiró’s intentionality aside, in these years of Moroccan instability, “ethnographic” art could be easily absorbed into broader textual and visual discourses dominated by racial thinking and colonial ambitions.

Mariano Bertuchi

The potential contribution that art could make to colonial ideology was fully realized in the multi-faceted work of Bertuchi, who would become an active figure in the colonial network of the Protectorate. In 1903 Bertuchi received a first official commission from the prestigious Madrid-based weekly *La Ilustración Española y Americana* (*Revista de Bellas Artes, Literatura y Actualidades*) to illustrate the news on the rebellion initiated by El Rogui in December 1902 against Sultan Abd-el Aziz. In January 1903, the IEA immediately published a range of photographs of the Sultan's troops and guards, views of Fez, the royal capital, and Ceuta, the key Spanish coastal possession. As the conflict progressed, contributions became more diverse. As mentioned above, Antón y Ferrandiz's essay *Razas y Tribus de Marruecos*, illustrated with photographs and lists of Berber and Arab tribes, indicating the geographical region of each tribe and their numbers of infantry and cavalry, was spread across two issues (30 January, 8 February 1903). Additional visual material included a basic drawing of an armed "Moro de la Kabila de Hiainia," two crudely executed bird's-eye views of troop movements entitled "Moroccan army marching" and the "Sultan's army camp," and a double-page bird's-eye view over the coastal region, with Fez and Tetuan indicated in the distance near the horizon line. This commanding point of view, so frequent in imperial travel writing, corresponds to what Marie-Louise Pratt has called the-monarch-of-all-I-survey scene.⁴⁰ This assemblage of information amounts to a quasi-military reconnaissance, which is also confirmed by the accompanying text that identifies the coastal region as of "major importance for France, England and Spain," should international intervention be required.⁴¹

Bertuchi's sketches, in fact oil paintings printed by photomechanical reproduction, were included in the *IAE* from February 1903 onwards. Remarkably, none of his early sketches for the magazine reflect the violence that one might expect from the subtitle "Civil War in Morocco," possibly because Bertuchi did not witness actual fighting at first hand, and possibly because representations of grotesque violence were less compatible with his romantic vision of the medieval "Moors" of his hometown Granada and his enthusiasm for Morocco since his first visit to Tangiers in 1898. Bertuchi's first illustration for the *IAE* depicts the Sultan's camp at Fez as a picturesque group of tents outside the walls of the royal city, animated by a

few tranquil-looking horses, men in djellabas, palm trees, and smoke rising from campfires in the background (fig. 8). That violence is imminent is only indicated by the second image, more dynamic, of the Sultan's minister El Mehebhi, a majestic figure cloaked in white on a dark, spirited horse reviewing his troops; the third image shows the sultan's guards at Fez.⁴² The accompanying texts remain vague about the development of the war, but the March issue reports a defeat of the Sultan's army, and in the 8 May issue, Bertuchi confirms the Sultan's loss of power by picturing a striking, frontal view of his enemy, El Rogui, on horseback, flanked by two men on foot, as he is passing in front of a seemingly indefinite line of men who have surrendered their arms to the rebel leader (fig. 9).

Only two of Bertuchi's images refer to specific, violent events. One depicts El Rogui's victory over the Sultan's troops at the Alcazaba of Frajana in April 1903.⁴³ A significant threat to Melilla, the second-largest Spanish enclave on the north Moroccan coast, this was reported internationally.⁴⁴ The second image, more horrific, shows the entry of the victorious imperial troops into Tetuan with the heads of their rebel enemies impaled on their lances (fig. 10) – but this is the only image by Bertuchi evoking the cliché of the fanatical Muslim that would inspire Tapiró's invented title in 1907 (as discussed above). The accompanying text condemns the scene accordingly, but also deflects this by insisting that El Rogui's forces are just as cruel: “the two belligerent forces cannot accuse each other of cruelty because they both compete in terrible actions in order to punish the enemy.”⁴⁵

In 1908, when Bertuchi documented the new phase of the conflict, his images suggest primitivism in the Moroccan people, places, and culture, but avoid depicting violence. Generally, his approach ties in with the empathy expressed in the texts of the IAE towards Morocco, even at times of conflict. In one instance, the journalist insists that Spain is not hostile to Morocco and links the sultan to the ‘good Muslims’ who had once lived in Spain and were eventually expelled from the country in 1609. He even suggests the possibility of the *moriscos* returning to Spain, should France continue to “upset the Moroccan empire.”⁴⁶ Such comments that nurture the idea of Spain's special relationship with Morocco and criticize France for causing problems in the region, directly challenge the understanding of Orientalism in terms of distinct opposites.

Bertuchi's Poetics of Proximity

Following the establishment of the French and Spanish Protectorates of Morocco in 1912 (which gave Spain control over the northern region of the Rif, and France over the larger, southern part) the notion of a special relationship between Spain and Morocco became a leitmotiv in colonial discourse. Bertuchi was a key figure in consolidating it. He fully embraced the idea of similarities between the places and people of Spain and Morocco, which he not only expressed visually but also verbally. As an example, it has been pointed out that Bertuchi's description of Tetuan, the capital of Spain's Protectorate, evokes his hometown Granada:

Tetuan, the beautiful Moorish city, of a profoundly oriental character, mysterious because of the mystery of its dark alleyways, the city of fountains and mosques, nestled on the slopes of the Yebel Dersa, is a white mark triumphing over the brilliant green of the gardens and covering the extensive vega irrigated by the Uad el Helu.⁴⁷

If we replace “Yebel Dersa” with “Sierra Nevada” and the “Uad el Helu” river with “El Genil”, the description potentially evokes Granada. This playful anachronism is not anecdotal but belongs to a wider discourse that casts living Moroccans as part of a Spanish diaspora—the descendants of Spain's medieval Muslims and the Moriscos expelled from Spain under Philip III. As José Gonzalez Alcántara and others have pointed out, the memory of the Andalusí past resurfaces in the recognition of similarities between the architectural heritage of Rabat, Fez and Tetuan with that of southern Spain.⁴⁸ Already in 1860, the Granada-born writer Pedro de Alarcón had described Tetuan as a *resurrección* of Granada. Similarly, in the 1920s the writer Enrique Gómez Carrillos linked Fez to al-Andalus, describing it as the “*morería* of the middle ages,”⁴⁹ where families still had the keys to their ancestors' houses in Andalusia. The subject of the keys was repeated by others, such as Juan Antonio de Eguilaz, who explained that people living in Tetuan keep the keys as “precious objects” while waiting for the day to “return” to Spain.⁵⁰ Interestingly, when Bertuchi's own paintings of Tetuan and Chefchaouen (fig. 11a and b) were exhibited in Madrid in 1921, the Andalusian critic Francisco Alcántara y Jurado was quick to see Granada in them:

Xauen [Chefchaouen], the mysterious city founded by Andalusians

appears in Bertuchi's interpretations as a graceful daughter of Granada, a lost city rediscovered by Spaniards after centuries [...]

In [the paintings of] "La alcazaba," "la Plaza del Baño," "La puerta de Mexuar", the towers are square, red, and resemble in everything those of the Alhambra. There are also several Torres de los Picos, one covered in ivy, whose dark, humid greenery animates the sanguine red stones, which tremble against the bluish mountains...⁵¹

Bertuchi's paintings were therefore appreciated for the new visual information they offered about the Spanish Protectorate, and were also easily ready in terms of ties between Spain and Morocco.

Bertuchi's rhetoric of proximity also marks his contributions to the *Revista de Tropas Coloniales*, a magazine founded in 1924 and edited from 1925 by Francisco Franco, who was then a general participating in the Rif War (1920-1926) against Moroccan resistance fighters led by Abd-el-Karim. The magazine aimed at promoting 'Hispano-African' studies as well as military strategies in Morocco. Bertuchi, in his capacity as artistic director of the magazine, gave the magazine aesthetic cohesiveness through graphic covers and illustrations. He may also have been responsible for the logo. According to Belén Abad, the basic star shape anticipates Bertuchi's later logo designed for the Comité de Turismo. The design's origin, according to Abad, may be a 1917 emblem of a German Jewish community in Berlin.⁵² This reference, however, seems too specific—after all the star of David was used in other designs too, such as the logo of the French Society of Orientalists, which combined the star with the sickle moon of Islam and the black hand of Fatma as an expression of cultural synthesis.⁵³ Bertuchi's logo also suggests cultural synthesis as the star integrates symbols of the Spanish royal coat of arms (castles and lions) and a foliate arabesque motifs in the outer triangles of the star, recalling decorative elements at the Alhambra (fig. 12).

Cultural connections were also suggested by the magazine's contents and organization. The sections titled "*Marruecos pintoresco*" and "*España Musulmana*", for example, reflected similarities between Morocco and Spain in their architecture, topography and flora.⁵⁴ Generally, architecture and material culture take up a significant role in the magazine's construct of proximity between both countries. This

can be identified with the ideology of *Andalucismo*, a regional nationalism first articulated by the Sevillian politician Blas Infante in *Ideal andaluz* in 1915.⁵⁵ Arguing for a unique Andalusian identity, he conflated Muslim Spain (al-Andalus) with the modern region of Andalusia, located the region's strength in earlier intermixing between Muslims, Christians, and Jews, and celebrated Andalusia's historical and geographical proximity to Morocco. Many contributors to the magazine were from southern Spain and subscribed to this ideology. In an article titled "Andalucismo," for example, Rodolfo Gil Torres-Benumeja described Morocco as a "logical extension" of Andalusia and argued for more cultural exchanges between contemporary Spaniards and Moroccans to work towards a new "Andalucía" that would comprise both sides of the straits of Gibraltar and take up "once again" an intermediary role between Occident and Orient.⁵⁶ To mark this effort, he mentions the plans for a Spanish-African exhibition, which would include a commercial area for the display of traditional Hispano-Islamic style artefacts (such as tiles, stucco, ceramics, textiles) as well as those made by the "artists of Fez" whom he singled out for preserving the traditions of "al-Andalus" in "all their purity" (silk, carpentry, pots, hats etc.). The exhibition was only realized in 1933 in Granada, but its vision is evoked by Bertuchi's graphic illustration "*Bazar moruno*," which serves as the issue's cover image, showing a Moroccan vendor in a white djellaba sitting amidst his colorful wares, almost merging with the surrounding array of objects (fig. 13).

Bertuchi's illustration also evokes the objects created at that time in the workshops of the Escuela de Artes y Oficios de Tetuán, in which Bertuchi was involved, first as secretary (1920-1930) and then as director (1930 to 1955). Founded in 1919,⁵⁷ the School's aim to revive Morocco's artistic traditions mirrored, to some extent, the state-sponsored program of cultural revival adopted by the French in their North African possessions. As Roger Benjamin has argued, the approach was in line with France's newly adopted 'associationist' policies, which promoted cultural respect for the indigenous peoples in an attempt to achieve a cooperative alliance between colonial and indigenous authorities, which would maintain local structures, yet serve the colonizer.⁵⁸ The schools of the indigenous arts, founded in Algiers and Rabat, were a vehicle to grant the colonized people a sense of their own identity and heritage. In the case of the Spanish Protectorate, the scenario is similar but with an extra twist in the sense that the revival of Moroccan artistic traditions also signaled a

return to the arts of Islamic Spain - an art with which both Spaniards and Moroccans could identify, thereby serving as a bridge across artists, patrons, and audiences in both countries.

According to Eduardo Dizy Caso, the idea of the School in Tetuan had emerged in 1916 in the circles of the Ateneo Científico y Literario Marroquí, which included Spanish and Moroccan members, such as Abdeslam Bennouna,⁵⁹ a key figure in northern Moroccan nationalism. Bennouna was also attracted by the ideology of *Andalucismo*,⁶⁰ and had his portrait painted by Bertuchi. In the first ten years, under the directorship of José Gutiérrez Lescura, the school's workshops comprised marquetry, decorative painting, metalwork, lamps, wall hangings, cushions, inlaid wood "Granada-style," ceramics, and mosaics, and their products were presented at various exhibitions in Spain.⁶¹ As Eloy Martín Corrales has demonstrated, the Exposición Iberoamericana of Seville (1929) included a Moroccan pavilion (designed by Lescura, Bertuchi and Antonio Got) with a nearby bazaar and an *alcancería*, featuring artefacts from the School in Tetuán. According to Bertuchi's later recollections, Morocco achieved the place it deserved at "this sentimental exhibition of Hispanidad," which he saw as a success with both the Spanish and the Moroccan participants:

"The old masters and their Muslim apprentices, some from here (Tetuan) and others from Seville, felt the rebirth of the glorious tradition of ancient Hispano-Islamic craft".⁶²

Overall the Moroccan display offered the Spanish visitor a neo-Andalusian atmosphere, and a reassuring image of the Moroccan colony as a productive idyll, an image that kept at bay any painful memories of Moroccan uprisings and the bloody battles of the War of the Rif (1920-1926), in particular the "*Desastre*" at Anwal of 1921, in which 9,000 Spanish troops had lost their lives. The image of a peaceful idyll that was projected by the Moroccan pavilion in Seville was further reinforced by the posters that the government commissioned from Bertuchi, which advertised Morocco both as a nearby tourist destination and a natural appendage to Spain (fig. 14). And, as Dizy Caso has shown, following Bertuchi's appointment as the director of the Escuela de Artes y Oficios Tradicionales in 1930, his ambitions for the School only grew. He not only created additional workshops (such as carpets, silver, leather,

forged iron) but also banned modern techniques and materials (such as chemical dyes) in order to achieve what he considered an authentic tradition of al-Andalus.⁶³ As part of this effort, Bertuchi accompanied his School's teachers and students on educational visits to Spain – Madrid, Toledo, Alcalá de Henares, Cordoba, Granada – in order to provide them with first-hand knowledge of Spain's heritage of al-Andalus in situ.⁶⁴

Bertuchi's Orientalism under Franco

The insistence on Moroccan-Spanish ties that marks Bertuchi's practice in the 1920s and 1930s continued to be significant following the Spanish Civil War (1936-39) and the radical change from a republic to a dictatorship. As is well-known, Franco, who had been a general in Rif War in the 1920s, won the Spanish Civil War with the support of about 80,000 Moroccan mercenaries against defenders of Spain's Republic. Following the victory, Franco often appeared in public with his "Moorish" guards,⁶⁵ confirming that Moroccan Muslims were not enemies, but allies who had helped defeating the "godless" Marxists and Republicans during the War.⁶⁶ Franco's regime promoted a paternalistic view of Morocco as Spain's ally, albeit an inferior one, who accepts the need for help from the more "advanced" Spain. In this context, the "Moroccan-Spanish brotherhood," a term first coined by Joaquín Costa in 1884, regained currency. It was promoted in state-sponsored films, literature, and art.⁶⁷ The School of Tetuan, now renamed Escuela de Artes Indígenas de Tetuán, and its branches in Chefchaouen and Tagsut were part of this propagandistic iteration of the cultural, racial, and geographic unity of Spain and Morocco (fig. 15). Writing in 1946, Rodolfo Gil Benumeya, by then a leading writer on colonial Morocco, praised Bertuchi for having succeeded in reinforcing the "sentimental link" between Morocco and southern Spain, and reminded the reader once more that the Moroccan craftsman's lineage goes back to Granada.⁶⁸ In 1954 the School even became the subject of documentaries produced by the Spanish television broadcasting service.⁶⁹

Bertuchi's paintings of the 1940s and 1950s also convey the proximity between Morocco and Spain, visually and thematically. For instance, a visual slippage occurs when we compare his portrayal of a Moroccan falconer on horseback (fig. 16a and b) seen against a wide open landscape with another similar equestrian portrait, but whose title *El suspiro del moro* (The Moor's sigh) unambiguously refers us back to the past. The title is associated with the last Nasrid king, Boabdil, who lost his

kingdom of Granada to the Christian troops of Ferdinand and Isabella in 1492. According to legend, when he fled from his palace, he looked back from the mountain pass at the beauty of what he had lost and wept.⁷⁰ This story of the weeping king had been popular with late nineteenth-century artists such as Alfred Dehodencq and Francisco Pradilla, but Bertuchi strips his painting of precise geographical references to Granada, placing the figure in the same setting as the Moroccan falconer. Without the title, he might be interpreted as a Moroccan nobleman. The example shows how easily Bertuchi moved between realist observation and nostalgic fantasy, conflating al-Andalus with present-day Morocco.

Bertuchi's *Corrida de la pólvora* (fig. 17) also offers an original interpretation of a common theme in Orientalist painting: the so-called gun-powder race (this involves a group of riders charging in a straight line across several hundred meters of open ground, who then, simultaneously, fire their guns). Earlier depictions highlight the dramatic effects that result from horses galloping at high speed, whirling up dust from the ground, and their riders brandishing their guns into the air. Delacroix' painting Moroccans conducting military exercises (*Fantasia*) (1832, Musée Fabre, Montpellier) suggests chaos, threat, and potential warfare. Bertuchi's painting by contrast evokes control, skill, and elegance. The race itself, relegated to the middle ground, takes place in a confined area. The violence of the riders firing their guns is depicted as a performance by, rather than the "essence" of Moroccan men. In the distance, across the racecourse, we can make out a line of onlookers watching on, and the entire foreground is taken up by a group of high-ranking men who enjoy the spectacle from inside a large tent. Most of the seated figures focus on the race, but others are distracted from it: for instance, one man standing on the left is serving tea; another, on the right, is pouring tea, and two men on horseback are slowly passing by in front of the tent, perhaps to join the next group to race. Bertuchi thus emphasizes the performative and social aspects of this Moroccan pastime. In other words, rather than exoticizing it, Bertuchi translates it into terms that could be grasped by his Spanish audiences: an open-air spectacle that offers opportunities for socializing as well as admiring displays of equestrian skills. In this sense, what we see here is a tradition no more "other" than the famous April Fair of Seville, a bullfight, or a European horse race. The perspective from inside the tent further suggests the artist's closeness to Moroccan society, as he shares their space and viewpoint. This

possibility of a joint Spanish-Moroccan perspective was at the heart of Andalucismo ideology, and also in harmony with Francoist thinking.

The symbolic meaning of Bertuchi's paintings is most obvious when they are considered in the loaded context of the annual prize-giving *Pintores de África* exhibitions from 1950 onwards, organized by Franco's colonial administration to bring a respectful and positive image of Morocco to the Spanish public and affirm the value of the Protectorate to Spain at a time when Moroccan independence was gaining momentum, especially in the French zone. In addition, the Directorio General de Marruecos y Colonias also offered travel stipends for artists to produce works of art visualizing Spain's African possessions and Andalusia, for submission to the exhibition. Instigated by governmental order in 1949, it was stipulated that the exhibition should take place annually in March at the prestigious Circulo de Bellas Artes in Madrid and be accompanied by a rich program of conferences, lectures, and concerts in order to create "a favorable atmosphere and to reveal Spain's African areas."⁷¹ As a reviewer noted of the fourth exhibition in 1953, how "Andalusí music and other musical evocations, words by learned speakers give life to the [painted] figures and soul to the plastic representations."⁷² The speeches and publication repeated the rhetoric of proximity. Commenting on the second exhibition of the *Pintores de Africa*, the director of the Academy of Fine Art of San Fernando insisted:

There is much of us in them and of them in us! Common roots nourish our races and gave life to art and poetry, swagger and languor, bravery and mysticism there and here. Lasting traces, indestructible testimonies of the Arab in Spanish cities; a eurythmy of coinciding rhythms, of parallel routes in ideology, sentiment and sensitivity.⁷³

Similarly, in 1953, Rodolfo Gil-Torres Benumeya asserted that the exhibition affirmed once more the "eternal links between Moroccan and Spanish sensibilities," through the combination of Moroccan and Andalusian themes, and also the participation of some Moroccan artists "whose works present no difference" from those painted by Spanish artists.⁷⁴

Bertuchi was often an honorary participant but was excluded from the competition for prizes.⁷⁵ At the 1953 exhibition, his paintings *La pascua del carnero*, *La calle de los babucheros*, and *El zoco por la tarde* were awarded a "special mention" (Figures 18 and 19) represented solemn. At the 1954 exhibition, his

paintings *La pascua grande* and *Las cofradías* (fig. 17 and 18) represented solemn and peaceful processions, which did not show religious life in any alienating way. Instead they suggested links between festivity and ritual, which could only resonate with Spanish audiences, especially at a time when Catholicism pervaded all aspects of life, and “liturgical rites and displays, processions and open-air masses could be seen all over Spain.”⁷⁶ In fact, connections between Islam and Christianity had been articulated by the Francoist Arabist and Catholic priest Miguel Asín in his famous 1940 article “Por qué lucharon los a nuestro lado los musulmanes marroquíes” (Why did the Moroccan Muslims fight on our side?) in order to explain the reasons for Muslims fighting alongside Franco in the Civil War.⁷⁷ Similarly, as Geoffrey Jensen has shown, the colonial ideologue Tomas García Figueras tirelessly reiterated the view that Islam and Christianity were not that different, and that Catholicism and Islam were compatible in the same social system.⁷⁸ Seen against the highly charged rhetoric around this annual exhibition and the broader intellectual context, it is clear that Bertuchi’s empathetic imagery of the Moroccan world matched Francoist colonialist views.

Conclusion

To return to the inflections of Spanish Orientalism, Tapiró and Bertuchi were heavily invested in cultural translation when presenting Moroccan people and places to their audiences. But there are differences between them. Unlike Bertuchi, Tapiró cannot be linked to state propaganda. Although his intention to “document” Moroccan society was far from innocent, his ethnographic gaze was as much corrupted by his personal frustration with the art market in his native Spain as by contemporary events in Morocco. The symbolic meaning of Tapiró’s work is unstable as it depends on the use and the viewing context of the work – whether displayed in a museum with a prejudiced caption, or reproduced in an art journal only concerned with aesthetics, or in a newspaper alongside information on Moroccan affairs.

The otherness expressed in Tapiró’s portraits was suppressed in the work of Bertuchi. His quest for cultural proximity between Spain and Morocco might have begun as part of his personal, romantic fascination with the Nasrid heritage of his hometown Granada, but also matched the utopian position of Andalucismo and brilliantly served Spain’s colonial rhetoric throughout the Protectorate, including the Franco era.

In the context of current debates on Western Orientalism, both Bertuchi and Tapiró broaden the canon of Orientalism. Bertuchi is particularly relevant to widening the debate's perspective in theoretical terms. On the one hand, his work can be considered as soft propaganda, ranging from newspaper illustrations, easel paintings, posters and stamps, to educational, curatorial and conservationist activities, all of which served colonialist ideology. This interplay between cultural expression and colonialism generally mirrors the dynamics of power associated with Orientalism (as elucidated by Said). However, the significance of the memory of Spain's own Islamic past that is activated in Bertuchi's practice in order to overcome (rather than articulate) a potential otherness of Moroccan people adds a special dimension that breaks the binary of "us" and "them." Orientalism emerges as a fluid phenomenon where connections are being made across both cultures.

Significantly, Bertuchi's status as an important artist and empathetic image-maker of Morocco has survived, obscuring his association with colonial politics. In post-colonial times, Spanish as well as Moroccan artists influenced by Bertuchi paid homage to him through group exhibitions,⁷⁹ and Bertuchi's own work has also been shown on both sides of the Strait of Gibraltar.⁸⁰ In 2000, the exhibition *Mariano Bertuchi. Pintor de Marruecos* in Madrid prompted the Moroccan minister Mohamed Benaïssa to reflect on Bertuchi's achievements in fine art, education, and architectural conservation, stating: "The legacy of Bertuchi represents one of the most beautiful civilizing links between Spain and the Kingdom of Morocco."⁸¹ The recent exhibition *Bertuchi. 50 años después*, which opened in May 2006 in Tetuan and toured various Moroccan and Spanish cities, formed part of an official agreement signed by the Moroccan and Spanish ministers of culture in 2004 to strengthen cultural collaboration between both countries through a multidisciplinary programme entitled "Tiempo de Marruecos en España y de España en Marruecos."⁸² In this context, Bertuchi once again appears as a bridge between both cultures, but without the colonial baggage.

The memory of Spain's Islamic past, the idealized notion of *convivencia* (friendly coexistence of Jews, Muslims, and Christian), and Spain's special relationship with the Islamic world that is expressed in Bertuchi's work continue to be mobilized by different groups. Contemporary Andalusian politicians, for example, argue for regional autonomy by drawing on *Andalucismo* ideology as first articulated by Blas Infante in 1915 and visually evoked by Bertuchi. In 2006 Spanish Muslims

also mobilized Spain's Islamic past when (unsuccessfully) petitioning the Pope to allow Muslims to pray with Christians in the former Mosque of Cordoba. Yet, at the other end of the spectrum, one writer's recent reference to Spanish Muslims as a "hidden gangrene" of society demonstrates that negative clichés of Islam are as alive in Spain as in other countries.⁸³

Spanish Orientalism in art and visual culture presents a complex phenomenon that still needs to be studied in depth and with reference to both the local and broader contexts of Orientalism. As demonstrated by the gap between Bertuchi's rhetoric of proximity and the cultural distance conveyed by Tapiró, it would be misleading to speak of a single, unified Orientalist visual discourse. What can be said is that their respective work has ideological implications and the potential for political propaganda. Yet, as argued above, the semantic shifts that occur when their work is inserted into different viewing contexts and periods demonstrate the instability of precise meaning and political connotation. The contradictions, ambiguities and nuances that mediate Spanish Orientalism in the visual arts are not obvious at first sight. It is the art historian's responsibility to unmask them.

Acknowledgement

I would like to thank the anonymous reviewers for their valuable comments. I am also grateful to my colleagues Halle O'Neal, Richard Thomson, and Genevieve Warwick, and my husband David Hopkins for their suggestions and support.

Notes

¹ Menéndez y Pelayo, *Historia de los heterodoxos españoles* [1880-1882] (Alicante: Biblioteca Virtual Miguel de Cervantes, 2003), 210. All translations from Spanish are mine unless stated otherwise.

² Julián Ribera y Tarragó, "El Arabista español," *Disertaciones opúsculos 1887-1927*, vol. 1 (Madrid: Edición Colectiva Que en Su Jubilación Del Profesorado Le Ofrecen Sus Discípulos Y Amigos, 1928), 468. Quoted in English translation in: *Nationalism and Archaeology in Europe*, ed. M. Díaz Andreu & T. Champion (London and New York: Routledge, 2015).

³ José Francés, "Nueva mirada al Africa Espanola," March 9, 1951, published in *II Exoposicion de pintores de África* (Madrid: CSIC, 1951), 91-94

⁴ Edward Said, *Orientalism* (London: Routledge & K. Paul, 1978)

⁵ For example: R. Lewis, *Gendering Orientalism* (London: Routledge, 1996); V. Schmidt-Linsenhoff, *Ästhetik der Differenz* (Marburg: Jonas Verlag, 2010); Z. Inankur, R. Lewis, M. Roberts (eds.), *Ottoman Istanbul and British Orientalism. The Poetics and Politics of Place* (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2007); and R. Benjamin, “Colonial tutelage to nationalist affirmation: Mammeri and Racim, painters of the Maghreb,” in J. Beaulieu and M. Roberts (eds.), *Orientalism’s Interlocutors* (Durham, London: Duke University Press, 2002), 43–77.

⁶ E. Said, *Orientalismo* (Barcelona: Debolsillo 2003), 9-10. Preface dated 2002.

⁷ S. Martin-Márquez, *Disorientations. Spanish Colonialism in North Africa and the Performance of Identity* (New Haven, London: Yale University Press, 2008)

⁸ J. À. Carbonell, *Josep Tapiró. Pintor de Tànger* (Barcelona: Museu Nacional d’Art de Catalunya, Universitat Rovira I Virgili, 2014)

⁹ One of the first important study on Bertuchi in modern times is José Luis Gómez Barceló, “Mariano Bertuchi Nieto: Ilustraciones,” *Cuadernos del Rebellín*, no. 6 (Ceuta, 1992), 1-60. In 2000 a major exhibition was staged at the Real Academia de Bellas Artes, Madrid. The exhibition catalogue includes important essays on Bertuchi. See A. de la Serna (ed.), *Mariano Bertuchi. Pintor de Marruecos* (Barcelona: Lunwerg, 2000). The most recent substantial publication is by José Antonio Pleguezuelos Sánchez, *Mariano Bertuchi. Los colores de la luz* (Ceuta: Archivo General, 2013). Further sources in the remainder of this article.

¹⁰ E. Arias Anglés, “La vision de Marruecos a través de la pintura orientalista española, 37.1, *Mélanges de la Casa de Velázquez. Imágenes coloniales de Marruecos en España* (2007): 27 and 33.

¹¹ J. A. Carbonell, *Josep Tapiró*, 197.

¹² *Ibid.*, 200.

¹³ S. Martin-Márquez, “Here’s Spain Looking at You”: Shifting Perspectives on North African Otherness in Galdós and Fortuny, *Arizona Journal of Hispanic Cultural Studies*, Vol. 5 (2001): 20 and 22, n.16. Fortuny refused to participate in a competition of paintings on the African War, since most of the artists had never been to Morocco.

-
- ¹⁴ F. Moja y Bolivar, "La pintura española en Roma," *Ilustración Española y Americana* (May 30, 1879, suplemento no. XX): 367
- ¹⁵ Carbonell, *Josep Tapiró*, 194. Carbonell's source is F. Gras y Elías, *Hijos ilustres de Reus* (Barcelona: Librería de Francisco Puig y Alonso, 1899), 161.
- ¹⁶ B. López García, "Los españoles de Tánger," no. 5-6, *Awraq* (2012): 14-15. The original source is Albert Cousin, *Tánger* (Paris: Augustin Chalmel, 1902).
- ¹⁷ E. Sanz, "Antonio Fuentes: un recuerdo de Tanager y un olvido de España," *El País* August 23, 1997.
- ¹⁸ Carbonell, *Josep Tapiró*, 205-206.
- ¹⁹ Anon. "The Royal Academy", *The Times* (London), (June 16, 1897): 15
- ²⁰ El Españolito [F. Alcántara Jurado], "Barcelona Artística", *La Época*, XXXVIII, no. 12,324 (Madrid, 12/9/1886): 3. Quoted by Carbonell, *Josep Tapiró*, 131
- ²¹ M. Antón y Ferrándiz, *Razas y tribus de Marruecos* (Madrid: Impresores de la Real Casa, 1903)
- ²² M. Antón y Ferrándiz, "Razas y tribus de Marruecos," *La Ilustración Española y Americana* [IEA hereafter] no. IV (January 30): 1903, 64-65, 67-71.
- ²³ E. Edwards, "Introduction", in *Anthropology & Photography 1860-1920* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press add date), 9 and 11.
- ²⁴ Ali Landaluz, "Nuestros grandes artistas. El pintor Tapiró," *La Alhambra*, August 30, 1906, 372-375, see especially 374
- ²⁵ Idem.
- ²⁶ Ibid., 375.
- ²⁷ S. Gilson Miller, "France and Spain in Morocco (1912-1930)," *A History of Modern Morocco* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), 104.
- ²⁸ Martin-Márquez, *Disorientations*, 43-44
- ²⁹ Ibid., 56.
- ³⁰ J. Carbonell, "Los retratos de Tapiró del Museo del Prado", *Boletín del Museo del Prado*, 31.49 (2013), 137.
- ³¹ Idem.
- ³² Chouki El Hamel, *Black Morocco: A History of Slavery, Race, and Islam* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), esp. 276-278.

-
- ³³ Carbonell, "Los retratos de Tapiro...", 138. The portrait *El santón Darcaguy de Tafite* seems to represent a Heddwawa. Also see C. Becker, "Hunters, Sufis, soldiers and minstrels: the diaspora aesthetics of the Gnawa," *RES: Anthropology and Aesthetics*, 59/60 (2011): 136. The artist John F. Lewis also subverted ethnographic knowledge. E. Weeks, *Cultured Crossed. John Frederick Lewis* (New Haven, London: Yale University Press, 2014).
- ³⁴ S. Gilson Miller, *A History of Modern Morocco* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), 66.
- ³⁵ C.R. Pennell, *Morocco since 1830. A History* (London: Hurst, 2001), 171
- ³⁶ *El Correo*, July 3, 1907, n.p.
- ³⁷ Gilson-Miller, *A History of Modern Morocco*, 75-76.
- ³⁸ M. Carretero, "Madrid – Décima Exposición del Círculo de Bellas Artes," *La Ilustración Artística*, December 22, 1907, 779-780. The portrait by Tapiró is reproduced on page 780; Anon, "José Tapiró," *Ilustración Artística* (November 16, 1908): cover page and 754.
- ³⁹ *Heraldo de Madrid* (October 22, 1909): 1 and 2.
- ⁴⁰ Marie-Louise Pratt, *Imperial Eyes. Travel Writing and Transculturation* (London: Routledge, 2nd ed. 2008), 197
- ⁴¹ IEA, 8 February (1903): 78-79
- ⁴² M. d. C. Utande Ramiro, M. Utande Igualada, *Mariano Bertuchi y sus dibujos de la guerra civil marroquí (1903 y 1908) en el museo de la Academia* (1992), 339
- ⁴³ C. Luis de Cuenca, "Nuestros Grabados," *IEA* (April 22, 1903): 242; Bertuchi's *Toma de la Alcazaba de Frajana* is reproduced here.
- ⁴⁴ A. Bravo Nieto, "La Alcazaba de Fajana, un modelo de fortificación islámica en el siglo XIX," *Arquitectura miliar y artillería en el norte de África. De la fortificación islámica a los modelos abaluartados, II congreso internacional Ciudad y Patrimonio, Muralla y Ciudad en ámbito norteafricano* (Melilla: UNED, 2008), 198-200.
- ⁴⁵ C. Luis de Cuenca, "La Guerra Civil de Marruecos," *IEA* (May 22, 1903) : 311 and 313. My translation.
- ⁴⁶ J.F. Bremón, "Crónica general," *IEA* (September 8, 1908): 134

⁴⁷ Bertuchi quoted in M.D. Santos Moreno, “Mariano Bertuchi Nieto de Granada a Tetuán”, in A. de la Serna (ed.), *Mariano Bertuchi. Pintor de Marruecos*, 62

⁴⁸ J. Gonzalez Alcantud, *El mito de Al Andalus* (Editorial Almuzara, 2014), chapter 3

⁴⁹ A. Correa Ramón, “Entre oasis y desierto. Realidad y recreación de Marruecos en la literatura española finisecular,” *Mélanges de la Casa de Velázquez*, 37.1 (2007): 50.

⁵⁰ *Ibid.*, 51

⁵¹ F. Alcántara, “La Vida Artística. Tetuan y Xauen-Cuadros de Mariano Bertuchi, en el salon Arte Moderno”, *El Sol*, Madrid, January 22, 1921, 2

⁵² B. Abad, *Mariano Bertuchi: Actividad pedagógica y artística en el norte de Marruecos en la época del protectorado (1912-1956)*, PhD (Seville: Universidad de Sevilla, 2016), 93

⁵³ R. Benjamin, *Orientalist Aesthetics. Art, Colonialism, and French North Africa* (London, Berkeley, Los Angeles: University of California Press, 2003), 74.

⁵⁴ For example, see: Photograph (anon.) of “Córdoba: La puerta del perdón” reproduced full page in the section “España Musulmana,” and the photograph of “Xauen: Mezquita de los Andaluces (by Calatayud)” reproduced in the section “Marruecos Pintoresco,” *Revista de Tropas Coloniales* (1/9/1926): 201 and 208.

⁵⁵ Eric Calderwood, “In Andalucía, there are no foreigners”: andalucismo from transperipheral critique to colonial apology,” *Journal of Spanish Cultural Studies* 15.4 (2014): 399-417.

⁵⁶ Benomar [Rodolfo Gil Torres], “Andalucismo,” *Revista de Tropas Coloniales* (May 1926): 101.

⁵⁷ L.A. de Vega, “La Enseñanza artística e industrial del indígena en la zona española de Marruecos,” *Revista de Tropas Coloniales*, 1/9 / 1928, 227-228.

⁵⁸ Benjamin, *Orientalist Aesthetics*, 192- 219

⁵⁹ E. Dizy Caso, “Bertuchi, Maestro de artesanos y artistas. Fidelida a un patrimonio histórico”, in A. de la Serna (ed.), *Bertuchi. Pintor de Marruecos* (Barcelona: Lunweg, 2000), 103-115 (104).

⁶⁰ Bennouna was the leader of northern Moroccan nationalism and attracted by Andalucismo: “La federación con España es la suprema idea de los marroquíes

que anhelamos la libertad para nuestro país." A. Delgado Larios (ed.), *Conflictos y cicatrices. Fronteras y migraciones en el mundo hispánico* (Madrid: Dykinson, 2014), 195

⁶¹ E. Martín Corrales, "Marruecos y los marroquíes en la propaganda oficial del Protectorado (1912-1956), *Mélanges de la Casa de Velázquez*, 37-1 (2007), 83-107 (88-90). Also Dizi Caso, "Bertuchi, Mastero de artesanos...", 108.

⁶² Bertuchi, "La Escuela de Artes Indígenas de Tetuán desde su fundación, en 1919, hasta el año de 1947," *África*, 1947, quoted by Dizi Caso, "Bertuchi, maestro de artesanos," 105, note 6.

⁶³ For a full account, see Dizi Caso, "Bertuchi, maestro de artesanos," 103-115. The School changed its name to "Escuela de Artes Indígenas" in 1931.

⁶⁴ Pleguezuelos, Mariano Bertuchi. *Los colores de la luz* (Ceuta), p. 191. Between 1930 and 1955, the number of students rose from 108 to 386.

⁶⁵ G. Jensen, "The Peculiarities of 'Spanish Morocco': Imperial Ideology and Economic Development," *Mediterranean Historical Review*, 20:1 (2005): 89.

⁶⁶ *Ibid.*, 86

⁶⁷ For example, *Las Minas del Norte de África* (1930), see E. Martín Corrales, "Marruecos y los marroquíes en la propaganda oficial del Protectorado (1912-1956), *Mélanges de la Casa de Velázquez*, 37-1 (2007): 83-107.

⁶⁸ R. Gil Benumeya, "Veinte años de arte hispanoamarroquí," *Madrid* (newspaper), May 28, 1949, quoted in *Mariano Bertuchi. Pintor de Africa*, ed. A de la Serna, 107-108.

⁶⁹ *Escuela de Artes Indígenas* (rtve, 1944), *Artesanía de Tetuán* (rtve, 1954).

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=lsglS216MVA>

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=aTGTAAd2Xybl>

(accessed August 2016)

⁷⁰ See R. Benjamin, "Andalusia in the Time of the Moors: regret and colonial presence in Paris, 1900," in J. Hackforth-Jones, M. Roberts (eds), *Edges of Empire* (London, 2005), 191-193.

⁷¹ *IV Exposición de pintores de Africa* (Madrid: Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, 1953), 11

-
- ⁷² Anon. review, *ABC* (Madrid, March 27, 1953), in *IV Exposición de pintores de Africa* (Madrid: CSIC, 1953), 48
- ⁷³ José Frances, “Nueva mirada a la Africa Española”, 9 March 1951, *II Exposición Pintores de África* (Madrid: CSIC, 1951), 93.
- ⁷⁴ R. Gil Benumeya, “Pintura Española del Magreb y Pintura Magrebi de España”, *Prensa Arabe de Oriente* (April 1953), *IV Exposición Pintores de África*, 87.
- ⁷⁵ B. Burguera Arienza, “Los Pintores Españoles en Marruecos”, in *Mariano Bertuchi. Pintor de África*, 52. Also see: *IV Exposición de pintores de África* (Madrid: CSIC, 1953); *V Exposición de pintores de África* (Madrid, CSIC, 1954), 157-163. This fifth exhibition was first shown in Madrid (Circulo de Bellas Artes) and then in Barcelona (Palacio de la Virreina). Four paintings by Bertuchi (*Las Cofradías; Una romería; La Pascua Grande; Xauen*) were shown in Barcelona.
- ⁷⁶ J. Casanova, *Twentieth-Century Spain. A History* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014), 242
- ⁷⁷ M. Asín, “Por qué lucharon a nuestro lado los musulmanes marroquíes?” *Revista de la Universidad de Madrid*, 1 (1940), 147,
- ⁷⁸ Jensen, 86-87.
- ⁷⁹ Al Amawi, Jalil, “Homenaje y recuerdo a Mariano Bertuchi como símbolo hispano-marroquí,” *Cuaderno de Estudios Africanos*, no 31, Madrid, 1955: 67-69.
- ⁸⁰ For example: *Homenaje a Mariano Bertuchi*, Corral del Carbón, Granada, 1956; *Exposición Bertuchi*, 23 May – 2 June, 1985, Museo de Ceuta; *Escuela de Tetuán, 50 años de reflexión*, 15 May-13 July, 2003, Museo de Ceuta; *Mariano Bertuchi. Pintor de Marruecos*, Real Academia de Bellas Artes de San Fernando, 2000; *Mariano Bertuchi. 50 años después*, 2006, Instituto Cervantes, Tetuan – this exhibition was also shown in other cities, such as Tangier, Rabat, Fez, Málaga, Seville, and Madrid.
- ⁸¹ Mohamed Benaïssa quoted by Pleguezuelos, *Mariano Bertuchi. Los colores de la luz*, 208
- ⁸² Anon., “Mariano Bertuchi. 50 años después,” *Afkar/Ideas*, spring-summer 2006, 103. Also, see “España y Marruecos firman un acuerdo de colaboración cultural para los dos próximos años”, *el mundo.es*, August 31, 2004.

www.elmundo.es/elmundo/2004/08/30/cultura/1093893651.html (accessed January 2017)

⁸³ R.M. Rodríguez Magda, *La España convertida al islam* (2006), 164, quoted in Martin-Márquez, *Disorientations*, 357.