



Edinburgh Research Explorer

40Ar/39Ar age of the Rotoiti Breccia and Rotoehu Ash, Okataina Volcanic Complex, New Zealand, and identification of heterogeneously distributed excess 40Ar in supercooled crystals

Citation for published version:

Flude, S & Storey, M 2016, '40Ar/39Ar age of the Rotoiti Breccia and Rotoehu Ash, Okataina Volcanic Complex, New Zealand, and identification of heterogeneously distributed excess 40Ar in supercooled crystals', *Quaternary Geochronology*, vol. 33, pp. 13-23. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.quageo.2016.01.002

Digital Object Identifier (DOI):

10.1016/j.quageo.2016.01.002

Link:

Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer

Document Version: Peer reviewed version

Published In: Quaternary Geochronology

Publisher Rights Statement:

This is the author's peer-reviewed manuscript as accepted for publication.

General rights

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy

The University of Édinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact openaccess@ed.ac.uk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



Accepted Manuscript, Quaternary Geochronology

⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar age of the Rotoiti Breccia and Rotoehu Ash, Okataina Volcanic Complex, <u>New Zealand, and identification of heterogeneously distributed excess</u> ⁴⁰Ar in <u>supercooled crystals.</u>

Stephanie Flude^{a1} and Michael Storey^{a2}

^aQuaternary Dating Laboratory, Department of Environmental, Social and Spatial Change, Roskilde University, DK-4000 Roskilde, Denmark.

¹Corresponding author. Present address: School of Geosciences, The University of Edinburgh, The Grant Institute, The Kings Buildings, Edinburgh EH9 3JW, United Kingdom. Email: <u>sflude@gmail.com</u>; tel: +44 (0)131-650-7010; fax: +44(0)131- 650-7340

²Present address: Natural History Museum of Denmark, Øster Voldgade 5-7, 1350 Copenhagen, Denmark

Accepted for publication December 2015

DOI: 10.1016/j.quageo.2016.01.002

© 2016. This manuscript version is made available under the CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 license <u>http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/</u>

⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar age of the Rotoiti Breccia and Rotoehu Ash, Okataina Volcanic Complex, New Zealand, and 1 2

3

identification of heterogeneously distributed excess ⁴⁰Ar in supercooled crystals.

Stephanie Flude^{a1} and Michael Storey^a

4 ^aQuaternary Dating Laboratory, Department of Environmental, Social and Spatial Change, Roskilde 5 University, DK-4000 Roskilde, Denmark.

6 ¹Corresponding author. Present address: School of Geosciences, The University of Edinburgh, The Grant

Institute, The Kings Buildings, Edinburgh EH9 3JW, United Kingdom. Email: sflude@gmail.com; tel: +44 7

- 8 (0)131-650-7010; fax: +44(0)131-650-7340
- 9

10 Abstract

11 Co-magmatic granitoid clasts erupted as part of the Rotoiti Ignimbrite (Rotoehu Tephra) contain euhedral

12 K-feldspar and biotite crystals that protrude into miarolytic cavities and show textural evidence for growth

in super-cooled conditions, thus are interpreted as growing during eruption. ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar stepped heating 13

experiments on single K-feldspar crystals reveal the presence of heterogeneously distributed excess ⁴⁰Ar, 14

15 preferentially released at lower temperature steps (most likely from fluid/melt inclusions), which cannot

reliably be characterised by, or corrected for using isotope correlation diagrams due to mixing between 16

17 three reservoirs of ⁴⁰Ar (radiogenic, atmospheric and excess). This excess ⁴⁰Ar component is common, but

18 not ubiquitous, and an age population unmixing algorithm applied to single-crystal fusion data identifies a

younger group of K-feldspar and biotite crystals that appear to be largely unaffected by excess ⁴⁰Ar. This 19

20 population gives a statistically robust weighted mean age of 47.4 ± 1.5 ka (1σ , n = 13) and an

21 indistinguishable inverse isochron age of 50 ± 3 ka for this historically difficult to date eruption. The

22 weighted mean age is significantly younger than previous age estimates of the Rotoiti eruption obtained by

K/Ar and ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar dating of bracketing lavas, but is indistinguishable from recent ¹⁴C and (U-Th)/He dates 23

and estimates based on orbital tuning and sedimentation rates constrained by ¹⁴C ages. 24

25

26 **Keywords**

Rotoiti ignimbrite eruption; ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar; excess-⁴⁰Ar; Taupo Volcanic Zone 27

- 28
- 29

30 1. Introduction

31 The Rotoiti ignimbrite and Rotoehu ash, erupted from the Okataina Caldera in the Taupo Volcanic Zone 32 (TVZ) and immediately followed by the eruption of the Earthquake Flat (EQF) ignimbrite, is an important 33 regional stratigraphic marker on the North Island of New Zealand and in the SW Pacific Ocean which has 34 been used to correlate numerous stratigraphic sections both onshore and offshore (e.g. Berryman, 1992; 35 Molloy et al., 2008; Nilsson et al., 2011; Shane et al., 2006). It occurs at the base of a remarkably well 36 constrained tephra record in which all deposits have been correlated to their source vents and their 37 distribution is well known (Shane, 2000) and so an accurate age for this deposit is particularly important for 38 calculating both sedimentation rates and magma production and eruption rates in the TVZ and surrounding 39 areas. Furthermore, the climatic conditions before and after the eruption are well constrained and the ash 40 is interpreted to have been deposited during an interstadial, most likely in the middle of Marine Isotope 41 Stage (MIS) 3 (Mcglone et al., 1984; Shane and Sandiford, 2003). However, despite 45 years of study and 42 numerous attempts to date the eruption, the age of the Rotoehu ash still remains controversial, with 43 recent published ages ranging from ~45 to 61 ka. In this paper we present ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar stepped heating and 44 total fusion data for single crystals of K-feldspar and biotite from co-magmatic granitoid lithic clasts erupted 45 as part of the Rotoiti ignimbrite and show that the eruption most likely took place at ~ 47 ka.

46

47 **1.1 Geological context**

48 The 60 km wide Taupo Volcanic Zone (TVZ) extends ~300 km north-eastwards from the centre of the North 49 Island of New Zealand into the Bay of Plenty and the south Pacific Ocean (Figure 1). Volcanism in the TVZ 50 began at ~2 Ma, becoming dominated by silicic volcanism after ~1.6 Ma and it is currently the most active 51 region of silicic volcanism on Earth, with rhyolite eruption rates of 3.8 km³ ka⁻¹ (over the last 1.6 Ma). There 52 are at least 8 caldera complexes that have been active over the lifetime of the TVZ, with at least 34 caldera 53 forming eruptions identified as having occurred since 1.6 Ma (Wilson et al., 1995). The Okataina caldera 54 complex (also referred to as the Haroharo Caldera complex, Charlier et al., 2003; Shane et al., 2012; Smith 55 et al., 2010) is one of the most productive silicic volcanoes known with rhyolite production rates quoted as being 2.5 km³ ka⁻¹ over the last 65 ka (Wilson et al., 1995). The Rotoiti ignimbrite (also referred to as the 56

57 Rotoiti breccia) and Rotoehu ash were produced during the most recent caldera collapse eruption of the Okataina caldera. The eruption began with an explosive basaltic eruption, producing the Matahina Tephra 58 59 (Pullar and Nairn, 1972) and was immediately followed by the Rotoiti eruption which produced non-welded 60 ignimbrite, interbedded with and overlain by phreatomagmatic ash, with the combined ignimbrite and ash equating to a magma volume of at least 80 km³ (Wilson et al, 2007). The Rotoiti eruption was followed 61 almost immediately (within months) by the smaller volume (7 km³ of magma) Earthquake Flat ignimbrite 62 63 and associated Rifle Range ash (Nairn and Kohn, 1973; Wilson et al., 2007), which is generally considered to originate from the Kapenga caldera complex, although Burt et al. (1998) suggested that the EQF vent 64 lineament represents a cryptic ring-shaped structural boundary of the Okataina volcanic centre (Figure 1B). 65



Fig. 1. (A) – Map showing the tectonic setting of the Taupo Volcanic Zone (TVZ), related to the subduction of the Pacific plate beneath the Australian plate, with onshore (white diamonds) and offshore (black diamonds) occurrences of the Rotoiti Ignimbrite and / or Rotoehu ash (Allan et al., 2008; Berryman, 1992; Danišík et al., 2012; Molloy et al., 2009; Nairn and Kohn, 1973; Santos et al., 2001; Shane et al., 2006; Shane and Sandiford, 2003). Square box shows the location of Figure. 1B. (B) – Structural map of the Okataina Caldera, the source of the Rotoiti eruption (after Charlier and Wilson, 2010). Dashed line represents the cryptic structural boundary of the Okataina caldera as suggested by Burt et al. (1998).

Plutonic lithic fragments brought to the surface during ignimbrite eruptions have been observed in many
TVZ volcanic deposits (Brown et al., 1998; Burt et al., 1998; Charlier et al., 2003; Ewart and Cole, 1967;
Shane et al., 2012). However, a notable class of felsic plutonic clasts contained in a lithic lag breccia facies
of the Rotoiti ignimbrite contain volcanic glass, indicating that they were incompletely crystallised at depth
and so are referred to as granitoids (Brown et al., 1998; Burt et al., 1998). The most common type of these

70 granitoid clasts, Group 1 granitoids (the subject of this study), tend to be highly friable, exhibit quench 71 textures, such as volcanic glass, micrographic intergrowths and miarolytic cavities lined with euhedral 72 crystals, and often contain two populations of biotite (Brown et al., 1998; Burt et al., 1998; Charlier et al., 73 2003). Importantly, the glass in these granitoid fragments often co-exists with euhedral crystals, implying 74 that the glass represents quenched residual melt, rather than melt infiltration and remobilisation of a 75 previously solidified magma body, which would result in rounded and resorbed crystals (Brown et al., 1998; 76 Burt et al., 1998). Based on contrasting chemical and isotopic signatures, the granitoid clasts are generally 77 considered to be co-magmatic, rather than cognate or xenolithic, to the Rotoiti ignimbrite magma, forming 78 from a spatially close but petrogenetically distinct magma batch (possibly derived from the Matahina 79 magmatic system) that was emplaced at a high crustal level and subsequently disturbed during the caldera-80 collapse phase of the Rotoiti eruption (Brown et al., 1998; Burt et al., 1998; Charlier et al., 2003; Shane et 81 al., 2005). Cooling and crystallisation of the Group 1 granitoids is generally considered to have taken place 82 in at least two stages, with most crystallisation taking place at 10-15 km depth, followed by volatile-loss, 83 undercooling and crystallisation at < 3 km, associated with upheaval caused by migration of the Rotoiti 84 magma towards the surface (Brown et al., 1998; Burt et al., 1998).

85

86 **1.2 Previous age estimates for the Rotoiti eruption**

The range of published ages for the Rotoiti eruption is given in Table 1, along with pertinent details, and in
Figure 2 (all ages in this paper are quoted as ± 1σ, where known). The earliest attempts to assign an age to
the Rotoiti eruption utilised radiocarbon dating and were plagued by difficulties relating to the age limit for
¹⁴C dating (generally considered to be ~40-50 ka) and contamination with younger carbon material
(Froggatt and Lowe, 1990; Grant-Taylor and Rafter, 1971; Lowe and Hogg, 1995; Nairn and Kohn, 1973;
Nathan, 1976; Pillans and Wright, 1992; Pullar, 1976; Pullar and Heine, 1971; Shane, 2000; Thompson,
1968a; Vucetich and Pullar, 1969; Whitehead and Ditchburn, 1994). For many years, Wilson et al.'s (1992)

Method	Unit	Age (ka) ±1σ	Notes	References
¹⁴ C (pre-2000)	Rotoiti breccia and ash	31 - > 41	Ages at limit of detection and contaminated by younger carbon.	1-8, 10, 12, 17, 18
²³⁸ U- ²³⁰ Th disequilibrium	Rotoehu ash	71 ± 6	Data considered invalid by refs 10,18	9
Electron spin resonance	Rotoiti breccia	45.2 ± 8.2	Refs 9 and 10 suggest data may be invalid due to U-Th disequilibrium.	11
Marine sedimentation rates	Rotoehu ash	~55	Tephra not conclusively identified	12
K/Ar	Mayor island lava bracketing Rotoehu ash	64 ± 4	Overlying lava = 67 \pm 11 ka. Underlying lava = 63 \pm 5 ka	13
Stratigraphic age	Extrapolation between marine terrace ages formed pre and post deposition	52 ± 7	Ages of bracketing terraces = 40 and 59 ka. Ages of terraces refined to ~43 and 61 ka respectively by ref 21.	14,15
Amino acid racemization	Palaeosols bracketing Rotoiti breccia and ash	~61		16
Optical Luminescence Dating	Underlying and overlying palaeosols from 2 sections	42 ± 8 - 34 ± 3 44 ± 3 - 30 ± 2		19
¹⁴ C-AMS	Wood below the Rotoehu ash	43.2±0.6		20
²³⁸ U- ²³⁰ Th disequilibrium	Rotoehu ignimbrite – xenolith: Rotoehu ignimbrite - pumice	57 ± 8 > 29 \pm^{21}_{17}	Whole rock – magnetite – biotite Zircons	22
Lake sedimentation rates	Rotoehu ash	44.3	Palynology suggests Rotoehu ash deposited during MIS 3, i.e. between 59.1 and 29.0 ka	23
Lake sedimentation rates	Rotoehu ash	48.9	Composite depth scale calibrated by overlying ¹⁴ C dating of tephra	24
Marine sedimentation rates	Rotoehu ash	~45	Multiple deep sea sediment cores with chronology based on ¹⁴ C and Th/U- ¹⁴ C ages of coral and foraminifera.	25
Combined K-Ar and ⁴⁰ Ar/ ³⁹ Ar	Mayor island lava bracketing Rotoehu ash	61.0 ± 1.4	Ar/Ar dates from crystals from Rotoiti and EQF eruptions give ages of 47 - 125 ka	26
Orbitally tuned marine sediment	Rotoehu ash	45.1		27
Lake sedimentation rates	Rotoehu ash	46-52	Sedimentation rates extrapolated from the between overlying Maketu and Tahuna tephra layers	28
¹⁴ C-AMS	Underlying / Overlying Rotoehu ash	47.5 ± 2.1 44.8 ± 0.3	Ages calibrated to calendar years BP	29
(U-Th)/He	Rotoiti Breccia / Earthquake Flat Pumice	45.1 ± 3.3 45.1 ± 2.9		29

Table 1. Published age estimates of the Rotoiti eruption, in order of publication. 1 (Thompson, 1968b), 2 (Vucetich and Pullar, 1969), 3 (Pullar and Heine, 1971), 4 (Grant-Taylor and Rafter, 1971), 1971, 5 (Nairn and Kohn, 1973), 6 (Nathan, 1976), 7 (Pullar, 1976), 8 (Mcglone et al., 1984), 9 (Ota et al., 1989), 10 (Froggatt and Lowe, 1990), 11 (Buhay et al., 1992), 12 (Pillans and Wright, 1992), 13 (Wilson et al., 1992), 14 (Berryman, 1992), 15 (Berryman, 1993), 16 (Kimber et al., 1994), 17 (Whitehead and Ditchburn, 1994), 18 (Lowe and Hogg, 1995), 19 (Lian and Shane, 2000), 20 (Santos et al., 2001), 21 (Chappell, 2002), 22 (Charlier et al., 2003), 23 (Shane and Sandiford, 2003), 24 (Nilsson et al., 2011), 25 (Shane et al., 2006), 26 (Wilson et al., 2007), 27 (Allan et al., 2008), 28 (Molloy et al., 2008), 29 (Danišík et al., 2012)

94 age of 64 ± 4 ka, based on K/Ar dating of overlying (67 ± 11 ka) and underlying (63 ±5 ka) obsidian lava 95 flows on Mayor Island was considered to be the most reliable age for the Rotoiti eruption. This age was subsequently revised to 61.0 \pm 1.4 ka based on a ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar stepped heating plateau age of 58.5 \pm 1.1 ka for 96 97 the overlying Mayor Island obsidian lava flow and supported by stepped heating experiments on biotite and 98 plagioclase from the Rotoiti and EQF ignimbrites, which showed a high level of xenocrystic contamination (Wilson et al., 2007). Indeed, ²³⁸U-²³⁰Th disequilibrium dating of both Rotoiti pumice and granitoid clasts 99 100 and of the EQF ignimbrite indicates a prolonged crystallisation history, with isochron and weighted mean ages ranging from 51 \pm 14.5 ka to 122^{+9}_{-8} ka (Charlier et al., 2003; Charlier and Wilson, 2010; Danišík et al., 101 102 2012). Danišík et al. (2012) addressed the problem of age-inheritance in zircons by carrying out (U-Th)/He 103 dating, a method that has the advantage of avoiding potential pre-eruptive inheritance issues because of 104 the high diffusion rate of ⁴He at magmatic temperatures. They produced indistinguishable ages of 45.1 ± 105 3.3 and 45.1 ± 2.9 ka for the Rotoiti and EQF eruptions respectively. They also, along with Santos et al. 106 (2001) addressed earlier problems with ¹⁴C dating of the Rotoiti eruption by utilising high-sensitivity 107 Accelerator Mass Spectroscopy (AMS) and improved sample preparation procedures to remove contaminating younger carbon, producing ¹⁴C ages for material underlying and overlying the Rotoehu ash 108 109 that are consistent with the (U-Th)/He dates. This younger date is also consistent with numerous age estimates (generally 45-50 ka) based on marine and lake sedimentation rates, calibrated by ¹⁴C dating of 110 111 younger tephras (Allan et al., 2008; Molloy et al., 2009; Nilsson et al., 2011; Pillans and Wright, 1992; Shane 112 et al., 2006; Shane and Sandiford, 2003) and with Optical Luminescence (OSL) dating of palaeosols above 113 and below the Rotoiti deposits. A slightly older (but with larger errors, overlapping most other age estimates) stratigraphic age for the Rotoehu ash of 52 ± 7 ka was proposed by Berryman, (1992, 1993) 114 115 based on correlation of sediments bound by ages of marine terraces. The bounding terrace ages (40 ka and 59 ka) were based on correlation with marine terraces at the Huon Peninsula, New Guinea, dated by ¹⁴C 116 117 and ²³⁰Th/²³⁴U dating of corals (Chappell and Shackleton, 1986). Wilson et al. (2007) noted an updated age 118 for the terraces (Chappell, 2002) and suggested that, according to Berryman's correlations, the Rotoiti 119 eruption must have occurred between 72.8 ± 1.1 and 51.8 ± 0.4 ka. However, these ages are based on 120 incorrect identification of the relevant marine terraces, probably due to inconsistencies in terrace naming

between Chappell and Shackleton (1986) and Chappell (2002); the correct age for the older terrace is 61.4
ka and the younger terrace was not re-dated, but is likely ~43 ka, based on extrapolation between older
(43.9 ka) and younger (42.1 ka) terraces, suggesting that the Rotoiti eruption took place between 61.4 and
43 ka.



Figure 2. Schematic diagram showing ages published for the Rotoiti eruption. Vertical bars represent 1 standard deviation of published ages, or set as arbitrary squares where errors are not available (12, 16, 23-25, 27). Numbers refer to the references cited in Table 1. The horizontal grey bar represents the age \pm 1 σ determined in this study.

124 **2. Samples and methodology**

125 Despite evidence of pre-eruption age zircons and thus an extended crystallisation history of Group 1

126 granitoid fragments (Charlier et al., 2003), the abundant quench textures which they exhibit indicate that at

127 least part of the clasts crystallised during eruption. Sample 103/1, collected from the same granitoid block

as sample 103/2, analysed by Charlier et al. (2003), contains abundant glass and miarolytic cavities lined

129 with euhedral K-feldspar, quartz and biotite, which we interpret as having crystallised and quenched during

130 eruption.

131 A polished thin section was prepared by impregnating a split of the sample with blue epoxy to highlight the 132 miarolytic cavities and porosity of the sample. This section (Figure 3) exhibits many of the quench features 133 identified by Burt et al. (1998) and Charlier et al. (2003), such as granophyric texture, along with euhedral 134 quartz and K-feldspar crystals forming linings to the miarolytic cavities. Optical petrography of the euhedral 135 K-feldspars shows that they are highly strained, exhibiting strongly developed cleavage planes, patchy, 136 streaky and undulose extinction and, in some crystals, kinked cleavage planes and fine-scale structures in 137 the core of the crystal, that appear streaky under both PPL and XPL (Figure 3B). These structures are similar 138 in appearance to plagioclase-alkali feldspar intergrowths, and patchy extinction and sector zoning formed 139 during sanidine crystallisation from an undercooled melt (Lofgren and Gooley, 1977). We interpret these 140 feldspar textures as representing a combination of crystallisation during melt undercooling, and 141 deformation during shearing processes during mobilisation and eruption, a process considered to be 142 ubiquitous in the Group 1 granitoids (Brown et al., 1998; Burt et al., 1998).

Element mapping and semi-quantitative spot analyses were carried out on the polished section using a Bruker-nano M4 Tornado benchtop micro-XRF system. Analysis conditions, a summary of the technique and all semi-quantitative data are given in the supplementary information and Supplementary Data Table S1. A major element map displaying Si, K and Fe is shown in Figure 3A. The large area (1.5 ×2.5 cm) covered by the x-ray map reveals that many of the granophyric intergrowths radiate towards the miarolytic cavities, often terminating with euhedral quartz and K-feldspar crystals that project into the cavity.

A semi-quantitative chemical composition profile across a euhedral K-feldspar crystal (Figure 3D) suggests cryptic normal zoning, with relative Na-enrichment in the core and K-enrichment at the rim. Spot analyses of the fine-scale structures in Figure 3b indicate a relative enrichment of CaO and Na₂O and depletion of K₂O, consistent with our interpretation that they represent plagioclase – K-feldspar intergrowths during undercooling.



155

156 Figure 3. A) μ -XRF element map from a polished section of a miarolytic cavity in a granitoid clast. Elements are displayed as Si = red, K = green and Fe = blue, therefore quartz displays as bright red, K-157 158 feldspar as green, plagioclase as dark red and biotite and Fe-oxides as blue. White boxes show the 159 positions of panels B (left) and C (right). B) XPL photomicrograph of an alkali feldspar crystal protruding into the miarolytic cavity. The white dotted line highlights fine-scale textures interpreted as plagioclase – 160 K-feldspar intergrowths. Q = quartz crystals. C) XPL photomicrograph of an alkali feldspar crystal that 161 162 grew into the miarolytic cavity. The crystal displays streaky and patchy extinction. The line a-b shows the 163 position of the semi-quantitative chemical profile shown in panel (D) (see supplementary information for 164 details). In the photomicrographs, white arrows highlight regions in the crystals rich in fluid and / or 165 magmatic inclusions. Blue colouration is from impregnation during section preparation and highlights the permeable nature of the granitoids. 166

167

0.5-1 mm euhedral K-feldspar and 1-2 mm biotite crystals were hand-picked from miarolytic cavity linings
of the kind illustrated in Figure 3A and prepared for irradiation for Ar-isotope analysis using standard
techniques (see supplementary information). Given the likely extended crystallisation history of the
granitoid clasts, all Ar-isotope analyses were carried out on single crystals to enable identification of any
crystals that record pre-eruptive ages and prevent mixing of crystal populations. We carried out a

173 combination of single grain fusion and single grain stepped heating experiments on both K-feldspar and 174 biotite crystals using a 50 W Synrad CO₂ laser. Gas clean-up was through an all-metal extraction line with a -175 130 °C cold trap, to remove H₂O, and two water-cooled SEAES GP-50 getters to absorb reactive gases. The 176 Ar-isotope analyses were carried out on a Nu Instruments Noblesse multi-collector noble gas mass 177 spectrometer. Analytical procedures, previously documented in Brumm et al., (2010) are detailed in the 178 supplementary information file and all results, correction factors and constants are given in the 179 supplementary data file. As previous studies on similar material (Wilson et al., 2007) had reported high 180 levels of contamination with Cl, which can cause an isobaric interference with ³⁶Ar in the mass spectrometer by formation of ¹H³⁵Cl, ³⁵Cl was measured in addition to the Ar-isotope analyses to monitor 181 182 for Cl contamination, none of which was observed.

183 **3.** ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar Results

Results of the Ar-isotope single crystal analyses are given in supplementary Tables 2 and Figures 4 - 7. Kfeldspar single grain fusion ages (excluding data with blank-corrected ⁴⁰Ar yields of less than 0.5 mV (~30,000 cps) and zero ⁴⁰Ar* yields; n = 27) range from 31 ± 5 ka to 125 ± 18 ka, indicating that some grains record pre-eruption model ages, i.e. they are either xenocrystic or contain excess ⁴⁰Ar. Biotite single grain fusion ages (n=4) range from 39 ± 8 ka to 57 ± 6 ka. An isotope correlation diagram plotting all of the single crystal fusion data (Figure 5) gives an inverse isochron age of 55.3 ± 1.8 ka.

Stepped heating experiments were carried out on 5 K-feldspar and 1 biotite crystals, yielding 3 steps for the K-feldspars and 4 steps for the biotite, although some of these steps produced exceptionally low ⁴⁰Ar, ⁴⁰Ar* and / or ³⁹Ar gas yields. The individual step heating data yielded apparent ages from 39 ± 8 ka to 105 ± 16 ka.

Three of the five K-feldspar crystals gave high apparent ages for the first temperature step (up to 105 ka) and exhibit decreasing age with increasing temperature (e.g. 2608-02, Figure 4) while a fourth followed the same pattern but the first and final temperature steps yielded < 0.5 mV ⁴⁰Ar and so have been discounted. Isochrons could not be calculated for these crystals. Stepped heating of K-feldspar 2608-04 yielded

consistent ages for all three temperature steps, giving a 3-step "plateau" age of 50 ± 4 ka (Figure 4) and a 3point isochron age of 51 ± 0.5 ka (40 Ar/ 36 Ar = 298 ± 3, MSWD = 0.5, p = 0.48). Stepped heating was attempted on one biotite crystal using 4 temperature (laser power) steps. The first two of these steps released gas with an 40 Ar/ 36 Ar composition within uncertainty of the atmospheric ratio of 298.56, and can be attributed to the release of loosely adhering atmospheric argon from gentle heating of the crystal.



203



209

⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar ages from stepped heating of individual crystals that vary beyond normal analytical uncertainties
 can be interpreted in terms of excess ⁴⁰Ar, inherited ⁴⁰Ar in xenocrystic or antecrystic cores, or as ³⁹Ar loss
 due to recoil. These possibilities are discussed below.

213 **4. Interpretation of variable model** ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar ages

214 **4.1 Inherited** ⁴⁰Ar*.

- 215 Inherited ⁴⁰Ar* is a possible reason for older ages observed in both stepped heating and fusion analyses.
- 216 The granitoid clasts are interpreted as having crystallised in multiple stages (Brown et al., 1998; Burt et al.,

217 1998) and contain zircons that record pre-eruption ages (Charlier et al., 2003) and so it would be expected 218 that these clasts contain antecrystic material. However, we purposefully selected crystals lining miarolytic cavities in the clasts to avoid antecrysts retaining ⁴⁰Ar* older than the eruption. The bulk of sample 103/1 219 220 has a sugary, friable texture, indicative of gas exsolution and quenching of interstitial melt to form volcanic 221 glass. The glass was considered by Brown et al., (1998) to be interstitial melt, rather than infiltrated melt or 222 partial melt during reheating based on textural and chemical analysis. The presence of glass quenched from 223 interstitial melt indicates that the granitoid remained partially molten until eruption and will have sustained 224 elevated temperatures; Brown et al., (1998) suggested a feldspar thermometry crystallisation temperature of 700 °C for the later stage, supercooled crystals. Granophyric texture (Figure 3) and miarolytic cavities 225 226 are further evidence that this sample crystallised and quenched during transport to the surface (Brown et 227 al., 1998; Burt et al., 1998) and it is difficult to envisage a scenario where miarolytic cavities and glass could 228 form in the subsurface and be retained over geochronologically significant timescales without being 229 modified.

If the crystals we analysed did form thousands of years before the eruption and retained a portion of their
⁴⁰Ar*, we would expect this to be reflected in the age spectra produced by stepped heating experiments.
Inherited ⁴⁰Ar* would diffuse out of the crystal while ever the crystal is held at elevated temperature in the
subsurface and / or during eruption and so the highest concentration of ⁴⁰Ar* would be in the core of the
crystal. This would manifest on age spectra as younger ages in the early steps and older ages in the latter
steps. This pattern is opposite to what is observed for stepped heating of single feldspar crystals, which
produce the oldest ages in the earliest steps.

As a further check, we carried out diffusion modelling to assess whether a feldspar that crystallised as part of a partially molten mush, thousands of years before the eruption, would retain any ⁴⁰Ar* and thus give older ages. We considered a simplified scenario where an Ar-bearing feldspar was held at 700 °C and modelled the fractional Ar loss experienced by the crystal. We assumed a spherical crystal of radius of 0.5 mm (the largest crystals analysed), D₀ = 0.0098 cm² s⁻¹ and E = 44 kcal mol⁻¹ (Foland, 1994) and used the fractional loss equations given in McDougall and Harrison (1999). Under these conditions, 100% of the Ar in

the crystal would have been lost after just 40 years. Feldspars of this size that crystallised thousands of
years before the eruption would only retain a significant proportion (>50%) of their ⁴⁰Ar* at temperatures <
500 °C; the evidence for interstitial melt in the granitoid clasts is not consistent with such low
temperatures.

247

248 4.2 Recoil of ³⁹Ar

Recoil of ³⁹Ar during neutron irradiation may result in ejection of ³⁹Ar atoms from the crystal lattice and can
be a problem for samples where the grain size is approaching the ³⁹Ar recoil distance (partial depletion
layer thickness of 0.7 μm - (Jourdan et al., 2007)). Recoil typically manifests on age spectra as a stepwise
decrease in age with increasing temperature, similar to that observed during stepped heating of our
individual feldspar crystals; gas release from early temperature steps is dominated by that from the smaller
grain sizes most affected by recoil and the relative depletion in ³⁹Ar relative to ⁴⁰Ar* results of overestimation of the ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar age.

In the case of our Rotoiti samples, individual crystals are ~ 1mm diameter or larger; many appear fractured in thin section (Fig. 3B) but these fracture domains are still tens of microns in diameter and thus unlikely to be affected by recoil. It is possible that the observed patches of streaky extinction and very fine lamellae in some of the K-feldspar crystals represent structures that could facilitate recoil of ³⁹Ar, but these often occur as discrete patches interspersed with areas that are more homogenous and it is likely that such a scenario would not produce the "classic" decreasing age spectrum associated with recoil.

262 4.3 Excess ⁴⁰Ar

Excess ⁴⁰Ar hosted in melt or fluid inclusions may produce age spectra with older apparent ages in the early temperature steps; decrepitation of the inclusions releases the excess ⁴⁰Ar during the earliest heating stages and contributes to the classic "saddle-shaped" age spectrum associated with excess ⁴⁰Ar.

The age spectra produced by stepped heating of individual crystals (Fig. 4) are consistent with fluid / magmatic inclusion-hosted excess ⁴⁰Ar. Futhermore, many K-feldspars in sample 103/1, contain an abundance of magmatic and / or fluid inclusions (Figure 3).

The stepped heating data suggest that this excess ⁴⁰Ar is present in varying degrees in many, but not all of the crystals; the flat release and younger apparent age of crystal 2608-04 suggests that it contains little or no excess ⁴⁰Ar. If excess ⁴⁰Ar is inhomogeneously distributed within a sample (e.g. in clusters of fluid or magmatic inclusions, as observed in the photomicrographs in Figure 3), especially if it is decoupled from an atmospheric component (i.e. 3-way mixing between radiogenic, atmospheric and excess Ar), it can be difficult or impossible to identify using isotope correlation diagrams as regressions of the data will tend to yield an atmospheric intercept and an apparent age that is too old (Kuiper, 2002).

276 **4.4 Eruption age vs. excess** ⁴⁰Ar age

277 Plotting the stepped heating data from all six (5 K-feldspar, 1 biotite) crystals onto an isotope correlation diagram produces an apparent age of 54 ± 3 ka with a trapped 40 Ar/36 Ar content of 298.9 ± 1.6 (n=14/16, 278 279 two data points automatically rejected by the Mass Spec software). In Figure 5 the data are plotted 280 according to their temperature step; low temperature steps (light grey) tend to lie below the isochron line 281 while the higher temperature steps (black) lie on or above the line. The isochron has an atmospheric 282 intercept, despite an excess ⁴⁰Ar component clearly being identified on age spectra. Such a distribution of data points is consistent with a scenario involving mixing of atmospheric, radiogenic and excess ⁴⁰Ar, as 283 described by (Kuiper, 2002). Data points not affected by excess ⁴⁰Ar would define an isochron formed by a 284 285 mixing line between radiogenic and atmospheric end-members, with an atmospheric intercept. Heterogeneous incorporation of excess ⁴⁰Ar, as a source of trapped Ar additional to atmosphere, shifts the 286 287 data points downwards and to the left of the isochron line. This has the net effect of increasing the slope of 288 the calculated isochron line, resulting in an older age, whilst maintaining an atmospheric intercept; such an 289 apparent isochron is an artefact and does not represent mixing between a single trapped and radiogenic 290 end members (Kuiper, 2002). The high MSWD (2) suggests that the scatter of the data is greater than would 291 be expected based on the errors on the individual data points and this is consistent with this interpretation

of variably-distributed excess ⁴⁰Ar. Inspection of the stepped heating isochron shows that it is dominated by
data from the middle and high temperature steps. Given that the middle temperature steps may still

- 294 contain excess ⁴⁰Ar, this isochron age is considered to be an over-estimate and an upper limit of the
- 295 eruption age.



296

297 Figure 5: Isotope correlation diagrams created using the software Mass Spec (Al Deino, Berkeley Geochronology Center). Isochron ages were calculated invoking an automated data filtering process to 298 299 eliminate outliers on the basis of their large contribution to the weighted sum of squares of the linear 300 regression of the data. Top panel: Isotope correlation diagram combining stepped heating data from 6 individual crystal stepped heating experiments: 5 K-feldspar (ellipses) and 1 biotite (squares). The first 301 302 two biotite temperature steps were dominated by air and have been excluded from the diagrams for 303 clarity. Light grey symbols = low temperature steps (~0.5W), dark grey symbols = medium temperature steps (~1.5 W) and black symbols = high temperature steps (4-10 W). Bottom panel: Isotope correlation 304 305 diagram of the single crystal fusion data. Ellipses = K-felsdpar data, squares = biotite data. Filled symbols 306 show the data contributing to the grey isochron line $(55.3 \pm 1.1 \text{ ka})$ which is based on all of the single 307 crystal fusion data. Black symbols represent the data points thought to be least-contaminated by excess 308 40 Ar (see main text on the unmixing model) and form an isochron with an age of 50 \pm 3 ka.

Next we consider whether the single crystal total fusion data can improve our estimate of the eruption age. If we assume that each crystal contains a different amount of excess ⁴⁰Ar, and that some crystals contain little or no excess ⁴⁰Ar as shown by the step-heating experiments, we can treat the dataset as a mixture of populations with different apparent ages, and that the youngest coherent age population represents the crystals least contaminated with excess ⁴⁰Ar and is a best-estimate of the eruption age.

314 To identify the youngest coherent age population, ages were initially analysed using the Isoplot unmixing 315 tool (Ludwig, 2008), which is based on Sambridge and Compston's (1994) algorithms for deconvoluting 316 mixtures of similar age zircon populations. These algorithms aim to determine the true number of age 317 components, their age values, and their relative proportions using an iterative procedure; the exact values 318 of the true age and relative proportions of the different populations are not directly recoverable and, 319 instead, the model makes a best estimate of the ages and proportions, based on a maximised likelihood of 320 the data representing multiple age components (Sambridge and Compston, 1994). The procedure begins 321 with a guess of the number of age components (age populations) and returns an estimate of the ages (with 322 error), relative proportions of those components and likelihood that the data are best described by those 323 components (the likelihood is returned as the inverse log of the likelihood – the relative misfit parameter). 324 The procedure is repeated using a different number of components until a minimum value for the relative 325 misfit parameter is achieved. The model assumes that all populations have a Gaussian distribution. The 326 relative proportions are calculated as the ratio of the areas beneath each population's distribution curve 327 (Figure 6) (Sambridge and Compston, 1994).

Use of this model to fully assess our single crystal fusion data is a little problematic because of the requirement for a Gaussian age distribution; while we expect the analyses not contaminated with excess ⁴⁰Ar to approximate a Gaussian distribution, this is unlikely for the variable contaminated crystals and the actual spread of ages in this population is likely to include a substantial tail to older ages. To maximise the likelihood of the model giving meaningful results, we attempted to remove the non-Gaussian tail from the excess ⁴⁰Ar contaminated population by excluding all ages greater than Wilson et al's (1992) initial age estimate of 64 ka. We also excluded the three youngest data (all of which gave geologically unreasonable

ages of <32 ka). For the remaining 22 data points, a minimum value for the relative misfit parameter (1.044) was achieved by invoking 2 populations with the youngest population estimated at 47.9 \pm 2.1 ka and formed by 55% of the data and the older population estimated at 56.9 \pm 3.6 ka and formed by 45% of the data (Figure 6).



339

340 Figure 6: Sambridge and Compston's (1994) unmixing model for the single crystal fusion ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar age 341 data. Using Isoplot, the unmixing model suggests two populations are present: a younger population (estimated age 47.9 \pm 2.1 ka, 55%) and an older, excess ⁴⁰Ar contaminated population (estimated age 342 343 59.6± 3.6 ka, 45%). The relative proportions of the populations are calculated by ratioing the area 344 beneath the population curves. Where the curves overlap (grey shading), it is difficult to conclusively 345 assign individual data points to each population. The diagram shows a hypothetical analysis with an age 346 of 53 ka (dashed line) - the probability of this analysis belonging to the older population (f2) is greater 347 than the probability of it belonging to the younger population (f1), but it could belong to either.

348 This unmixing model was used to select analyses belonging to the youngest population from which to 349 calculate a weighted average. Assigning each individual analysis to a population becomes difficult for ages 350 that are described by both populations (shaded area on Figure 6). All ages > 52 ka (the point where the two 351 population distribution curves cross) have a higher probability of belonging to the older population than the younger population (see case study of a hypothetical 53 ka data point in Figure 6). Simply assuming that 352 353 the youngest 55% of the data (i.e. the youngest 12 analyses) represent the youngest population is likely to 354 exclude data that do belong to the younger population, but have ages > 52 ka. Instead we consider the 355 range of ages beneath the young population distribution curve as a guide to selecting data that are not

contaminated by excess ⁴⁰Ar and use 55 ka as an upper limit for data belonging to the young population.
Using this criterion, 13 out of the 22 analyses were assigned to the young population (39 ± 8 to 52 ± 4 ka). A
weighted average of these data gives an age of 47.4 ± 1.5 ka with a statistically acceptable MSWD
(according to the criteria of Wendt and Carl, 1991) of 0.58 for n = 13 and a probability of fit of 0.86. Figure 7
shows this weighted average in the context of the individual data, the distribution curves for the population
unmixing model, and our cut-off point for selecting data representative of the young population.

362



363

Figure 7: Single crystal fusion ages (circles = K-feldspar, squares = biotite) shown with the age distribution 364 365 of the two populations identified by the unmixing model (curves) and the 55 ka cut-off for selecting 366 analyses belonging to the youngest population (dashed vertical line). Grey symbols are data excluded 367 from the unmixing analyses to allow an approximation of Gaussian distribution for the populations. Filled 368 symbols represent data assigned to the young population. Open symbols represent data contaminated 369 with excess ⁴⁰Ar and thus yield ages older than the eruption. Circles = K-feldspar, squares = biotite. Black 370 vertical line is the weighted average $\pm 1\sigma$ of the young population (n=13). Error bars on individual 371 analyses are 1σ .

A further assessment of this age was carried out by plotting an isochron of the data assigned to the young population, giving an age of 50 ± 3 ka, a 40 Ar/ 36 Ar intercept of 297 ± 2 , and an MSWD of 0.5. Figure 5 (lower panel) compares this isochron to the full single crystal fusion data set. This isochron age is indistinguishable from both the weighted average age and the youngest population derived by the unmixing model. Visual inspection of the single crystal fusion isochron plots in Figure 5 shows that the data thought to belong to 377 the young population form a trend that is qualitatively different from the other analyses, as would be

378 expected when comparing an excess ⁴⁰Ar-free population with data that are contaminated with excess ⁴⁰Ar.

379 **5. Discussion and implications**

380 Our preferred estimate of the eruption age is the statistically robust weighted mean (47.4 ± 1.5 ka). It is 381 consistent with a number of previously published ages for the Rotoiti eruption (Berryman, 1993, 1993; 382 Buhay et al., 1992; Charlier et al., 2003; Danišík et al., 2012; Lian and Shane, 2000; Molloy et al., 2009; Nilsson et al., 2011; Santos et al., 2001; Shane et al., 2006; Shane and Sandiford, 2003), but is significantly 383 384 younger than Wilson et al.'s (2007) age. The latter (61.0 ± 1.4 ka) is based on extrapolation between a K-Ar age for an underlying lava flow and a ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar age for an overlying obsidian lava flow (58.5 ± 1.1 ka) that 385 386 bracket the Rotoehu ash on Mayor Island. Regardless of accuracy of Wilson et al's age extrapolation to the 387 Rotoehu ash, the ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar age of the overlying lava flow should be younger than that of the Rotoiti eruption; this is not observed for our new eruption age and this discrepancy warrants discussion. 388

In addition to the overlying lava age, Wilson et al (2007) also report ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar ages from stepped heating 389 390 experiments carried out on multi-grain aliquots of biotite and plagioclase separated from the Rotoiti 391 Pumice, fused lithic clasts similar to the sample analysed in this study, and from the Earthquake Flat 392 Pumice. While some of these ages clearly reflect contamination with excess or inherited ⁴⁰Ar, others are 393 comparable to Wilson et al's proposed eruption age. However, almost half of these ages overlap with our 394 proposed eruption age at 2 standard deviations. Furthermore, as previously noted by Danišík et al. (2012), 395 Wilson et al state that initial stepped heating experiments on biotites from fused lithics yielded younger 396 isochron ages of 47 and 55 ka, but that these were discarded as they were at odds with the bracketing lava 397 ages.

398 It seems the main discrepancy between our proposed age and that of Wilson et al (2007) concerns the ages 399 of the overlying Mayor Island lava, which was determined on obsidian from the basal carapace. Either this 400 obsidian age is too old or our K-feldspar and biotite ages are too young. To investigate if the discrepancy 401 between our Rotoiti eruption age and Wilson et al's (2007) overlying lava flow age can be explained by differences in assumed fluence monitor age, we recalculated both Mayor Island and Rotoiti eruption ages
 according to different monitor ages.

404 Wilson et al (2007) used Taylor Creek sanidine (TCs) as their neutron fluence, with an assumed age of 27.87 Ma (Calvert and Lanphere, 2006), while we used ACs with an age of 1.1851 Ma (Rivera et al., 2013). 405 406 Published ages for TCs range from 27.87 – 28.62 ka (Duffield and Dalrymple, 1990; Karner and Renne, 1998; 407 Kuiper et al., 2008; Renne et al., 2010; Sarna-Wojcicki et al., 2000), while recent published ACs ages range 408 from 1.180 ± 0.0025Ma (Coble et al., 2011) to 1.2056 ± 0.0019 Ma (Renne et al., 2011). Recalculating the Mayor Island obsidian flow using a TCs age of 28.62 Ma increases the obsidian age from 58.5 ka to 60.1 ka. 409 410 Recalculating our 47.4 ka Rotoiti eruption age using ACs ages of 1.180 Ma and 1.2056 Ma gives ages of 47.2 411 ka and 48.2 ka respectively. Our eruption age remains significantly younger than Wilson et al's age for the 412 overlying lava and this discrepancy cannot be explained by differences in fluence monitor age. Young apparent ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar ages may result from loss of ⁴⁰Ar* during reheating or alteration or by over-413 correction for atmospheric ⁴⁰Ar by an apparent excess of ³⁶Ar. Loss of radiogenic ⁴⁰Ar* during reheating is 414 415 not thought to be an issue for our samples as these volcanic rocks have remained at the surface of the 416 earth since they were erupted and so have not experienced subsequent heating events. While alteration 417 may be an issue for a minority of analyses, our K-feldspar crystals were fresh with a glassy appearance and 418 were often optically clear and euhedral while the biotite crystals appeared fresh and unaltered. Apparent 419 excesses of ³⁶Ar may occur due to isobaric interferences in the mass spectrometer from ($^{12}C_3$) and ($^{1}H^{35}CI$). We do not think this is likely as the Noblesse is able to partially resolve ³⁶Ar from (¹²C₃) and mass 35 was 420 421 measured for each analysis to monitor Cl contamination, but never yielded analyses greater than blank values. If a fractionated Ar-isotope component enriched in ³⁶Ar were incorporated homogenously into the 422 423 crystals, this would result in younger individual apparent ages, but not affect the isochron ages and be 424 detectable on isotope correlation diagrams. Inhomogeneous incorporation of excess ³⁶Ar may not be 425 detectable, but this fractionated component would also have to reside in the crystal lattice and be released

426 at high-temperatures to reproduce the stepped heating data, which seems unlikely. Furthermore, excess

427 ³⁶Ar has not been documented in crystalline materials before.

Whilst obsidian has been successfully used to produce geologically meaningful ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar ages (Flude et al., 428 429 2010; Morgan et al., 2009; Vogel et al., 2006), it is known to be problematic for reasons that are only just 430 starting to become clear, and it is at least qualitatively possible that these poorly-understood processes can result in over-estimation of ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar age spectra and isochron ages. Brown et al. (2009) and Morgan et al. 431 432 (2009) suggested that the Ar-isotope composition of obsidians in Ethiopia had been affected by kinetic isotope fractionation of atmospheric gas either prior to or during absorption, while Flude et al. (in prep) 433 434 concluded that kinetic isotope fractionation during magmatic degassing produced heterogeneously 435 distributed excess ⁴⁰Ar due to preferential loss of ³⁶Ar during degassing. As already discussed, when distributed heterogeneously, excess ⁴⁰Ar may be difficult to detect via age spectra and isotope correlation 436 437 diagrams (Kuiper, 2002; Sherlock and Arnaud, 1999), and this may be exacerbated when step-heating 438 aliquots of crushed obsidian which may mix small-scale isotope reservoirs and destroy any naturally 439 occurring isotope profiles that might be detected by stepped-heating of a single fragment (i.e. the 440 laboratory diffusion dimension is less than the natural diffusion dimension). Furthermore, if kinetic isotopic 441 fractionation were to take place during stepped heating of obsidian in the laboratory we would expect ³⁶Ar to be released faster than ⁴⁰Ar, resulting in relative depression of ⁴⁰Ar/³⁶Ar values in the earliest heating 442 steps and elevation in the later heating steps. Isochrons from such data may give apparent ages that are 443 too high with ⁴⁰Ar/³⁶Ar intercepts that are too low, thus obscuring the presence of any excess ⁴⁰Ar and 444 yielding an incorrect but seemingly robust apparent ${}^{40}Ar/{}^{39}Ar$ age. 445

We are unable to identify a mechanism that could result in our proposed eruption age being underestimated by ~10-15 kyrs, but it is possible that Wilson et al's (2007) obsidian age is an over-estimate. We also note that our proposed eruption age is within error of many other age estimates for the Rotoiti eruption, is consistent with palaeoenvironmental interpretations (Shane and Sandiford, 2003), and that there are now three radio-isotope techniques (¹⁴C, U-Th-He, ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar) that have yielded consistent eruption ages ~ 45-47 ka. As previously discussed by Danišík et al. (2012), adopting a younger age for the Rotoiti eruption suggests that the TVZ has been much more active than previously realised. Revision

453 increases silicic magma production rates for the Okataina caldera complex from 2.5 km³ ka⁻¹ (Wilson et al.,

454 1995) to 3.8 km³ ka⁻¹ and magma eruption rates of the TVZ are revised to~ 17 km³ kyr⁻¹.

455 5. Conclusions

456 Vapour phase crystallisation of K-feldspar and biotite in miarolytic cavities of glass-bearing granitoid clasts entrained in the eruption of the Rotoiti ignimbrite provide high-K phases suitable for ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar dating of this 457 458 young, difficult to date eruption. Stepped-heating Ar-isotope analyses on single crystals indicate that excess 459 40 Ar is present in fluid and / or magmatic inclusions present in some of the crystals and is released at low 460 temperatures. This excess ⁴⁰Ar component is variable and not present in every crystal and so isotope 461 correlation diagrams using single crystal fusion data represent mixing between three components of ⁴⁰Ar (radiogenic, atmospheric and excess) and do not provide accurate trapped Ar compositions or ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar 462 463 ages. An isochron of the stepped heating data is dominated by the moderate-high temperature heating steps and gives an upper limit of the eruption age of 54 ± 3 ka. 464

465 The eruption age can be further refined by treating the single-crystal fusion data as a mixed population and 466 assuming that the youngest cohesive age population represents the eruption age. A population unmixing model was used to identify a young population, free from excess ⁴⁰Ar contamination. This population gave a 467 468 statistically valid weighted mean eruption age of 47.4 ± 1.5 ka which is indistinguishable from recent (U-469 Th)/He and ¹⁴C age determinations by Danišík et al. (2012) and from various other published age 470 determinations based on marine and lake sedimentation rates. However, our new age is significantly younger than the ⁴⁰Ar/³⁹Ar age for an obsidian lava flow overlying the Rotoehu ash on Mayor Island, 471 472 presented by Wilson et al. (2007) and this discrepancy may be explained by kinetic fractionation of Ar-473 isotopes in obsidian both in nature and the laboratory.

474 Acknowledgements

Fieldwork in New Zealand was carried out by MS during tenure of a 1-year fellowship at the University of
Waikato. The Quaternary Dating Laboratory at Roskilde University is funded by the Villum Foundation. This

- 477 manuscript benefitted from comments and discussion by reviewers Andy Calvert and an anonymous
- 478 reviewer, and Editor Paul Renne.

479 References

- Allan, A.S.R., Baker, J.A., Carter, L., Wysoczanksi, R.J., 2008. Reconstructing the Quaternary evolution of the
 world's most active silicic volcanic system: insights from an ~1.65 Ma deep ocean tephra record
 sourced from Taupo Volcanic Zone, New Zealand. Quaternary Science Reviews 27, 2341–2360.
 doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2008.09.003
- Berryman, K., 1992. A stratigraphic age of Rotoehu Ash and late Pleistocene climate interpretation based
 on marine terrace chronology, Mahia Peninsula, North Island, New Zealand. New Zealand Journal
 of Geology and Geophysics 35, 1–7. doi:10.1080/00288306.1992.9514494
- Berryman, K.R., 1993. Distribution, age, and deformation of Late Pleistocene marine terraces at Mahia
 Peninsula, Hikurangi Subduction Margin, New Zealand. Tectonics 12, 1365–1379.
 doi:10.1029/93TC01543
- Brown, F.H., Reid, C., Negash, A., 2009. Possible isotopic fractionation of argon in source obsidians and
 archeological artifacts from Kulkuletti, Ethiopia. Journal of Archaeological Science 36, 2119–2124.
 doi:10.1016/j.jas.2009.05.008
- Brown, S.J., Burt, R., Cole, J., Krippner, S.J., Price, R., Cartwright, I., 1998. Plutonic lithics in ignimbrites of
 Taupo Volcanic Zone, New Zealand; sources and conditions of crystallisation. Chemical Geology
 148, 21–41. doi:10.1016/S0009-2541(98)00026-6
- Brumm, A., Jensen, G.M., van den Bergh, G.D., Morwood, M.J., Kurniawan, I., Aziz, F., Storey, M., 2010.
 Hominins on Flores, Indonesia, by one million years ago. Nature 464, 748–752.
 doi:10.1038/nature08844
- Buhay, W.M., Clifford, P.M., Schwarcz, H.P., 1992. ESR dating of the Rotoiti Breccia in the Taupo volcanic
 zone, New Zealand. Quaternary Science Reviews 11, 267–271. doi:10.1016/0277-3791(92)90072-G
- Burt, R.M., Brown, S.J.A., Cole, J.W., Shelley, D., Waight, T.E., 1998. Glass-bearing plutonic fragments from
 ignimbrites of the Okataina caldera complex, Taupo Volcanic Zone, New Zealand: remnants of a
 partially molten intrusion associated with preceding eruptions. Journal of Volcanology and
 Geothermal Research 84, 209–237. doi:10.1016/S0377-0273(98)00039-0
- Calvert, A.T., Lanphere, M.A., 2006. Argon geochronology of Kilauea's early submarine history. Journal of
 Volcanology and Geothermal Research 151, 1–18. doi:10.1016/j.jvolgeores.2005.07.023
- Chappell, J., 2002. Sea level changes forced ice breakouts in the Last Glacial cycle: new results from coral
 terraces. Quaternary Science Reviews 21, 1229–1240. doi:10.1016/S0277-3791(01)00141-X
- 509 Chappell, J., Shackleton, N.J., 1986. Oxygen isotopes and sea level. Nature 324, 137–140.
 510 doi:10.1038/324137a0
- Charlier, B.L.A., Wilson, C.J.N., 2010. Chronology and Evolution of Caldera-forming and Post-caldera Magma
 Systems at Okataina Volcano, New Zealand from Zircon U-Th Model-age Spectra. Journal of
 Petrology 51, 1121–1141. doi:10.1093/petrology/egq015
- Charlier, B.L., Peate, D.W., Wilson, C.J., Lowenstern, J.B., Storey, M., Brown, S.J., 2003. Crystallisation ages
 in coeval silicic magma bodies: 238U–230Th disequilibrium evidence from the Rotoiti and
 Earthquake Flat eruption deposits, Taupo Volcanic Zone, New Zealand. Earth and Planetary Science
 Letters 206, 441–457. doi:10.1016/S0012-821X(02)01109-3
- Coble, M.A., Grove, M., Calvert, A.T., 2011. Calibration of Nu-Instruments Noblesse multicollector mass
 spectrometers for argon isotopic measurements using a newly developed reference gas. Chemical
 Geology 290, 75–87. doi:10.1016/j.chemgeo.2011.09.003
- Danišík, M., Shane, P., Schmitt, A.K., Hogg, A., Santos, G.M., Storm, S., Evans, N.J., Keith Fifield, L., Lindsay,
 J.M., 2012. Re-anchoring the late Pleistocene tephrochronology of New Zealand based on
 concordant radiocarbon ages and combined 238U/230Th disequilibrium and (U–Th)/He zircon ages.
 Earth and Planetary Science Letters 349-350, 240–250. doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2012.06.041
- 525 Duffield, W., Dalrymple, Gb., 1990. The Taylor Creek Rhyolite of New Mexico: a rapidly emplaced field of 526 lava domes and flows. Bull Volcanol 52, 475–487. doi:10.1007/BF00268927

527 Ewart, A., Cole, J.W., 1967. Textural and mineralogical significance of the Granitic Xenoliths from the 528 Central Volcanic Region, North Island, New Zealand. New Zealand Journal of Geology and 529 Geophysics 10, 31-54. doi:10.1080/00288306.1967.10428183 Flude, S., McGarvie, D.W., Burgess, R., Tindle, A.G., 2010. Rhyolites at Kerlingarfjöll, Iceland: the evolution 530 531 and lifespan of silicic central volcanoes. Bulletin of Volcanology 72, 523–538. doi:10.1007/s00445-532 010-0344-0 533 Flude, S., Tuffen, H., Sherlock, S.C., Kelley, S.P., in prep. Excess 40Ar in obsidian from Ar-isotope 534 fractionation during magmatic degassing. Foland, K.A., 1994. Argon diffusion in feldspars, in: Parsons, I. (Ed.), Feldspars and Their Reactions. Kluwer 535 536 Academic Publishers. 537 Froggatt, P.C., Lowe, D.J., 1990. A review of late Quaternary silicic and some other tephra formations from 538 New Zealand: Their stratigraphy, nomenclature, distribution, volume, and age. New Zealand 539 Journal of Geology and Geophysics 33, 89–109. doi:10.1080/00288306.1990.10427576 Grant-Taylor, T.L., Rafter, T.A., 1971. New Zealand radiocarbon age measurements — 6. New Zealand 540 541 Journal of Geology and Geophysics 14, 364–402. doi:10.1080/00288306.1971.10421932 542 Jourdan, F., Matzel, J.P., Renne, P.R., 2007. 39Ar and 37Ar recoil loss during neutron irradiation of sanidine 543 and plagioclase. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 71, 2791-2808. doi:10.1016/j.gca.2007.03.017 544 Karner, D.B., Renne, P.R., 1998. 40Ar/39Ar geochronology of Roman volcanic province tephra in the Tiber 545 River valley: Age calibration of middle Pleistocene sea-level changes. Geological Society of America 546 Bulletin 110, 740-747. doi:10.1130/0016-7606(1998)110<0740:AAGORV>2.3.CO;2 547 Kimber, R.W.L., Kennedy, N.M., Milnes, A.R., 1994. Amino acid racemization dating of a 140 000 year old 548 tephra-loess-palaeosol sequence on the Mamaku Plateau near Rotorua, New Zealand. Australian 549 Journal of Earth Sciences 41, 19-26. doi:10.1080/08120099408728109 550 Kuiper, K.F., Deino, A., Hilgen, F.J., Krijgsman, W., Renne, P.R., Wijbrans, J.R., 2008. Synchronizing Rock 551 Clocks of Earth History. Science 320, 500-504. doi:10.1126/science.1154339 Kuiper, Y.D., 2002. The interpretation of inverse isochron diagrams in 40Ar/39Ar geochronology. Earth and 552 553 Planetary Science Letters 203, 499–506. doi:10.1016/S0012-821X(02)00833-6 554 Lian, O.B., Shane, P.A., 2000. Optical dating of paleosols bracketing the widespread Rotoehu tephra, North 555 Island, New Zealand. Quaternary Science Reviews 19, 1649–1662. doi:10.1016/S0277-556 3791(00)00003-2 557 Lofgren, G.E., Gooley, R., 1977. Simultaneous crystallization of feldspar intergrowths from the melt. 558 American Mineralogist 62, 217–228. 559 Lowe, D.J., Hogg, A.G., 1995. Letter to the Editor: Age of the Rotoehu Ash Comment. New Zealand Journal of Geology and Geophysics 38, 399-402. doi:10.1080/00288306.1995.9514666 560 561 Ludwig, K.R., 2008. User's manual for Isoplot 3.7: A geochronological Toolkit for Microsoft Excel. 562 McDougall, I., Harrison, T.M., 1999. Geochronology and Thermochronology by the 40Ar/39Ar method, 2nd 563 Edition. ed. Oxford University Press. 564 Mcglone, M.S., Howorth, R., Pullar, W.A., 1984. Late Pleistocene stratigraphy, vegetation and climate of the 565 Bay of Plenty and Gisborne regions, New Zealand. New Zealand Journal of Geology and Geophysics 566 27, 327-350. 567 Molloy, C., Shane, P., Augustinus, P., 2009. Eruption recurrence rates in a basaltic volcanic field based on 568 tephra layers in maar sediments: Implications for hazards in the Auckland volcanic field. Geological 569 Society of America Bulletin 121, 1666–1677. doi:10.1130/B26447.1 570 Molloy, C., Shane, P., Nairn, I., 2008. Pre-eruption thermal rejuvenation and stirring of a partly crystalline 571 rhyolite pluton revealed by the Earthquake Flat Pyroclastics deposits, New Zealand. Journal of the 572 Geological Society 165, 435-447. doi:10.1144/0016-76492007-071 573 Morgan, L.E., Renne, P.R., Taylor, R.E., WoldeGabriel, G., 2009. Archaeological age constraints from 574 extrusion ages of obsidian: Examples from the Middle Awash, Ethiopia. Quaternary Geochronology 575 4, 193-203. doi:10.1016/j.quageo.2009.01.001 576 Nairn, I.A., Kohn, B.P., 1973. Relation of the Earthquake Flat Breccia to the Rotoiti Breccia, Central North 577 Island, New Zealand. New Zealand Journal of Geology and Geophysics 16, 269–279. 578 doi:10.1080/00288306.1973.10431457

- Nathan, S., 1976. Age of the Rotoiti Breccia formation. Geological Society of New Zealand newsletter 41,
 21–24.
- Nilsson, A., Muscheler, R., Snowball, I., Aldahan, A., Possnert, G., Augustinus, P., Atkin, D., Stephens, T.,
 2011. Multi-proxy identification of the Laschamp geomagnetic field excursion in Lake Pupuke, New
 Zealand. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 311, 155–164. doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2011.08.050
- Ota, Y., Omura, A., Iwata, H., 1989. ²³⁰ Th- ²³⁸ U age of Rotoehu Ash and its implications for marine terrace
 chronology of eastern Bay of Plenty, New Zealand. New Zealand Journal of Geology and Geophysics
 32, 327–331. doi:10.1080/00288306.1989.10425712
- Pillans, B., Wright, I., 1992. Late Quaternary tephrostratigraphy from the southern Havre Trough Bay of
 Plenty, northeast New Zealand. New Zealand Journal of Geology and Geophysics 35, 129–143.
 doi:10.1080/00288306.1992.9514507
- Pullar, W.A., 1976. Age of Rotoiti Breccia Formation. Geological Society of New Zealand newsletter 41, 22–
 23.
- Pullar, W.A., Heine, J.C., 1971. Ages, inferred from 14C dates, of some tephra and other deposits from
 Rotorua, Taupo, Bay of Plenty and Hawke's Bay districts. Proceedings of Radiocarbon User's
 Conference, Lower Hitt 118–138.
- Pullar, W.A., Nairn, I.A., 1972. Matahi Basaltic Tephra member, Rotoiti Breccia Formation. New Zealand
 Journal of Geology and Geophysics 15, 446–450. doi:10.1080/00288306.1972.10422342
- Renne, P.R., Balco, G., Ludwig, K.R., Mundil, R., Min, K., 2011. Response to the comment by W.H. Schwarz et al. on "Joint determination of 40K decay constants and 40Ar*/40K for the Fish Canyon sanidine standard, and improved accuracy for 40Ar/39Ar geochronology" by P.R. Renne et al. (2010).
 Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 75, 5097–5100. doi:10.1016/j.gca.2011.06.021
- Renne, P.R., Mundil, R., Balco, G., Min, K., Ludwig, K.R., 2010. Joint determination of 40K decay constants
 and 40Ar*/40K for the Fish Canyon sanidine standard, and improved accuracy for 40Ar/39Ar
 geochronology. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 74, 5349–5367. doi:10.1016/j.gca.2010.06.017
- Rivera, T.A., Storey, M., Schmitz, M.D., Crowley, J.L., 2013. Age intercalibration of 40Ar/39Ar sanidine and
 chemically distinct U/Pb zircon populations from the Alder Creek Rhyolite Quaternary
 geochronology standard. Chemical Geology 345, 87–98. doi:10.1016/j.chemgeo.2013.02.021
- Sambridge, M.S., Compston, W., 1994. Mixture modeling of multi-component data sets with application to
 ion-probe zircon ages. Earth and Planetary Science Letters 128, 373–390. doi:10.1016/0012 821X(94)90157-0
- Santos, G.M., Bird, M.I., Fifield, L.K., Alloway, B.V., Chappell, J., Hausladen, P.A., Arneth, A., 2001.
 Radiocarbon dating of wood using different pretreatment procedures; application to the
 chronology of Rotoehu Ash, New Zealand. Radiocarbon 43, 239–248.
- Sarna-Wojcicki, A.M., Pringle, M.S., Wijbrans, J., 2000. New ⁴⁰ Ar/³⁹ Ar age of the Bishop Tuff from multiple
 sites and sediment rate calibration for the Matuyama-Brunhes boundary. Journal of Geophysical
 Research 105, 21431. doi:10.1029/2000JB900901
- Shane, P., 2000. Tephrochronology: a New Zealand case study. Earth-Science Reviews 49, 223–259.
 doi:10.1016/S0012-8252(99)00058-6
- Shane, P., Nairn, I.A., Smith, V.C., 2005. Magma mingling in the ~50 ka Rotoiti eruption from Okataina
 Volcanic Centre: implications for geochemical diversity and chronology of large volume rhyolites.
 Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research 139, 295–313.
 doi:10.1016/j.jvolgeores.2004.08.012
- Shane, P., Sandiford, A., 2003. Paleovegetation of marine isotope stages 4 and 3 in northern new zealand
 and the age of the widespread rotoehu tephra. Quaternary Research 59, 420–429.
 doi:10.1016/S0033-5894(03)00044-9
- Shane, P., Sikes, E.L., Guilderson, T.P., 2006. Tephra beds in deep-sea cores off northern New Zealand:
 implications for the history of Taupo Volcanic Zone, Mayor Island and White Island volcanoes.
 Journal of Volcanology and Geothermal Research 154, 276–290.
 doi:10.1016/j.jvolgeores.2006.03.021
- Shane, P., Storm, S., Schmitt, A.K., Lindsay, J.M., 2012. Timing and conditions of formation of granitoid
 clasts erupted in recent pyroclastic deposits from Tarawera Volcano (New Zealand). Lithos 140–
 141, 1–10. doi:10.1016/j.lithos.2012.01.012

- 632 Sherlock, S.C., Arnaud, N.O., 1999. Flat plateau and impossible isochrons: apparent 40Ar-39Ar
 633 geochronology in a high-pressure terrain. Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta 63, 2835–2838.
 634 doi:10.1016/S0016-7037(99)00116-7
- Smith, V., Shane, P., Nairn, I., 2010. Insights into silicic melt generation using plagioclase, quartz and melt
 inclusions from the caldera-forming Rotoiti eruption, Taupo volcanic zone, New Zealand. Contrib
 Mineral Petrol 160, 951–971. doi:10.1007/s00410-010-0516-0
- 638Thompson, B.N., 1968a. Notes from the New Zealand Geological Survey—5: Age of Rotoiti Breccia. New639Zealand Journal of Geology and Geophysics 11, 1189–1191. doi:10.1080/00288306.1968.10420248
- Thompson, B.N., 1968b. Notes from the New Zealand Geological Survey—5: Age of Rotoiti Breccia. New
 Zealand Journal of Geology and Geophysics 11, 1189–1191. doi:10.1080/00288306.1968.10420248
- Vogel, N., Nomade, S., Negash, A., Renne, P.R., 2006. Forensic 40Ar/39Ar dating: a provenance study of
 Middle Stone Age obsidian artifacts from Ethiopia. Journal of Archaeological Science 33, 1749–
 1765. doi:10.1016/j.jas.2006.03.008
- 645 Vucetich, C.G., Pullar, W.A., 1969. Stratigraphy and chronology of late pleistocene volcanic ash beds in
 646 Central North Island, New Zealand. New Zealand Journal of Geology and Geophysics 12, 784–837.
 647 doi:10.1080/00288306.1969.10431112
- 648 Wendt, I., Carl, C., 1991. The statistical distribution of the mean squared weighted deviation. Chemical 649 Geology: Isotope Geoscience section 86, 275–285. doi:10.1016/0168-9622(91)90010-T
- 650 Whitehead, N., Ditchburn, R., 1994. Revision of some ages for the Rotoehu Ash. New Zealand Journal of 651 Geology and Geophysics 37, 381–383. doi:10.1080/00288306.1994.9514627
- Wilson, C.J.N., Houghton, B.F., Lanphere, M.A., Weaver, S.D., 1992. A new radiometric age estimate for the
 Rotoehu Ash from Mayor Island volcano, New Zealand. New Zealand Journal of Geology and
 Geophysics 35, 371–374. doi:10.1080/00288306.1992.9514530
- Wilson, C.J.N., Houghton, B.F., McWilliams, M.O., Lanphere, M.A., Weaver, S.D., Briggs, R.M., 1995.
 Volcanic and structural evolution of Taupo Volcanic Zone, New Zealand: a review. Journal of
 Volcanology and Geothermal Research 68, 1–28. doi:10.1016/0377-0273(95)00006-G
- Wilson, C.J.N., Rhoades, D.A., Lanphere, M.A., Calvert, A.T., Houghton, B.F., Weaver, S.D., Cole, J.W., 2007.
 A multiple-approach radiometric age estimate for the Rotoiti and Earthquake Flat eruptions, New
 Zealand, with implications for the MIS 4/3 boundary. Quaternary Science Reviews 26, 1861–1870.
 doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2007.04.017
- 662