



THE UNIVERSITY *of* EDINBURGH

Edinburgh Research Explorer

## [Review of] Alexander Broadie (ed.), *Scottish philosophy in the seventeenth century*

**Citation for published version:**

Hood, N 2021, '[Review of] Alexander Broadie (ed.), *Scottish philosophy in the seventeenth century*', *Scottish Church History*, vol. 50, no. 1, pp. 61-63. <https://doi.org/10.3366/sch.2021.0044>

**Digital Object Identifier (DOI):**

[10.3366/sch.2021.0044](https://doi.org/10.3366/sch.2021.0044)

**Link:**

[Link to publication record in Edinburgh Research Explorer](#)

**Document Version:**

Peer reviewed version

**Published In:**

Scottish Church History

**Publisher Rights Statement:**

This article has been accepted for publication by Edinburgh University Press in *Scottish Church History*, and can be accessed at <https://www.eupublishing.com/doi/abs/10.3366/sch.2021.0044>

**General rights**

Copyright for the publications made accessible via the Edinburgh Research Explorer is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

**Take down policy**

The University of Edinburgh has made every reasonable effort to ensure that Edinburgh Research Explorer content complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact [openaccess@ed.ac.uk](mailto:openaccess@ed.ac.uk) providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



**Alexander Broadie (ed.), *Scottish Philosophy in the Seventeenth Century*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2020. 256 pp. £55 hardback. ISBN: 97801987699842.**

*Scottish Philosophy in the Seventeenth Century* makes an outstanding contribution to the understanding of Scottish intellectual and cultural history. While significant research has been undertaken on philosophy in the sixteenth and eighteenth centuries in Scotland, relatively little has been done on seventeenth-century Scottish philosophy. Alexander Broadie's edited volume addresses this lacuna through a series of original chapters, most of which are accessible to a reader who has a cursory knowledge of seventeenth-century Scottish history. The focus of the volume is on philosophy as an intellectual discipline and the book discusses its development in respect to logic, epistemology, ethics, faculty psychology, politics, and jurisprudence throughout the seventeenth century. This is achieved through both overviews of subject-matter and case-studies on the thought of individual thinkers. These chapters include both well-known figures, such as Samuel Rutherford, while also bringing to fore lesser known thinkers who ought to be engaged with, such as Mark Duncan, James Dalrymple, and William Chalmers. While the book's emphasis upon abstract ideas may give the impression that its findings are largely irrelevant to the church historian, nothing could be further from the truth. As the opening chapters by David Allan and Steven Reid explain, the undergraduate degree that every minister, lawyer, and physician (and some noblemen) studied at university was that of philosophy. Thus the teaching of philosophy, a subject of study in the aforementioned chapters and those by Giovanni Gellera, Christian Maurer, and Thomas Ahnert and Martha McGill, shaped both the worldview which was preached from the pulpit on a Sunday morning and the thought-world of significant Scottish political figures, such as Archibald Campbell and James Graham. Simultaneously, the volume demonstrates how the upheavals caused by the Reformation, the Wars of Three Kingdoms, the restoration of the monarchy and the Williamite Revolution had an impact upon the education offered by Scottish universities, leading to changes both in the curriculum and who was allowed to teach it. The exploration of this dynamic interplay between the university, philosophical ideas, and the broader historical context is one of the stand-out features of this volume.

What will particularly pique the interest of the historian of Scottish Christianity is the erudite way nearly every chapter highlights how Reformed theology impacted philosophical method and thought in seventeenth-century Scotland. Allan's opening chapter explains how the new Protestant establishment attempted to reform the older Scottish universities (St Andrews, King's College Aberdeen, and Glasgow) at the same time as new institutions of learning were founded to propagate a more thoroughly reformed education (Edinburgh, Marischal). In the next chapter by Reid, it is explained that Andrew Melville's attempts to integrate a humanist emphasis upon learning ancient languages in the universities of Glasgow and St Andrews was rooted in his belief that ministers should read the Scriptures in their original languages to improve their preaching. Both Gellera and Maurer highlight how the doctrine of the Fall impacted the philosophy of Scottish regents. Metaphysics and natural theology largely disappeared from the curriculum, as the doctrines of the Fall and *sola fide* drove a wedge between the limits of natural reason and theology. However, logic was considered useful insofar as it could purify human reason, enabling a person to purge their thought of sin-induced error and think rightly about the created order. Moreover, while some Scots thought moral philosophy was vitally important, others rejected it as useless because it presupposed a pre-Fall conception of human nature. Laurent Jaffro's marvellously clear chapter brilliantly explains how, for James Dalrymple, the Fall has impacted the practice of law and how the entire legal system is grounded in obedience to the Divine will, expressed through natural law. Similarly, Simon Burton's fantastic discussion of Samuel Rutherford makes accessible the minister's idea that government is a consequence of post-Fall human nature and its legitimacy is grounded in God's action manifested through the people. Thus, the volume shows that most seventeenth-century Scottish philosophy

operated within a Reformed Protestant framework. However, Broadie's excellent decision to include a chapter on the Roman Catholic William Chalmers and a discussion of George Mackenzie's Christian Stoicism by Maurer highlight that there were intellectual alternatives to the dominant paradigm. Though, as Allan's and Ahnert and McGill's chapters remind the reader, deviating too far from doctrinal orthodoxy could have catastrophic consequences, as demonstrated by the execution of Thomas Aikenhead for his blasphemous philosophical beliefs in the 1690s.

Furthermore, a strength of the volume is that it situates seventeenth century Scottish philosophy both historically and internationally. Chapters by Allan, Reid, Maurer, and Ahnert and McGill emphasise that a Christian Aristotelianism, mediated by the medieval scholastic tradition, dominated the Scottish universities up until the 1670s. Broadie's case studies of Robert Baron (arguably the most technical and difficult chapter in the collection), William Dundas, and William Chalmers explore more thoroughly these connections, emphasising the engagement Scots had with the traditions descended from, among others, Thomas Aquinas and Duns Scotus. New ground is broken in Burton's chapter, as it identifies the influence of medieval conciliar ideas upon Samuel Rutherford's political philosophy. While conversant with the past, Scottish philosophy was also engaged with ideas emerging from abroad. Marie-Claude Tucker's study investigates the lives and networks of the sizeable community of Scottish academics working in Protestant academies in France during the first part of the seventeenth century. This work is complemented by Ahnert and McGill's research on the sources by which Scots acquired access to the latest ideas from the continent in the latter part of the century. In conjunction with Maurer's chapter, these studies emphasise the significant engagement Scottish philosophy had with contemporary sources, most prominently the Cartesian thought which dominated the Scottish universities from 1670 onwards. Consequently, the volume shows that seventeenth-century philosophy in Scotland was fully versed in the inherited medieval traditions and contemporary intellectual conversations of its day.

In sum, *Scottish Philosophy in the Seventeenth Century* is a must-read for any student of seventeenth-century Scottish church history. While a few chapters may be difficult for the non-philosopher, in the main the volume provides accessible in-depth discussions of the intellectual world which shaped seventeenth-century Scotland.

*Nathan C. J. Hood, University of Edinburgh*